THE COMPARATIVE STUDY OF SANDHI KAPPA AND NĀMA KAPPA BETWEEN SADDANĪTI AND KACCĀYANA

KEE SIEW LUAN (SAYALAY CĀLĀ THERĪ)
3MBHN (MAL) 1

DEPARTMENT OF PĀḷI
FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND TRANSLATION
INTERNATIONAL THERAVĀDA BUDDHIST MISSIONARY UNIVERSITY
YANGON, MYANMAR
APRIL, 2017
THE COMPARATIVE STUDY OF SANDHI KAPPA AND NĀMA KAPPA BETWEEN SADDANĪTI AND KACCĀYANA

KEE SIEW LUAN (SAYALAY CĀLĀ THERĪ)

3MBHN (MAL) 1

DEPARTMENT OF PĀḷI
FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND TRANSLATION
INTERNATIONAL THERAVĀDA BUDDHIST MISSIONARY UNIVERSITY
YANGON, MYANMAR
APRIL, 2017
Supervisor: ____________________________

Venerable Dr. Nodhiṇāṇa

Dean

Department of Pāḷi

Faculty of Language and Translation

ITBMU

Name of Student: Kee Siew Luan (Sayalay Cāḷā Therī)

Roll No: 3MBHN (Mal)-1

Date of Permission: 1st Mac 2017
Table of Contents

Abstract ......................................................................................................................... i
Acknowledgements ..................................................................................................... ii
Abbreviations ............................................................................................................ iii
Introduction ................................................................................................................ 1

Chapter I Comparison of Saddanīti Suttamālā suttas with Kaccāyana on Sandhi Kappa ........................................................................................................... 6

1.1 Saññāvidhāna ........................................................................................................... 6
   1.1.1 Sutta No. 2 Akkharā ca te ................................................................. 6
   1.1.2 Sutta No. 3 Tatthaṭṭhādo sarā .......................................................... 8
   1.1.3 Sutta No. 4 Rassa ............................................................................. 8
   1.1.4 Sutta No. 5 Dīgha ........................................................................... 9
   1.1.5 Sutta No. 6 Byañjana ...................................................................... 10
   1.1.6 Sutta No. 8 Niggahītam ................................................................. 11
   1.1.7 Garu (Suttas no. 9 to 11) ................................................................ 12
   1.1.8 Sithila, Dhanita, Aphuṭṭha, Phuṭṭha (Suttas no. 14 to 16) ............. 12
   1.1.9 Sutta No. 18 Tatiyacatutthapāṇḍamā yaralavahaṭṭa ghosavanto .... 14
   1.1.10 Sutta no. 23 Ṭhānakaraṇapayatanēhi vaṭṭāṇam-uppatti ................. 14

1.2 Sarasandhi ............................................................................................................ 15
   1.2.1 Sutta No. 30 Sarā lopaṃ papponti sare ......................................... 15
   1.2.2 Sutta No. 36 Pubbasmiṃ dīghaṃ .................................................... 17
   1.2.3 Sutta no. 43 Temepabbatyādinamessa yo vinā yekārena ............. 18
   1.2.4 Sutta no. 44 Ka-kha-ta-tha-da-na-ya-sa-hānaṃ vodudantānaṃ ........ 19
   1.2.5 Sutta no. 50 Ekasmā idhassa dhassa do niccaṃ ............................. 21
   1.2.6 Sutta No. 56 Ya-va-ma-da-na-ta-ra-la-hā vā .................................. 22

1.3 Byañjanasandhi .................................................................................................... 24
   1.3.1 Sutta No. 66 Lopaṃ tatrākāro ......................................................... 24
   1.3.2 Sutta no. 72. Ho dhassa vaṭṭasandhimhi ................................... 25
   1.3.3 Sutta No. 132 Adhissa jhō ............................................................... 25

1.4 Vomissasandhi ..................................................................................................... 26
   1.4.1 Sutta No. 138 Vaggantaṃ vā vagge ............................................. 26
Chapter II Suttas that exist only in the Sandhi Kappa in Saddanīti

1.4.2 Ma-dā sare: Suttamālā suttas no. 142 to 145 ........................................... 27
1.4.3 Sutta no. 149. Lutte byañjano visaññogo ...................................................... 29

2.1 Saññavidhāna ........................................................................................................... 31

2.1.1 Sutta no. 19 Parapadena sambandhitvā vuttaṁ sambandham, sutta no. 20. Padaccchedānā katvā vuttaṁ vavatthitaṁ .......................................................... 31

2.1.2 Sutta no. 21 Karanāni aniggaheṇā vivaṭṭena mukhena vattaṭvā vimuttaṁ .......................................................... 32

2.2 Elision (akkharalopa) ........................................................................................... 32

2.2.1 Sutta no. 69 Saralopo ya-ma-na-rādīṣu vā .................................................. 32

2.3. Long (Dīgham) .................................................................................................... 33

2.3.1 Sutta no. 41 Na-mā-dā-vā-smā-tra-nhā-tvādīnaṁ saralope ayy-anīn-aggh-assu-sāniṁ akāro dīghanī .............................. 33

2.3.2 Sutta no. 42 Sassa kvacantatthānaṁ .............................................................. 35

2.3.3 Sutta no. 155 Samsadade paraloque pubbo dīghanī ................................ 36

2.4. Vowel and Consonantal Change (Ādesa) ........................................................... 37

2.4.1 Sutta No. 55 Ossu ......................................................................................... 37

2.4.2 Sutta no. 71 Animittopi vā dīghādi ................................................................. 38

2.4.3 Sutta no. 90 Pañcavīsasatiyā pañcassa pañño ......................................... 39

2.4.4 Sutta no. 95 Āyussa yassa vo paññattiyaṁ .................................................. 40

2.5. Epenthesis (svarabhakti, insertion) ................................................................. 40

2.5.1 Sutta no. 161 Appakkharānaṁ bahuttamaññathattaṁ .......................... 40

2.6 Contraction (sampasūraṇa) ................................................................................. 41

2.6.1 Sutta no. 162 Bahvakkarānaṁ appattamaññathattaṁ .......................... 41

2.7 Changes Because Metre ......................................................................................... 42

2.7.1 Sutta no. 157 Vaṇṇaniyamo chando garulahuniyamo vutti ..................................... 42

2.7.2 Sutta no. 159 Vuttānurakkhāṇatthaṁ viparītātā ........................................ 43

2.7.3 Sutta no. 160 Sutte sukheccāraṇathamākkharalopec viparītātā ca .... 43

2.7.4 Sutta no. 164 Vuttirakkhane māgame ......................................................... 44

2.7.5 Sutta no. 165 Mādese akāro dīghanī .............................................................. 44

2.8 Conjunct Consonants ......................................................................................... 45

2.8.1 Sutta no. 136 Asaṁñogo saññogo ca .......................................................... 45

2.8.2 Sutta 180 Puggalavācino āsavassa sassa dvittaṁ ........................................ 45
2.9. Savibhatti or Avibhatti ........................................................................................................ 46
  2.9.1 Sutta no. 163 Kvaci sare byañjane vā odantānaṃ nāmānaṃ akārantattaṃ pakati ........................................ 46

Chapter III Study of Irregular Forms in Sandhi Kappa in the Suttamālā ........................................................................................................ 48
  3.1 Eḷamūgo ........................................................................................................................................ 48
  3.2 Kammāsadhamma ....................................................................................................................... 49
  3.3 Kalunā ......................................................................................................................................... 50
  3.4 Kāvanaṇa ..................................................................................................................................... 51
  3.5 Jalābu .......................................................................................................................................... 52
  3.6 Nighanḍu ..................................................................................................................................... 52
  3.7 Paccapekkhaṇā ........................................................................................................................... 54
  3.8 Panidhi ......................................................................................................................................... 54
  3.9 Papā ............................................................................................................................................ 55
  3.10 Pasenadi ..................................................................................................................................... 57

Chapter IV Comparison of Suttamālā suttas with Kaccāyana on the Nāma Kappa .................................................................................................................. 59
  4.1 The definition and the meaning of liṅga ....................................................................................... 59
  4.2 Sutta no. 301. Matantare ge ......................................................................................................... 73
  4.3 Sutta no. 319. Ahamahakaṃ simhi ............................................................................................. 75
  4.4 Information on the words Santa and Sabbhi ............................................................................... 76
  4.5 Suffix ‘To’ (Suttas no. 493, 496) ................................................................................................. 78
  4.6 Sutta no. 448. Sabbāsam ākhyātavijjito pasagganipātādīhi ca yathārahāṃ .... 81
  4.7 Peyyāla method (sutta no. 508) .................................................................................................. 90

Chapter V Suttas that exist only in the Nāmakappa of Suttamālā ..... 94
  5.1 Sutta no. 223. Pituss’ ulopo nāmhi, nāssa cayā vā ................................................................. 94
  5.2 Sutta no. 254. Aggimhi agginīti ginīti ca ................................................................................ 94
  5.3 Sutta no. 255. Satte sattavāti ..................................................................................................... 95
  5.4 Udaka, daka, ka [Sutta no. 256 and 257] ................................................................................ 95
  5.5 Sutta no. 377. Amvacanasso .................................................................................................... 96
  5.6 Sutta no. 389. Āyasmantuto niccaṃ yvā dvīsu ......................................................................... 96
  5.7 Sutta no. 453. Vajjadasyādinamo anyosmiṃsūsu ................................................................. 97
5.8 Sutta no. 454. Puṇṇamāto sinnno āye gāthāyaṃ ......................................................... 98
5.9 Sutta no. 455. Lajjito tabbassa savibhattikassa tāye ..................................................... 98
5.10 Sutta 459. Ko iti samāse nāme ................................................................................. 98
5.11 Sutta no. 491. Amha-tumhānāṃ tomhi mama tava ....................................................... 99
5.13 Sutta no. 496. Itinā niddisitabbe to ........................................................................... 100
5.14 Sutta no. 497. Yatehi paccattavacanassa to nidānādisu .............................................. 101
5.15 Sutta no. 510. Pastassa sattho niccaṃ ......................................................................... 101
5.16 Sutta no. 521. Itthaṅca nāme ....................................................................................... 102
5.17 Sutta no. 522. Kvaci kvassa ko iti .............................................................................. 102
5.18 Sutta no. 523. Sossa su ................................................................................................ 102
5.19 Sutta no. 524. Nossa nu amhatthe .............................................................................. 103
5.20 Sutta no. 532. Candassa candaro ābhāya gāthāyaṃ ..................................................... 103
5.21 Sutta no. 533. Ratanassa ratenā .................................................................................. 104
5.22 Sutta no. 545. Tumhamhākaṃ tamāyoge yassa dvittaṃ .............................................. 104
5.23 Sutta no. 546. Vantussa tulopo no niggahītaṃ mūlādisu .............................................. 105

Chapter VI Study of Irregular Forms in the Nāma Kappa of Suttamālā
....................................................................................................................................................... 106

6.1. Vyaggha ......................................................................................................................... 106
6.2. Daḷhadhammā/Daḷhadhammo .................................................................................... 107
6.3 Krubbati/Krubanti ........................................................................................................ 109

Conclusion ................................................................................................................................. 111

Bibliography .............................................................................................................................. 113
Abstract

This paper is a comparative study of Sandhi Kappa and Nāma Kappa between the Saddanīti and the Kaccāyana. The purpose is to show that the Saddanīti is more comprehensive than the Kaccāyana. In this paper, only chapters of sandhi kappa and nāma kappa of the Kaccāyana and the Saddanīti Suttamālā will be discussed.

The suttas in the Suttamālā and the Kaccāyana are compared and discussed. Next, the suttas that only exist in Suttamālā but not in Kaccāyana are also discussed in detail. Then, some special word formations in Suttamālā are analysed and explained.

The analysis of a sutta or a Pāli word is based on two aspects, i.e., a traditional perspective and a philological aspect. In the traditional perspective, information from traditional grammar books, commentaries, sub-commentaries and other related treatises written in Pāli are presented. Sometimes, further explanations from Myanmar books are translated and presented. Related explanations from modern Pāli grammar books are given as well.

In the philological aspect, comparisons between the Pāli, Prakrit and Sanskrit word forms are carried out. The purpose is to explain word formation and give the suitable meanings. Various dictionaries from Pāli and Sanskrit are consulted.
Acknowledgements

I wish to thank the Dean of the Pāḷi department, Venerable Dr. Nodhi Ṇṇaṇa for suggesting this title and approving this paper. I also thank him for sharing his Pāḷi and knowledge to me ever since I was in the diploma class. Here I record my thanks to my other Pāḷi teacher i.e. Venerable U Paṇḍita who taught me Sanskrit and Prakrit, and also kindly checked this paper and gave suggestions.

I am enormously grateful to Pro-rector, Bhaddanta Dr. Candāvarābhivamṣa, for his constructive suggestions to improve this humble work before the synopsis time. I also thank other teachers including Venerable Dr. Vimala, who kindly offered ideas to improve the work during the synopsis reading time. I also thank my other Pāḷi teachers, Venerable U Theravaṃsa and Venerable U Issariya for their suggestions and ideas.

My sincere thanks go to my dearest Dhamma sister Sayalay Aggavatī for her spiritual support and encouragement during these 6 years I have spent in Myanmar. I am also very grateful to Lori Marsh and Jo Chan for helping to check the English in this paper. Lastly, I give thanks to my family, my classmates and my devotees for supporting me during these years of study.
Abbreviations

A.I  Ekaka, Duka, Tika, Catukka Nipāta Pāḷi
A.II  Pañcaka, Chakka, Sattaka, Aṭṭhaka Nipāta Pāḷi
A-ṭ.I  Duka, Tika, Catukka Nipāta Ṭīkā
A-ṭ.III  Pañcaka-Ekadasaka Nipāta Ṭīkā
Abh-a.I  Atṭhasālini Atṭhakathā
Abh-a.II  Sammohavinodani Atṭhakathā
Abhp-ṭ  Abhidhānappadīpikā-Ṭīkā
Anuṭ.III  Pañcapakarana-anuṭīkā
BHS  Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary
Bv.II  Buddhavaṃsa (Vol. II)
Cp-a  Cariyāpiṭaka-Atṭhakathā (Paramatthadīpanī)
CNd  Cūlaniddesa Pāḷi
D.II  Mahāvagga Pāḷi
D.III  Pāṭhikavagga Pāḷi
D-a.I  Silakkhandhavagga Atṭhakathā (Sumaṅgalavilāsinī)
D-a.II  Mahāvagga Atṭhakathā (Sumaṅgalavilāsinī)
D-t.I  Silakkhandhavagga Old Ṭīkā (Līnatthappakāsanā)
Dhp.  Dhammapada Pāḷi
It  Itivuttaka Pāḷi
J.I-II  Jātaka Pāḷi (Vol. I to II)
Jc  Jīnavatthu
Jvdp  Jīnavamsadīpa
Kcc  Kaccāyana Byākaraṇaṃ
Kcc-En  English Translation of Kaccāyana’s Pāḷi Grammar
Kcc-ṭ  Kaccāyana Bhāsāṭīkā
Khp  Khuddakapāṭha
Khp-a  Khuddakapāṭha Atṭhakathā (Paramatthajotikā I)
Kv  Kathāvatthu Pāḷi
Kv-a  Kathāvatthu Atṭhakathā (Pañcapakarana)
M.I  Mūlapaṇṇāsa Pāḷi
M.II  Majjhimapaṇṇāsa Pāḷi
M.III  Uparipaṇṇāsa Pāḷi
M-a.I  Mūlapaṇṇāsa-Atṭhakathā (Papaṅcasūdanī)
M-a.II  Majjhimapaṇṇāsa Atṭhakathā (Papaṅcasūdanī)
M.t.II  Mūlapaṇṇāsa Ṭīkā (Līnatthappakāsanā)
M.t.III  Majjhimapaṇṇāsa-Uparipaṇṇāsa Ṭīkā (Līnatthappakāsanā)
Miln  Milindapañha Pāḷi
Mgg  Moggallāna Byākaraṇaṃ
gp-ṭ  Moggallāna Pañcikā Ṭīkā
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vtr</th>
<th>Abhidhammāvatāra Ṭīkā</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vv</td>
<td>Vimānavatthu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vv-a</td>
<td>Vimānavatthu Āṭṭhakathā (Paramatthadīpanī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

This paper is a comparative study of Sandhi Kappa and Nāma Kappa between the Saddanīti and the Kaccāyana. Its scope includes the Kaccāyana’s commentary, Rūpasiddhi that elaborates the grammatical rules (sutta) in the Kaccāyana. In this paper, the comprehensive coverage of the Saddanīti is revealed by systematically comparing the differences of the Kaccāyana and the Saddanīti in terms of sutta (grammatical rules) and irregular forms. In fact, the Saddanīti contains three volumes: Padamālā, Dhātumālā and Suttamālā. However, only two chapters from the Suttamālā, the Sandhikappa (the chapter on euphony) and the Nāmakappa (the chapter on nouns) are discussed in this paper.

Many historic Pāḷi scholars praise the Saddanīti as a more comprehensive Pāḷi grammar book than Kaccāyana, Rūpasiddhi or others. The modern Pāḷi scholars, like Venerable U Silananda, also affirmed the Saddanīti as the most comprehensive grammar text: “Even though the Saddanīti is based on the grammar of Kaccāyana, it is far more comprehensive than the Kaccāyana.”¹ Venerable Aggavaṃsa endeavored to clarify some grammatical points so that his readers could have a better comprehension of the Pāḷi and its usage. He also utilizes Sanskrit grammars such as Pāṇinī, etc.² to help Pāḷi students understand Pāḷi and its applications and to appreciate the original teaching of the Lord Buddha. The excellent historical quality of his grammar book was documented as follows:

The news of the erudition of the Burmese monks in the field of grammar is said to have been brought to Ceylon by the mission of Uttarājīva. In order to test the truth of

these rumours, Ceylonese monks went to Arimaddana (in Burma). There they were shown the Saddanīti, and they had to admit that in Ceylon there was no grammatical work that was as good as this. The year 1154 A.D. is given as the date of the Saddanīti.³

Arrangement of the Chapters

There are six chapters in this paper. Chapters one to three focus on Sandhi Kappa (euphony chapter), whereas chapters four to six focus on Nāma Kappa (noun chapter). The first chapter compares the suttas in the sandhi kappa with their corresponding suttas in the Kaccāyana. The second chapter focuses on suttas that exist only in the sandhi kappa, whereas the third chapter is a study of irregular forms in the sandhi kappa. Under the heading ‘Remarks’, any interesting information is shown to provide a different perspective to the analysis of a sutta or Pāḷi word.

The structure in the first chapter is as follows. Firstly, it states a general sutta that is a rule with a general scope of application. Then it shows the similar suttas in the Suttamālā and Kaccāyana, together with their explanations. Next, it highlights related suttas that exist in other grammar books.

The second chapter is a study of suttas that are found only in the Sandhi kappa of the Suttamālā but not in the Kaccāyana and the latter’s commentary- Rūpasiddhi. There are a few interesting suttas such as sutta no. 90 Pañcavīṣatiyā pañcassa pañño, sutta no. 95. Âyussa yassa vo pañṇattiyaṃ, and sutta no. 180 Puggalavācino āsavassa sassa dvittāṃ. This chapter presents some related explanations as recorded in the Suttamālā and other grammar books, and also the philological aspects from Sanskrit and Prakrit.

³Geiger, Pāḷi Literature and Language, 55.
The third chapter is a study of irregular forms such as *papam avindum*, and *kammāsadhamma* as found in the *Suttamālā*. It contains a discussion on the related *Pāli* sentences and includes explanations from the commentaries as a reference. It demonstrates any possible word formations from the philological standpoint. Furthermore, in order to have a better understanding of the word formation, this chapter highlights the difference between *Pāli* words with their equivalence in Sanskrit and Prakrit.

The *Sandhi kappa* in the *Suttamālā*, that which was written by Venerable Aggavaṃsa, has four sections. *Suttas* no. 1 to 29 are categorized as *saññāvidhāna*; *suttas* no. 30 to 63 are categorized as *sarasandhi*; *suttas* no. 64 to 133 are classified as *byañjanasandhi*, and finally, the rest of *suttas*, no. 134 to 191 are included in *vomissasandhi* (mixed euphony). Accordingly, chapter one of this paper is divided into four sections: *saññāvidhāna*, *sarasandhi*, *byañjanasandhi* and *vomissasandhi*. Next, chapter 2 is classified according to the phonological changes such as *dīgha* (become long), elision (*akkharalopa*), change (*ādesa*), epenthesis (*svarabhakti*, insertion), contraction (*sampasāraṇa*), and so on.

The *Nāma kappa* in this paper is divided into three chapters. Chapter 4 shows the comparison of *suttas* of the *Nāma Kappa* between the *Suttamālā* with the *Kaccāyana*. Chapter 5 shows the *suttas* that are found only in *Nāmakappa* of the *Suttamālā*. Chapter 6 explains the irregular forms in *nāma kappa* of the *Suttamālā*. Chapter 6 focuses on the word formations and phonological changes in the *Pāli* words.

**The Traditional Perspective**

The analysis of a *sutta* or a *Pāli* word is based on traditional grammar books such as *Saddanīti*, *Kaccāyana* and *Moggallāna*, and also on commentaries, sub-
commentaries and other related treatises written in Pāḷi. Sometimes, further explanations from Myanmar books such as Sayādaw Ashin Janakābhivamsa’s Bhāsāṭika are shown. The related explanations from recent works such as Ledi Sayādaw’s Niruttī-dīpanī are also quoted.

Related explanations from modern Pāḷi grammar books such as Pāḷi Literature and Language (Wilhelm Geiger), Linguistics in Pāḷi (K. Manohar Gupta), and Syntax of the Cases in the Pāḷi Nikayas (O.H.de Wijesekera) are shown as well.

The Philology Aspect

In this paper, comparisons between the Pāḷi, Prakrit, and Sanskrit word forms are carried out as the philology study. Various dictionaries such as Sanskrit-English Dictionary (Monier William), Sanskrit Hybrid Dictionary, Pāḷi-English Dictionary (Pāḷi Text Society), etc. are consulted.

According to the book Topics in Pāḷi Historical Phonology, Pāḷi is a middle Indian language that is a descendant of one of the Old Indo-Aryan languages. It is very closely related to both Vedic and Sanskrit. In the book Handbook of Pāḷi, O. Frankfurter states, “Sanskrit is not to be regarded as the parent language; but as the dialect that best represents the primitive Āryan speech, to which Sanskrit and Pāḷi stand in the relation of elder and younger sisters.” Thus, the word formation of a Pāḷi word should be compared with its Sanskrit equivalent.

Next, Robert Caesar Childers said in the foreword of his Pāḷi dictionary, “The Pāḷi language is one of the Prakrits, or Aryan vernaculars of ancient India.”

---

4 Indira Yaswant Junghare, Topics in Pāḷi Historical Phonology (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1979), II.
5 O. Frankfurter, Handbook of Pāḷi, (New Delhi, Asian Educational Services, 1999), 3.
According to the book *Introduction to Prakrit*, the Pāli of the Theravāda canon belongs to the old Prākrit stage of the middle Indo-Aryan Period.⁷ Therefore, a comparison between the Pāli and Prakrit word forms should be carried out.

In this paper, the philological viewpoint is carried out by comparing Pāli with Sanskrit and Prakrit. By doing so, the phonological changes in Pāli can be understood easily. For example, dental ‘t’ becomes lingual ‘ṭ’ because of the influence of ‘r’ in the Sanskrit prefix *pra*. \([\text{pranidhi}>\text{panidhi}]\) Thus, by comparing Pāli with the other languages that existed in the same era, Pāli students can have a deeper understanding on the word formations in the Pāli language.

Chapter I

Comparison of Saddanīti Suttamālā suttas with Kaccāyana on Sandhi Kappa

This chapter compares the suttas (grammatical rules) in the Sandhi kappa of Saddanīti Suttamālā sutta with the related suttas in the Sandhi kappa of the book Kaccāyana. Relevant information from other grammar books such as the Rūpasiddhi, the commentary to Kaccāyana, will be shown if necessary. The word formations and philological standpoint will be shown.

Since there are four sections of sandhi in Saddanīti Suttamālā, this chapter is also divided accordingly, into these four sections: 1.) Saññāvidhāna, 2.) Sarasandhi, 3.) Byañjanasandhi, and 4.) Vomissasandhi (mixed euphony).

1.1 Saññāvidhāna

The information on saññavidhāna (the chapter that explains technical terms of Pāḷi grammar) such as rassa, dīgha, byañjana and niggahīta is shown below.8

1.1.1 Sutta No. 2 Akkharā ca te

There is a general sutta that defines the akkhara and its meaning. Sutta No. 2 akkharā ca te in Saddanīti Suttamālā explains that 41 letters starting from the letter ‘a’ are designated as akkhara, which has two definitions: 1.) non-decreasing or

---

8 Sharma, Rama Nath, “The Introduction to Asṭādhyāyī, as a Grammatical Device” in The Asṭādhyāyī of Pāṇini, Vol. I (New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal, 2000), 102. A rule which assigns a name to a linguistic element or its meaning is termed as saṃjñā (saññā).
diminishing (na khaya=akkhaya) and 2.) non-rough (na khara=akkhara). These definitions are explained as such:

In the five ñeyyapatha called samkhāra, vikāra, lakkhaṇa, nibbāna and paññatti, although these letters can change, they never go to waste, that is, they never decrease and they appear one after another. A change in the saṅketa concept (idea) is very subtle (with attagambhīra and paṭivedagambhīra) and very deep (with Dhammagambhīra and Desanagambhīra). By the meaning, they do not reach the hardness, but remains very soft and not hard. Thus, they are called akkhara (non-decreasing, non-rough). The name akkhara is applied to clarify the gathering of letters, to know the preceding and later words, and also for the accomplishment of work.

This sutta can be compared to the two suttas Attho akkharasaññā and akkharāpādayo ekacattālīsam in the Kaccāyana. The first sutta implies the meaning should be known through letters, whereas the second sutta defines that the letters are forty-one beginning with the vowel ‘a’. By comparing the suttas in the Suttamālā and Kaccāyana, it is found that sutta No. 2 akkharā ca te in Saddanīti Suttamālā gives definitions and meanings of akkharā that are not found in these two suttas in the Kaccāyana.

---

9 Sstt, 604-605.
10 Sstt-sya. 9.
11 Kcc, 40. (§1.1)
12 Kcc, 40. (§1.2)
13 Kcc-En, 1.
1.1.2 Sutta No. 3 Tatthaṭṭhādo sarā.

There is a general *sutta* that gives the definition of a vowel. Sutta no. 3, *Tatthaṭṭhādo sarā* in *Saddanīti Suttamālā*\(^\text{14}\) states that the 8 letters starting from letter ‘*a*’ are known as *sara* (vowels). Then, it gives the definition of *sara*:

1) Cause (reason) being heard, thus it is called *sara*. 2.) Making the consonants that are mixed with oneself arrive, thus it is called *sara*. However, according to *Pāḷi* grammarians, a vowel does not depend on any consonant but shines by itself, therefore it is termed as ‘*sara*’.

This *sutta* can be compared to *sutta* *Tatth’odantā sarā aṭṭhā* in the *Kaccāyana*\(^\text{15}\) that states that the 8 vowels beginning with ‘*a*’ and ending with ‘*o*’ are called *sara*. However, unlike *Suttamālā*, this *sutta* does not give a definition of *sara*. Hence, the *Suttamālā* presents more data than the *Kaccāyana*.

1.1.3 Sutta No. 4 Rassa

There is a general *sutta* that states that a short vowel is termed *rassa*. Sutta no. 4, *Ekamattā āditatiyapañcamā rassā*\(^\text{16}\) in *Saddanīti Suttamāla* gives some information on timing for *rassa*.

Among the 8 vowels, the vowels that are first, third and fifth and also have one *matta* (time-measurement) are called *rassa* (short). These are the letters ‘*a*’, ‘*i*’ and ‘*u*’. The word *matta* denotes a short time that is equivalent to the blink of an eye. The duration that a healthy person requires to close and open his eyes is that of a short vowel. Because it is said in a short time, it is called *rassa*.

---

\(^{14}\) Sstt, 605.  
\(^{15}\) Kcc, 41. (§1.3 *Tatth’odantā sarā aṭṭhā*)  
\(^{16}\) Sstt, 605. (§4. *Ekamattā āditatiyapañcamā rassā*)
This sutta can be compared to sutta Lāhumattā tayo rassā\textsuperscript{17} in the Kaccāyana. It illustrates that the three light-measured vowels are called rassā but does not specify the length of time for the rassā\textsuperscript{18}. This fact shows the Suttamālā gives more information on rassā.

1.1.4 Sutta No. 5 Dīgha

There is a general sutta that illustrates the term ‘dīgha,’ which is generally translated as long. Sutta no. 5 Aññe dvimattā dīghā in the Suttamālā\textsuperscript{19} states that vowels other than the short vowels, which have two mattas, are designated as dīgha. They are ‘ā’, ‘ī’, ‘ē’ and ‘ō’.

This Suttamālā sutta can be compared with sutta Aññe dīghā\textsuperscript{20} in the Kaccāyana. Kaccāyana states that the other vowels are generally defined as dīgha, but it does not elaborate on the length of time required for dīgha. As such, more information on the length of time is given in the Suttamālā.

Remarks:

*Matta* is the duration of voice or a time measurement. *Matta* is also called syllable instant by Perniola.\textsuperscript{21} One *matta* is the duration of a snap of the fingers or the blink of an eye. Generally, short vowels are recited for one *matta* and long vowels are recited for two *mattas*. Therefore, except for the short vowels ‘a’, ‘i’ and ‘u’, the timing for other five vowels ‘ā’, ‘ī’, ‘ū’, ‘e’, ‘o’ are of two *mattas* (dvimatta).

However, long vowels are not always recited as long. When followed by conjunct consonants, the long vowels ‘e’ and ‘o’ are recited as short, just like *səyyo* is

\textsuperscript{17} Kcc, 41. (§1.4 Lāhumattā tayo rassā)
\textsuperscript{18} Even though the duration of rassā is not mentioned in Kaccāyana, but is stated in Rūpasiddhi, the commentary to Kaccāyana, that rassā is of ekamatta.
\textsuperscript{19} Sstt, 605. (§5. Aññe dvimattā dīghā)
\textsuperscript{20} Kcc, 41. (§ 1.5. Aññe dīghā)
recited as ‘siyyo’ and ฤท is recited as ‘ufttho’. A consonant together with a short vowel is recited for the duration of one matta. A consonant together with a long vowel is recited for the duration of two mattas.\(^{22}\)

The time measurements for vowels in Sanskrit are ardhahrasva, hrasva, dīrgha and plata. For example, a short ‘u’, long ‘ū’ and the prolated ‘u’ are respectively called hrasva (short), dīrgha (long) and plata (prolated). Here, a short vowel is held for one matra (measure), a long vowel is recited for two measures, and plata requires three measures.\(^{23}\) In the Pāṇinī book, it is said “the first portion of svarita is udatta (high tone, acutely accented), and held for one half a measure. Here svarita (circumflexed accent) is pronounced using the combined raising ‘udatta’ and falling ‘anudatta’ of the voice. That means the phrase ardhahrasva is used to indicate the half measure of a hrasva (short length).”\(^{24}\)

1.1.5 Sutta No. 6 Byañjana

There is a general sutta illustrating the term Byañjana, which is translated as a consonant. Sutta no. 6 Sesā aḍḍhamattā byañjanā in the Suttamālā\(^{25}\) explains that excluding the 8 vowels previously described, the remaining letters from ‘k’ to niggahīta are called byañjana (consonants), and they are of aḍḍhamattā. Here, aḍḍhamatta means a half of the time measure of a short vowel.

This sutta in the Suttamālā can be compared with sutta Sesā byañjanā\(^{26}\) in the Kaccāyana that describes, excluding the 8 vowels, the remaining letters from ‘k’ to

\(^{22}\) Mahāthera Indācārama, Padabyañjananiruttinīti (Yangon: Kumārārāma-taik, 2000), 21-22.

\(^{23}\) Pāṇinī, Aṣṭādhyāyī of Pāṇinī, trans. Śrīśa Chandra Vasu (India: Indian Press, 1891), 84. (§27)

\(^{24}\) Ibid, 85-87. (§29-31)

\(^{25}\) Sstt, 605. (§6. Sesā aḍḍhamattā byañjanā)

\(^{26}\) Kcc, 41. (§ 1.6.Sesā byañjanā)
niggahīta, which are called byañjana. Suttamālā mentions that byañjana has aḍḍhamatta as a time measure, but Kaccāyana does not mention this fact.\textsuperscript{27}

1.1.6 Sutta No. 8 Niggahītaṃ

There is a general \textit{sutta} that gives a definition of the term niggahīta. Suttamālā sutta no. 8 \textit{Aṃ, im, um iti yam sarato param suyyati, taṃ niggahītaṃ}\textsuperscript{28} explains that whatever is heard after the vowels ‘\(a\)’, ‘\(i\)’ and ‘\(u\)’ is called niggahīta. That means niggahīta (‘\(m\)’) comes after 3 vowels (‘\(a\)’, ‘\(i\)’, ‘\(u\)’). For example, in the Pāḷi words \textit{aham, kevaṭṭagāmasmīn, ahum kevaṭṭadārako}, after three short vowels that are ‘\(a\)’ in \textit{aham}, ‘\(i\)’ in \textit{smīn} and ‘\(u\)’ in \textit{ahum}, the bindu (dot) is called niggahīta. Then this \textit{sutta} gives a definition of niggahīta: “It is recited depending on the short vowel, thus it is called niggahīta.”

This \textit{sutta} can be compared to \textit{sutta} \textit{Aṃ iti niggahitam}\textsuperscript{29} in the \textit{Kaccāyana}, which states that ‘\(m\)’ is called niggahīta, and only mentions the one example ‘\(aṃ\)’. The \textit{Kaccāyana} just mentions that niggahīta comes after the vowel ‘\(a\)’, whereas Suttamālā clearly says niggahīta comes after three short vowels ‘\(a\)’, ‘\(i\)’ and ‘\(u\)’ and it also provides a definition of niggahīta.

\textbf{Remarks}: The sign of nasalization (\(m\)) corresponding to the anusvāra and anunāsika of Sanskrit is called Niggahīta by Pāḷi grammarian\textsuperscript{30}. According to rule 8 in \textit{Pāṇinī}, that which is pronounced using the nose along with the mouth is called

\textsuperscript{27} Even though the duration of byañjana is not mentioned in Kaccāyana, but is stated in \textit{Rūpasiddhi}, the commentary to Kaccāyana, that byañjana is dvimatta.
\textsuperscript{28} Sstt, 606. (§ 8. \textit{Aṃ, im, um iti yam sarato param suyyati, taṃ niggahītāṃ})
\textsuperscript{29} Kcc, 42. (§ 1.8 \textit{Aṃ iti niggahītāṃ})
\textsuperscript{30} Geiger, \textit{Pāḷi Literature and Language}, 61.
anunāsika or nasal. It means the breath passes through the nose and the mouth. The pure nasal is called \textit{anusvāra}.\textsuperscript{31}

\textbf{1.1.7 Garu (Suttas no. 9 to 11)}

The following three \textit{suttas} in the \textit{Suttamālā} explain the term \textit{garu}. First, \textit{sutta no. 9 Dīgha}\textsuperscript{32} defines that the \textit{dīgha} letters ‘ā’, ‘ī’, ‘ū’, ‘e’ and ‘o’ are called \textit{garu} (heavy), for instance, the long vowels in ā, ī, ū, hū, dhū, mā. Second, \textit{sutta no. 10 Saṃyogaparo ca} explains short vowels ‘a’, ‘i’ and ‘u’ that are followed by double consonants (or conjunct consonants) are also termed \textit{garu}, for instance, the vowel ‘a’ in the words vatvā, yassa. Third, \textit{sutta no. 11 Assarabyañjanato pubbaraso ca} states that the short vowels ‘a’, ‘i’ and ‘u’ that are followed by \textit{nigghāṭa}, which is a consonant that has no vowel, are also designated \textit{garu}, for example, the vowels ‘a, and i’ in the words sukham and isiṣṭ respectively.

Even though the term \textit{garu} is not stated in the \textit{Kaccāyana}, it is elaborated in \textit{Rūpasiddhi}, the commentary to \textit{Kaccāyana}. The \textit{Sutta Dumhi garu} in \textit{Rūpasiddhi}\textsuperscript{33} explains that the short vowels ‘a’, ‘i’ and ‘u’ before conjunct consonants are called \textit{garu}, like in the cases ‘a’, ‘i’, and ‘u’ in daṭvā, hiṭvā, and bhūṭvā. Next, \textit{sutta Dīgho ca} in \textit{Rūpasiddhi}\textsuperscript{34} defines the long vowels ‘ā’, ‘ī’, ‘ū’, ‘e’ and ‘o’ as \textit{garu}. As a conclusion, for the definition of the term \textit{garu}, \textit{Rūpasiddhi} gives two rules but \textit{Suttamālā} gives three rules. Therefore, the \textit{Suttamālā} provides a better explanation.

\textbf{1.1.8 Sithila, Dhanita, Aphuṭṭha, Phuṭṭha (Suttas no. 14 to 16)}

The following \textit{suttas} point out those letters that are to be known as \textit{sithila}, dhanita, \textit{aphuṭṭha} (non-touched) and \textit{phuṭṭha} (touched). \textit{Sithila} and dhanita are

\textsuperscript{31} Pāṇini, \textit{The Aṣṭādhyāyī of Pāṇini}, trans.Śrīśa Chandra Vasu, 10.
\textsuperscript{32} Sstt, 607. (§9 \textit{dīgha})
\textsuperscript{33} Pdr, 5. (§ 1.6. \textit{Dumhi garu})
\textsuperscript{34} Pdr, 5. (§ 1.7. \textit{Dīgho ca})
translated as “unaspirated and aspirated”\textsuperscript{35} respectively, or “non-aspirated stop and aspirated stop”.\textsuperscript{36} Sutta no. 14 \textit{Vaggesu paṭhamatatiyam sithilam} in the \textit{Suttamālā} denotes the first letter and third letter in groups as \textit{sithila} while \textit{sutta} no. 15. \textit{Dutiyacatuttham dhanitam} denotes the second and fourth letter in groups as \textit{dhanita}. Here, \textit{sithila} signifies the alphabet contacts with the place of articulation softly, whereas \textit{dhanita} means the alphabet contacts with the place of articulation in a hard manner.

In \textit{sutta} no. 16 \textit{Sithilam aphuṭṭham, dhanitam phuṭṭham} in the \textit{Suttamālā}, the author compares the ideas of Sanskrit grammarians and Pāli grammarians.\textsuperscript{37}

Sanskrit grammarians define the letters in \textit{vagga} as \textit{phuṭṭha} (touched), whereas \textit{avagga} letters ‘\textit{y}’, ‘\textit{l}’ and ‘\textit{v}’ are īsaka-\textit{phuṭṭha} (touched little). However, the Pāli grammarians indicate that the \textit{vagga}’s (groups) are \textit{phuṭṭha} (touched) and \textit{aphuṭṭha} (non-touched). The Pāli Grammarians believe that as the letters in \textit{vagga} (group) touch the articulation place softly, they should be defined as \textit{aphuṭṭha}. As such, there is non-conflict of their views.

This \textit{Suttamālā} \textit{suttas} can be compared with the two \textit{suttas} in \textit{Rūpasiddhi}. Sutta \textit{Parasamaṇṇā payoge} in \textit{Rūpasiddhi} \textsuperscript{38} explains that the second and fourth letters in \textit{vagga} should be defined as \textit{dhanita} while others as \textit{sithila}. Sutta \textit{Attho akkharasaṇṇāto} \textsuperscript{39} in \textit{Rūpasiddhi} states \textit{vagga} (letters in a group) are \textit{phuṭṭha} ‘touched’, and while ‘\textit{y}’, ‘\textit{r}’, ‘\textit{l}’ and ‘\textit{v}’ are īsanti \textit{phuṭṭha} (touched little).

\textsuperscript{37} Sstt, 607-608.
\textsuperscript{38} Pdr, 6. (§ 1.11, Parasamaṇṇā payoge)
\textsuperscript{39} Pdr, 3. (§ 1.1Attho akkharasaṇṇāto)
In conclusion, the *Rūpasiddhi* defines the letters in *vagga* as *phuṭṭha* but the *Suttamālā* defines them as *phuṭṭha* and *aphuṭṭha*. The *Suttamālā* also clarifies that *sīthila* means *aphuṭṭha*, whereas *dhanita* means *phuṭṭha*.

### 1.1.9 Sutta No. 18 Tatiyacatutthapañcamā yaralavahaḷā ghosavanto

There is a general *sutta* that explains that consonants are to be called *ghosa*. *Suttamālā* sutta no 18 Tatiyacatutthapañcamā yaralavahaḷā ghosavanto explains the third, fourth and fifth letters of *vagga* (group), and *avagga* (non-group) ‘y’, ‘r’, ‘l’, ‘v’, ‘h’ and ‘ḷ’ are called *ghosa*. Then it gives more information as follows: “The Sanskrit grammarians want *anusvara* (*niggahīta*), to be *ghosa*, but the *Pāḷi* grammarians want this to be freed from *ghosa* and *aghosa*.”

This *sutta* can be compared to *sutta* Parasamaññā payoge in the *Kaccāyana*. It explains the third, fourth and fifth letters of *vagga*, and *avagga*-‘y’, ‘r’, ‘l’, ‘v’, ‘h’ and ‘ḷ’ are called *ghosa*. Then, it explains the designation of *ghosa* and *aghosa* used in Sanskrit grammar books should be applied accordingly. The third, fourth and fifth letters of *vaggas* are *ghosa*, whereas the first and second letters are *aghosa*.

In explaining *niggahīta*, *Suttamālā* focuses on pure *Pāḷi* grammar, whereas *Kaccāyana* concentrates on Sanskrit standpoint.

### 1.1.10 Sutta no. 23 Ṭhānakaraṇapayatanehi vaṃśānam-uppatti

There are generally 5 places of articulation. They are *kanṭhajā* (guttural), *tālujā* (palatal), *muddhajā* (lingual, cerebral), *dantajā* (dental) and *oṭṭhajā* (labial). *Sutta* no. 23 Ṭhānakaraṇapayatanehi vaṃśānam-uppatti in the *Suttamālā* illustrates that there are actually 7 places of articulation that include these five places as well as

---

40 Sstt, 608.
41 Kcc, 82. (§1. 9. Parasamaññā payoge)
nasika and urasija. The sixth, nasika (nasal) is the place of articulation for niggahīta and also the five vagganta letters ‘ṅ’, ‘ṅ’, ‘ṇ’, ‘n’ and ‘m’.

The seventh, urasija (born in the chest) is the place of articulation for ‘h’ that associates with 4 vagganta letters (except guttural ‘ṅ’) and 5 avagga letters ‘y’, ‘r’, ‘l’, ‘v’ and ‘ḥ’. The examples provided in this sutta are taṃhil, tanhā, nhāsūṃha, mūyhatē, and vullhatē. The ‘h’ letter associated with five letters -‘y’, ‘r’, ‘l’, ‘v’ and ‘ḥ’ arises in the chest, but the letter ‘h’ alone is connected to kanthajā (guttural).

The Kaccāyana does not give more elaboration on these 5 places of articulation. Its commentary, the Rūpasiddhi, points out these 7 places in sutta Attho akkharasaṅnāto, but more information regarding urasija is given in the Saddanīti, as stated above.

According to the Pāḷi Literature and Language, this urasija is also called orasa (spoken in the breast). In combination with ‘y’, ‘r’, ‘l’, ‘v’ or with the nasals, it appears to have been pronounced in a particular manner.

1.2 Sarasandhi

Now, only those suttas in the section of sarasandhi of the Suttamālā will be compared with the Kaccāyana and other grammar books.

1.2.1 Sutta No. 30 Sarā lopaṇḥ papponti sare

The first sutta in sarasandhi ‘euphony of vowel’ is this general sutta that states one preceding vowel is elided when followed by a vowel. Sutta no 30 sarā lopaṇḥ papponti sare in Saddanīti Suttamālā states many preceding vowels can be

42 Sst, 608. (§ 23.ṭhānakarāṇapayatanehi vannānam-uppatti)
43 Sst, 609.
According to the footnote in Suttamālā book, nhasūṃha comes from nāsa and asumha.
44 It, 25. J-a.III, 47. (muyhatē)
45 Pdr, 3. (§ 1.1Attho akkharasaṅnāto)
46 Geiger, Pāḷi Literature and Language, 61.
elided due to a following vowel. Here, the word “sarā” in sutta “sarā lopam papponti sare” does not mean just a single vowel, but many vowels that can be elided because of the following single vowel ‘sare’. This sarā lopam papponti sare rule gives more information for this general sutta as follows.

There are 64 (8²) ways for one vowel elision as there are a total of 8 vowels in Pāli. The first is one elision of a preceding vowel, such as Yassa+āsavā>Yassāsavā (canker of his). The next way is, due to a following vowel, the preceding two vowels are elided, such as √yā+a+anti>(nānādisam) yanti (go in different directions), √bhā+a+anti>bhani (they shine) and √hā+a+eyya>heyya (will be). The last way is the elision of the preceding three vowels, for example, upa+pi+a+eyyași>upeyyași (You should approach). In total, there are 66 ways (64+1+1) for elision of preceding vowels.

This sutta can be compared to sutta Sarā sare lopam in the Kaccāyana that mentions only one preceding vowel is elided due to a following vowel. By this sutta, only one vowel in the preceding place is elided. An example is yassa+indriyaṃ>yassindriyaṃ.

Next, a sutta called Sarā sare lopam in Rūpasiddhi is the same principle with Saddanī Puttamālā, mentioning all preceding vowels can be elided due to following one vowel. Here, this sutta interprets the word sarā to mean many vowels and it means the preceding vowels. In addition, Rūpasiddhi explains that four vowels can be elided at the same time. The example given is sakhatō gasse vā. Here, gasse means gassa+e, and ‘e’ actually means the five vowels ‘a’, ‘ā’, ‘i’, ‘ī’ and ‘e’.

47 Sstt, 611, (§ 30. Sarā lopam papponti sare)
49 Kcc, 44. (§ 1.21. Sarā sare lopam)
50 Pdr, 7. (§ 1.13. Sarā sare lopam)
Because of following last vowel ‘e’, the preceding four vowels are elided.\textsuperscript{51}

**Remarks:** The exception\textsuperscript{52} to this * sutta-*“preceding vowel is elided due to the following vowel” is *vaṇṇakālabyavadhāna* that denotes covering the letter and time. An example of covering letter is *sakīṃ eva*. Due to *niggahīta* letter in between ‘i’ and ‘e’, there is no *sandhi* for them. There is no covering of time in the poem at the place of the metre. An example is “Sabbe saṅkhāra aniccā(ī), yadā paññāya *passati*. *Atha nibbindati dukkhe, eso maggo visuddhiyā.*\textsuperscript{53} When reciting, a pause is required at the end of the second *pada* (line) and the beginning of the third *pada* (line). So, the euphony *passati+atha>* *passityatha* is not possible.

1.2.2 *Sutta No. 36 Pubbasmiṃ dīghaṃ*

There is a general *sutta* that illustrates that the following vowel becomes long when the preceding vowel is elided. *Sutta no. 36 Pubbasmiṃ dīghaṃ* in the *Suttamālā*\textsuperscript{54} explains that the following vowel is lengthened when the preceding vowel is elided; and the short vowels ‘a’, ‘i’, and ‘u’ are changed to their corresponding long vowels ‘ā’, ‘ī’, and ‘ū’ because *ṭhānāsanna*, the place of long vowel, is closed to each other. For example, the vowel ‘a’ is lengthened in this example *Buddha+anussati>* *buddhānussati*.

This *sutta* can be compared to *sutta Dīghaṃ* in the *Kaccāyana*\textsuperscript{55} that generally explains that the following vowel sometimes becomes long when the preceding vowel is elided. *Sutta no. 17 dīghaṃ* in *Rūpāsiddhi* also clarifies when the preceding vowel is elided, the short vowel becomes *savaṇṇadīgha* ‘similar long vowel’ by means of *ṭhānāsanna*. In *Pāṇini*’s English translation book, *savaṇṇa* is also called a

\textsuperscript{51} Pdr, 64. (§132. *Sakñato gasse vā*)
\textsuperscript{52} Pdr-t. 45.
\textsuperscript{53} Dhp, 53. (Verse no. 277)
\textsuperscript{54} Sstt, 614. (§36 *Pubbasmim dīghaṃ*)
\textsuperscript{55} Kcc, 45. (§ 1,15 *Dīghaṃ*)
homogeneous vowel.\textsuperscript{56} It is said to be sounds that have the same manner of articulation at the same place in the mouth.\textsuperscript{57}

\textbf{1.2.3 Sutta no. 43 Temepabbatādinamessa yo vinā yekārena}

There is a general \textit{sutta} that explains that the ending vowel ‘e’ sometimes becomes the consonant–‘y’ when followed by a vowel. However, \textit{sutta} no. 43 \textit{temepabbatādinamessa yo vinā yekārena} in \textit{Saddanī Suttamālā}\textsuperscript{58} points out that except for the word \textit{ye}, the letter ‘e’ of the words \textit{te}, \textit{me}, \textit{pabbate} and others is changed to ‘y’ because of the following vowel. This \textit{yo vinā (“except the word \textit{ye”)} shows the limited application of this general \textit{sutta}. However, \textit{sutta Yamedantassādeso} in the \textit{Kaccāyana}\textsuperscript{59} only generally mentions that the ending vowel ‘e’ sometimes becomes ‘y’ when followed by a vowel.

Many examples appear in this \textit{sutta} of the \textit{Suttamālā}, for example, \textit{te+aham} becomes \textit{tyāhaṃ (evam vadeyyam)}\textsuperscript{60} “I should say such to you”; \textit{me+ayaṃ} becomes \textit{myāyam} as in “\textit{adhigato kho myāyam dhammo}”\textsuperscript{61} (“This Dhamma is attained by me.”)

Due to the limitation set in this \textit{sutta}, that is, “except the word \textit{ye}”, ‘\textit{ye}’ is not changed to ‘yy’. As such, \textit{ye+assa} does not change to \textit{yyassa}.

Venerable Aggavaṃsa fixed this limitation because he was of the opinion: “Just like there is no difference in reciting \textit{uyyāna} and \textit{uyāna}, so also \textit{yyassa} and \textit{yassa} are recited in the same manner, and therefore \textit{yyassa} can be written as \textit{yassa}.”

He also took into account that there were some instances in \textit{Tipiṭaka} that show a single ‘y’ instead of double ‘yy’ for the word ‘\textit{ye}’, such as “\textit{yassa te honti}

\textsuperscript{57} Ibid., 14.
\textsuperscript{58} Sstt, 615. (§ 43. \textit{Temepabbatādinamessa yo vinā yekārena})
\textsuperscript{59} Kcc, 46. (§ 1.17. \textit{Yamedantassādeso})
\textsuperscript{60} M.I, 17.
\textsuperscript{61} V.III, 8.
anatthakāma” ⁶² and “yassu maññāmi samaṇe”. ⁶³ Although here yassa means ye+assa while yassu means ye+assu.

The Nirutti-dīpanī presents another standpoint by putting forward this sutta Eonāṃ in Nirutti-dīpanī. ⁶⁴ It states the vowels ‘e’ and ‘o’ sometimes become the consonants ‘y, v’. This sutta is similar to the general sutta but it provides further information: “Even though there is no difference in reciting yyassa and yassa, it is suitable to write in the text as yyāssa for the readers to easily know the division of word of yyassa is actually comes from ye+assa.” If yassa is written without double ‘y’, one might confuse it with yassa [ya+assa] that is a pronoun with dative or genitive.

In conclusion, Venerable Aggavaṃsa believed, since there is no difference between yyassa and yassa because they are of similar recitation, so there is no need to change ‘ye’ to ‘yy’. However, according to Nirutti-dīpanī, for the purpose of showing the word division of yyassa as “ye+assa”, yyassa ‘with double ‘y’’ should be written.

Remarks: This anta in yamedanta in sutta Yamedantassādeso of Kaccāyana means an ending vowel, not ‘a part’. Some people think this anta refers to a part inside a word like pavatthento or part of a base like damęnto (√dam+e+anta) ⁶⁵. Actually, this anta refers to the ending vowel of a word. So if padanta is used instead of anta, then the meaning is clearer. Therefore, yamedanta refers to an ending vowel of te, me, etc.

1.2.4 Sutta no. 44 ka-kha-ta-tha-da-na-ya-sa-hānaṃ vodudantānaṃ

There is a general sutta that states the ending vowels ‘o’ and ‘u’ sometimes become ‘v’ when followed by a vowel. The Suttamālā gives more specific

⁶² Psm, 38. (Yassa te honti...anatthakāma)
⁶³ D.II, 23.
⁶⁴ Nrt-d, 23. (§ 1.38. Eonāṃ)
⁶⁵ Pdr-t, 68.
information regarding this *sutta* by stating these ‘o’ and ‘u’ should belong to some specific words. *Sutta* no. 44 *Ka-kha-tha-da-na-ya-sa-hānaṃ vodudantānaṃ* in the *Suttamālā* explains that if the vowels ‘o’ and ‘u’ are part of words in preceding positions that have consonants ‘k’, ‘kh’, ‘t’, ‘th’, ‘d’, ‘n’, ‘y’, ‘s’, or ‘h’, then the vowels ‘o’ and ‘u’ are changed to ‘v’ when followed by a vowel. Here, 9 possible consonants are specifically mentioned in the *Suttamālā*. The examples shown in this *sutta* are *yāvatako+assa* > *Yāvatakvassa kāyo*66, *kho+idha* > *(agamā nu) khvidha*67 and *ye+ayam* > *yvāya svāssa hoti*.68

This *sutta* can be compared with *sutta* no. *Vamodudantānaṃ in the Kaccāyana*69 that generally indicates that the ‘o’ and ‘u’ can change to ‘v’ when followed by a vowel. In its commentary *Rūpasiddhi, sutta vamodudantānaṃ*70 clarifies that when the vowels ‘o’ and ‘u’ are part of words that have the consonants ‘k’, ‘kh’, ‘y’, or ‘t’ in the preceding position, then these vowels sometimes change to ‘v’ when followed by a vowel. Here, only four consonants are shown. Thus, *sutta* in the *Suttamālā* gives nine consonants ‘k’, ‘kh’, ‘t’, ‘th’, ‘d’, ‘n’, ‘y’, ‘s’ and ‘h’, whereas the *Rūpasiddhi* gives only the four consonants ‘k’, ‘kh’, ‘y’ and ‘t’.

There is another *sutta* that goes against the application of this general *sutta*. *Sutta* no. 45 *Na parepi sare hetudhātādīnamussa pāvacane ca*71 states, in the Buddha’s word (*5 nikāyas*) and ancient commentaries, the ‘u’ letter of the words *hetu, dhātu,* etc. does not become its semi-vowel ‘v’, even if followed by a vowel, such as *hetuttho*72, *dhātuttho*73, *kattuattho*74.

---

68 A.I, 11.
69 Kcc, 45. (§ 1.16, Vamodudantānaṃ)
70 Pdr, 14. (§ 1.20 Vamodudantānaṃ)
71 Sstt, 616. (§ 45 Na parepi sare hetudhātādīnamussa pāvacane ca)
72 M-ṭ.II, 26.
Thus, the above points prove that the general *sutta* mentioned earlier on does not apply to all cases. From the philological point of view, in order to avoid hiatus, the vowels ‘*u*’ and ‘*o*’ can be transformed into their semi-vowel ‘*v*’ when followed by another vowel. Hiatus means a break between two vowels coming together but not in the same syllable.

1.2.5 *Sutta no. 50 Ekasmā idhassa dhassa do niccaṃ*

There is a general *sutta* that explains that after a vowel, ‘*dh*’ becomes ‘*d*’. *Sutta no. 50 Ekasmā idhassa dhassa do niccaṃ* in the *Suttamālā* explains that after the ‘*eka*’ word, the letter ‘*dh*’ of ‘*idha*’ always becomes ‘*d*’ when followed by a vowel. *Eka* can be optional here. The example shown is “Ekamidāhaṃ bhikkhave samayaṃ”.

*Sutta Do dhassa ca* in *Rūpasiddhi* explains after *eka* word, ‘*dh*’ of *idha* becomes ‘*d*’ and the following letter is lengthened. [Ekam+idhā+aham>ekamidāhaṃ] By the word ‘*ca*’, ‘*dh*’ of *sadhu* can become ‘*d*’. [sādhu>sāhu dassanam’ariyānaṃ.]

The *Suttamālā* further explains as follows. The word *ekamidāhaṃ* in the *Pāḷi* string “ekam’idāhaṃ bhikkhave bhuttāvi assaṃ” is composed of ekam+idha+aham. [ekam+idha+aham>ekam+ida+aham] Here, ‘*ida*’ in *ekamidāhaṃ* is a nipāta (indeclinable particle) and *ekamidāhaṃ* actually means “ekam aham.” In fact, the purpose of this *sutta* in the *Suttamālā* is to help wise people to acquire some skilfulness in grammar. If one does not consider the effort to complete word formations, and just by depending on hearing in accordance to *Māgadhī* language, one

---

76 Sstt, 617. (§ 50 Ekasmā idhassa dhassa do niccaṃ)
78 Pdr, 16. (§ 1.27. Do Dhassa ca)
79 Dhp, 44. (Verse no. 206)
just hears ‘idha’ as ‘ida’. That is why, the word ‘ida’ is said as nipāta ‘indeclinable particle’.

In conclusion, Suttamālā explains the change of consonant ‘dh’ in the idha to ‘d’ for two purposes: 1) to give information on the grammar usage to students; and 2) to explain the word formations to students.

From the philological standpoint, the loss of ‘h’ in idha is called the loss of aspiration. According to A Grammar of Prākrit Language, this is common in the Prakrit words, for example, saṅkalā that is equivalent to śṛṅkhalā (a chain) in Sanskrit and saṅkalā in Pāḷi. [śṛṅkhalā>saṅkalā] (ś>s, r>a, kh>k) However, in the Aśoka edict, idha comes from iha Therefore, iha is changed to idha, and then ida [iha>idha>ida] This sutta no. 50 is connected to the sutta no. 72 [please refer to the page 25].

1.2.6 Sutta No. 56 Ya-va-ma-da-na-ta-ra-la-hā vā

This general sutta states the occurrence of insertion of consonants after a vowel. According to sutta no 56.Ya-va-ma-da-na-ta-ra-la-hā vā in Saddanīti Suttamālā, the letters ‘y’, ‘v’, ‘m’, ‘d’, ‘n’, ‘t’, ‘r’, ‘l’ and ‘h’ are inserted after a vowel. These nine insertions are termed as sandhi-consonant by Geiger.

This Suttamālā sutta can be compared to sutta Ya va ma da na ta ra lā cāgamā in the Kaccāyana, which mentions that ‘y’, ‘v’, ‘m’, ‘d’, ‘n’, ‘t’, ‘r’ and ‘l’ are inserted after a vowel. Here, this sutta mentions only eight insertions; it does not mention insertion of the ‘h’ consonant. Therefore, the Suttamālā provides an extra sandhi-consonant ‘h’.

81 Sstt, 619. (§56.Ya-va-ma-da-na-ta-ra-la-hā vā)
82 William Geiger, A Pāḷi Grammar (Britain: Pāḷi Text Society, 1994), 64.
83 Kcc, 53. (§ 1.35. Ya va ma da na ta ra lā cāgamā)
The Pāḷi examples for these insertions are; ajja+agge>ajjatage 84 (from today onwards), sabbhi+eva>sabbhireva samāsetha 85 (associate only with wise persons), cha+abhiṁñā>chaḷabhiṁñā 86 (six supernormal powers) and yasmā+iha>yasmāṭiha bhikkhave.

As said before, the insertion of h consonant is mentioned only in Saddanīṭi Suttamālā, for instance, suhju 87 [su+uju] (very upright), suhṛṭhitam 88 [su+uṭhitam] (well arisen), ḫev’atthi 89 [h–eva-atthi]. In the Aśoka edict, the consonant h before the vowels is inserted, e.g. evaṁ- hevaṁ.

These insertions or sandhi-consonants can be explained from the philology viewpoint. A final consonant that is apparently missing in Pāḷi is revived by sutta of consonantal insertion 90 when followed by a word beginning with a vowel. For example, kenaci+eva becomes kenacideva [Skt. cid], whereas the letter ‘d’ is inserted between kenaci and eva. Other examples are [sabhhi+(r)+ eva] becomes sabbhireva (Skt. sadbhir), [cha+(l)+ abhiṁñā] becomes chaḷabhiṁñā (Skt. ṣaḍ), [tāva+ eva] becomes tāvadeva (skt tāvat), [puna+ (r)+eva] becomes punareva (Skt. punar), [yasmā+iha] becomes yasmāṭiha (skt : yasmāṭ), and [cha+(l)+ abhiṁñā] becomes chaḷabhiṁñā (Skt. ṣaḍ) (ṣ>ch, ḍ>l).

Thus, these insertions are actually the ending letter of the Sanskrit words i.e. cid, sadbhir, tāvat, punar, yasmāṭ, and ṣaḍ. Actually, there is no insertion of the letters ‘d’, ‘t’, ‘r’, ‘l’ and ‘t’ taking place between the words.

---

84 Th, 29. M.II, 59.
88 Sn, 30; Vv, 48.
89 Kv, 12.
1.3 Byañjanasandhi

Only those suttras in the section of byañjanasandhi ‘euphony of consonant’ of Saddanīti Suttamālā and the Kaccāyana are analyzed in this sub-section.

1.3.1 Sutta No. 66 Lopaṇa tatrākāro

There is a general sutta that shows that vowels are elided due to the following vowel and a vowel ‘a’ is inserted at the elided place. Saddanīti Suttamālā 66 Lopaṇa tatrākāro ca points out that because of following a consonant, vowels are sometimes elided and the letter ‘a’ is inserted at the elision place. This is actually termed as byañjananimitta sandhi (euphony having consonant as a cause). For example, due to following the letter ‘s’, the letter ‘o’ of the word ‘so’ becomes ‘a’. [so sīlavā>sa sīlavā91].

This sutta in the Suttamālā can be compared to sutta Lopaṇca tatrākāro in the Kaccāyana 92 that generally mentions this sutta without stating whether it is byañjananimitto sandhi or not. Next, according to sutta Lopaṇca tatrākaro in the Rūpasiddhi93 and Padabyañjananiruttini nīti94, not only having a consonant as a cause, but when there is saranimitta (having a vowel as a cause), the preceding vowel can be elided; for example, “eso attho” becomes “esa attho”95.

From the philological point of view, the word ‘so’ comes from eta (ta) in Pāḷi, and etad (tad) in Sanskrit. In this statement in Asoka’s edict written in Prakrit: “Esa hi sesṭe kaṃmeya dharmānakusāsanaṃ”96 (“This indeed is the best work viz. to instruct

---

91 Dhp, 25. (verse no. 84)
92 Kcc, 50. (§ 1.27. Lopaṇca tatrākāro)
93 Pdr, 26. (§ 1.39. Lopaṇca tatrākaro)
94 Indācārama, Mahāthera, Padabyañjananiruttini nīti (Yangon: Kumārārāma taik, 2000), 61. (§ 27 Lopaṇca tatrākāro)
95 A.II, 56. (Pañcakanipāta)
96 Sen, Amulyachandra, Asoka’s Edicts (Calcutta: Indian Publicity Society, 1956), 71.
the Dhamma”), the word ‘esa’ is equivalent to eso [Pāḷi] and etad [Sanskrit]. This implies the ending letter ‘a’ in esa is interchanged with ‘o’ in the Pāḷi word eso.

1.3.2 Sutta no. 72. Ho dhassa vaṇṇasandhimhi

There is a general rule that states ‘dh’ becomes ‘h’ when followed by a vowel. Sutta no. 72 Ho dhassa vaṇṇasandhimhi in the Suttamālā 97 explains that the consonant ‘dh’ can become ‘h’ because of the vaṇṇasandhi, such as sādhu>sāhu (good, virtuous) and rūdhira>rūhira (blood). By the word ‘ca’ in sutta Do Dhassa in Rūpasiddhi, 98 the ‘dh’ of sādhu becomes ‘h’. [sādhu>sāhu dassanaṃ]

In addition, the grammar book The Philology of Pāḷi states that Pāḷi words may exhibit many characteristics in Prakrit dialect like replacement of mute aspirates by the consonant ‘h’. For instance, rudhira, laghu, prabhū and prabhūta become ruhira (blood), lahu(ka) (light), pahū and pahūta (abundant) accordingly. This is called, “the loss of aspiration”. 99

1.3.3 Sutta No. 132 Adhissa jjho

There is a general sutta that states that the word adhi can become ajjha. Sutta no. 132 Adhissa jjho100 in the Suttamālā clarifies, because of the following consonant, adhi becomes ajjha and this should be pointed out in gāthā (verse). In the sentence “agāram ajjha so vasi” 101 (“he dwelt in the house”), “ajjha so vasi” means “adhi+so āvasi”. Thus, due to following the consonant ‘s’, adhi becomes ‘ajjha’. Here, the word ajjha is linked with the verb āvasi (dwelt). The Buddhavaṃsa also explains this phrase means “agāramajjhe ca so vasi” (“he dwelt in the middle of the house”).

97 Sstt, 621. (§ 72. Ho dhassa vaṇṇasandhimhi)
98 Pdr, 16. (§ 1.27 Do dhassa ca)
100 Sstt, 627. (§132 Adhissa jjho)
101 Bv.II, 32,33,37.
This *sutta* can be compared to *sutta Ajjho adhi* in the *Kaccāyana*\(^\text{102}\) that generally elucidates that *adhi* becomes *ajjha* when followed by a vowel, for instance, *adhi+okāse>*ajjha+okāse>*ajjhokāse*. However, the *Suttamālā* points out this change only takes place in the verses (*gāthā*), and this verse only shown in the *Buddhavamsa*. In the philology point, *adhi* becomes *adhy* and then *ajjha* [\(adhi \rightarrow adhy \rightarrow ajjha\)].

### 1.4 Vomissasandhi

Now, the analytical study on *suttas* of the *Saddanīti Suttamālā* and the *Kaccāyana*, especially only those that belong to *vomissasandhi* are mentioned below. Those *suttas* in *vomissasandhi* of the *Suttamālā* will be compared to chapter three and chapter four of the *Kaccāyana*.

#### 1.4.1 Sutta No. 138 Vaggantāṃ vā vagge

There is a general *sutta* that illustrates *niggahīta* can become a *vagganta* (last letter of group). *Sutta no. 138 Niggahītaṃ vagge vaggantāṃ vā*\(^\text{103}\) in the *Suttamālā* mentions, after the consonant in a *vagga*, the *niggahīta* becomes *vagganta*, and that *niggahīta* becomes the last letter of its own group, not of another group. Here, *vagganta* means the ending letter of *vagga* (group), and they are ‘ṅ’, ‘ṅ’, ‘ṅ’, ‘n’ and ‘m’.

For instance, in the *Pāli* words *dīpaṅkaro*\(^\text{104}\), *dhammaṅcarē*\(^\text{105}\), *niggahīta* has changed into ‘ṅ’ when followed by the initial letter ‘k’ of *karo* in *ka-vagga*, [\(Dīpaṅ+karo > dīpaṅ+karo > dīpaṅkaro\)]. When followed by the initial letter ‘c’ of

\(^{102}\) Kcc, 57. (§ 1.45, Ajjho Adhi)

\(^{103}\) Sstt, 628. (§ 138 Niggahītaṃ vagge vaggantāṃ vā)


\(^{105}\) Jvdp, verse no. 51; Ap-a.I, 10.
care in ca-vagga, niggahīta has changed to ‘ṅ’. [Dhammaṃ+care> dhamaṇ+care>dhamaṇ+care>dhammaṇcare]

This sutta in the Suttamālā can be compared to sutta Vaggantaṃ vā vagge in the Kaccāyana\(^{106}\) that only mentions that the niggahīta becomes vagganta after a consonant in a vagga. Unlike that sutta in the Suttamālā, this sutta in the Kaccāyana does not indicate a particular vagganta that niggahīta should be transformed to.

1.4.2 Ma-dā sare: Suttamālā suttas no. 142 to 145

There is a general sutta that indicates that niggahīta can become ‘m’ or ‘d’ when followed by a vowel. So also the suttas no. 142 to 144\(^{107}\) in the Suttamālā mention niggahīta can change to the consonant ‘m’ or ‘d’. However, in regard to genders and samāsa (compound words), it gives a specific change as follows.

According to sutta No. 142 Napuṃsake yat’etehi do sare pāyena, niggahīta that is connected to ‘ya’, ‘ta’, or ‘eta’ is changed to ‘d’ when followed by a vowel. These ‘ya’, ‘ta’, or ‘eta’ maybe used in three genders. For neutral gender, tam+eva+ārammaṇa becomes tadevārammaṇa, whereas etam+avoca becomes etadavoca.

By Sutta no. 143 Mo itare, when followed by a vowel, niggahīta that associates with a pronoun-‘ya’, ‘ta’, or ‘eta’ in other two genders (masculine, feminine) is transformed into the letter ‘m’. For example, yam+āhu becomes yamāhu\(^{108}\) because the word yam is to be a masculine gender as it refers to Sakka (Deva); tam+abravi becomes tamabravi\(^{109}\) because the word tam is to be a feminine gender as it refers to Queen Maddī.

\(^{106}\) Kcc, 51. (§ 1.31. Vaggantaṃ vā vagge)
\(^{107}\) Sstt, 629. (§ 142-145)
\(^{108}\) J.II, 6. (Verse no. 53) Yamāhu devesu sujampatīti, maghavāti tam āhu manussaloke.
\(^{109}\) J.II, 31. (Verse no. 1710) Tamabravi rājaputtī, maddī sabaṅgasobhanā.
According to *sutta* no. 144 *Samāsedo tilīṅge*, when followed by a vowel, the *niggahīta* associated with ‘ya’, ‘ta’ and ‘eta’ that is in *samāsa* (compound word) and is concerned with three genders becomes ‘d’, for instance, *yassa saddassa padassa vā anantaram yaḍanantaram* (for masculine gender), *yassā gāthāya anantaram yaḍanantaram* (for feminine gender), *etassa saddassa padassa taḍantaram* (for neutral gender).

According to *sutta* no. 145 *Sesato mo do ca sare bya新京 jane vā*, the *niggahīta* associated with the other words (except the pronouns ‘ya, ta, and eta’) that have been mentioned above, becomes ‘m’ or ‘d’ because of following a vowel and consonant, for example, *evam+etam* becomes *evametam*\(^{110}\) and *Buddhaṃ saranaṃ gacchāmi* becomes *Buddhaṃ saranam gacchāmi*.

These *suttas* in the *Suttamālā* can be compared with *sutta* Ma-ḍā sare in the *Kaccāyana*\(^ {111}\) that just mentions that *niggahīta* becomes ‘m’ or ‘d’ when followed by a vowel. *Sutta Madā sare* in *Rūpasiddhi* elaborates further that these changes only happen after the words ‘ya’, ‘ta’ and ‘eta’.\(^ {112}\) Thus, *Suttamālā* gives more specific information than these grammar books because it specifically shows the changes that take place with regard to gender or *samāsa* ‘compound word’.

From the philological standpoint, the *Pāḷi* pronouns ‘ya’, ‘ta’ and ‘eta’ are equivalent to the Sanskrit words ‘yad’, ‘tad’ and ‘etad’. Naturally, when a *Pāḷi* word ‘ya, ta, or eta’ is joined with other words, this final consonant ‘d’ appears, such as ‘d’ appears between two lexical items *etam+avoca* to form into the word *etadavoca*, although *Pāḷi* grammar books explain that ‘m’ becomes ‘d’.

\(^{110}\) M.II, 41. S.I, 34.
\(^{111}\) Kcc, 52. (§ 1.34 Ma-ḍā sare)
\(^{112}\) Pdr, 37. (§ 1.52 Madā sare)
In addition, due to the phonetic combination, a niggahīta can become ‘m’ because niggahīta can interchange with any of the nasal consonants ‘ṅ’, ‘ń’, ‘n’, ‘n’ and ‘m’\textsuperscript{113}, That is why evāṃ+etāṃ becomes evametāṃ.

\textbf{1.4.3 Sutta no. 149. Lutte byañjano visaññogo}

There is a general \textit{sutta} which defines that conjunct consonants become a single consonant when the following vowel to niggahīta is elided. Sutta no. 149 Lutte byañjano visaññogo in the \textit{Suttamālā}\textsuperscript{114} also agrees with this rule by stating that when the following vowel to niggahīta is elided, the conjunct consonants will change to a single consonant. Then it gives more information based on this example:

\textit{Sace Bhuutto bhaveyyāhaṃ sājīvo garahito mama}\textsuperscript{115}

“\textit{If I eat, my livelihood will be blamed.}”

This verse is actually made up of two lines. The first line is “\textit{sacce bhutto bhaveyyāhaṃ assa}”, whereas the second line is “\textit{ājivo garahito mama}”. When the first line is connected to the second line, the change happens by making the conjunct consonants ‘ss’ into a single one, because of the elision of the following vowel that exists after niggahīta, not because of a transition of a letter (means letter moves from one line to next line).

When the word \textit{assa} is connected to \textit{ājivo}, the initial letter ‘a’ of \textit{assa} is dropped due to niggahīta. Due to the combination with the word ‘ājivo’, the first-‘s’ is dropped.

[\textit{bhaveyyāhaṃ+assa+ājivo>ssājivo>sājivo}]

This \textit{sutta} in the \textit{Suttamālā} can be compared to \textit{sutta} Byañjano ca visaññogo in the \textit{Kaccāyana}\textsuperscript{116} and Rūpasiddhi\textsuperscript{117} that points out when a vowel that comes after the

\textsuperscript{113}Ven Ānanda Maitreya, Pāḷi Made Easy (Yangon: Ministry of Religious Affair, 2005), 81.
\textsuperscript{114}Sstt, 630. (§ 148. Lutte byañjano visaññogo)
\textsuperscript{115}Vsm-a,1, 31. Miln, 55.
\textsuperscript{116}Kcc, 56. (§ 1.41 Byañjanno ca visaññogo)
\textsuperscript{117}Pdr, 39. (§ 1.56 Byañjanno ca visaññogo)
niggahīta is elided, then conjunct consonants will become a single consonant. In the example “evamsa te āsavā”\textsuperscript{118}, when the initial letter ‘a’ of ‘assa’ is elided, then the conjunct consonants ‘ss’ become a single ‘s’. [evam \textit{assa} > evam + ss > evamsa]\textsuperscript{118}

That sutta in Rūpasiddhi provides some further facts: By the word ‘ca’, the same (sarūpa) consonant inside triple consonant can become a single consonant (visāmyoga). The given example is agyāgāraṃ, when two words aggi and āgaraṃ are joined, the vowel ‘i’ becomes its semi-vowel ‘y’, and the consonant ‘g’ in the triple consonants ‘gy’ becomes single. [aggi + āgaraṃ > aggy + āgaraṃ > aggyāgarāṃ > agyāgāraṃ]\textsuperscript{119}.

\textsuperscript{118} M.II, 24, 25.
Chapter II
Suttas that exist only in the Sandhi Kappa in Saddanīti Suttamālā

This chapter will discuss some special suttas that exist only in the Sandhi Kappa of Saddanīti Suttamālā but not in the Kaccāyana and Rūpasiddhi. This chapter will be classified into saññavidhāna and some phonological operations such as change (ādesa), contraction (sampasāraṇa), epenthesis (svarabhakti), elision (akkharalopa) and dīghan (long).

2.1 Saññavidhāna

There are ten kinds of recitation that should be known by Kammavācā reciter monks. These are 1. sithila (unaspirated), 2. dhanita (aspirated), 3. garu (heavy), 4. lahu (light), 5. dīgha (long), 6. rassa (short), 7. niggahīta, 8. vimutta (oral)\textsuperscript{120}, 9. sambandha (connected utterance) and 10. vavathita (disjoint utterance). This section of saññavidhāna will elaborate the terms of sambandha, vavathita and vimutta.

2.1.1 Sutta no. 19 Parapadena sambandhitvā vuttaṃ sambandhaṃ, sutta no. 20

Padacchedaṃ katvā vuttaṃ vavathitaṃ

Sutta no. 19 Parapadena sambandhitvā vuttaṃ sambandhaṃ in the Suttamālā designates the connection with the following word as sambandha. Sutta no. 20 Padacchedaṃ katvā vuttaṃ vavatthitaṃ designates the division of words as vavatthita. For instance, the word anāthapiṇḍikassa is connected to ārāme to become “Anāthapiṇḍikassārāme”. The connection of words is called sambandha, whereas the division into two words that are anāthapiṇḍikassa and ārāme is called vavathita.

\textsuperscript{120}Wijithadhamma, Vidyodaya, 63.

The remaining terms viz. sithila ‘non aspirated stops’, dhanita ‘aspirated stops’, niggahīta ‘nasal’ and vimutta ‘oral’ are unparalleled in Sanskrit.
According to the book of Vidyodaya, the terms sambandha (connected utterance) and vavatthita (disjoint utterance) are used to denote the connected or disjoint articulation of words in a sentence.121

2.1.2 Sutta no. 21 Karaṇāni aniggahetvā vivaṭena mukhena vattabbaṃ vimuttaṃ

Sutta no. 21 Karaṇāni aniggahetvā vivaṭena mukhena vattabbaṃ vimuttaṃ explains, without pressing at the place of articulation, the freed sound is called vimutta (released, oral), for instance, the final vowel ‘ā’ in dhammaṭṭhitatā122 and dhammaniyāmatā.123

2.2 Elision (akkharalopa)

According to rule 60 in Pāñinī, the substitution of a blank (lopa) signifies disappearance. Lopa means an elision. When a letter or word-form becomes latent, it is neither heard, nor pronounced, nor written, and it becomes lopa, or is said to be elided.124

2.2.1 Sutta no. 69 Saralopo ya-ma-na-rādīsu vā

This sutta no. 69 Saralopo ya-ma-na-rādīsu vā125 states a neighbouring letter in the preceding position is sometimes dropped because of the following letters ‘y’, ‘n’, ‘r’, and so on. There are many examples such as: cetiyāni>cetyāni126, khattiyā>khatyā127 (warrior), padumāni>padmāni128 (lotus), nisīneha>nisneha129 (without love), nānāratana>nānāratna130 (many jewels), Kriyacittāni>Kriyacittāni

---

121 Ibid.
124 Sharma, The Introduction to Aṣṭādhyāyī. vol-I, 54.
125 Sstt, 621. (§ 69 Saralopo ya-ma-na-rādīsu vā)
126 Sdnt, 80.
(functional minds). Here, the vowels ‘i’, ‘u’ and ‘a’ are dropped because of the neighbouring consonants ‘y’, ‘m’, ‘n’, ‘t’ and ‘r’ in the preceding position.

From the philological outlook, these changes are actually the dropping of inserted vowels between two consonants. The above Pāḷi words have their equivalent Sanskrit words caitya, kṣatriya, padma, sneha, ratna and kriya respectively. To avoid hiatus or consonant clusters in these Pāḷi words, a vowel may be added for easier pronunciation.

2.3. Long (Dīghaṃ)

2.3.1 Sutta no. 41 Na-mā-dā-vā-smā-tra-ṇhā-tvādīnaṃ saralope ayy-aṇṇ-aggh-assu-ssaṇam akāro dīghaṃ

This sutta 41 Na-mā-dā-vā-smā-tra-ṇhā-tvādīnaṃ saralope ayy-aṇṇ-aggh-assu-ssaṇam akāro dīghaṃ¹³² points out that when a preceding vowel is a portion of words, such as ‘na’, ‘mā’, ‘dā’, ‘vā’, ‘smā’, ‘tra’, ‘ṇhā’, or ‘tvā’ is elided, the vowel ‘a’ that is part of the words “ayya, aṇṇa, aggha, assu, assa,” etc. is lengthened, even though the vowel ‘a’ is followed by conjunct consonants. Examples provided in this sutta are “nāṃṇamaṇṇassa dukkhamiccheyya”¹³³, “kalam nāgghanti solasim”¹³⁴, “nāssudha koci bhagavanti upasankamati”¹³⁵ and “nāssa corā pasahanti”¹³⁶.

In the Pāḷi string “nāyyo so bhikkhu maṇḍ nippâtesi”¹³⁷ (“the monk did not bring me”), the final vowel ‘a’ of the word ‘na’ is elided and then an initial letter of ayyo becomes ‘ā’. The ‘yy’ is conjunct consonants. [ṇa+ayyo > n+āyyo>nāyyo]

¹³¹ Prm-d, 50. Vtr, 19.
¹³³ Khp, 11.
¹³⁵ S.III, 11. V.I, 33.
¹³⁷ Spd, 14.
A question might be raised at this point: Why show a long vowel before conjunct consonants? In Pāḷi, a long vowel is generally shortened before a double consonant. A case study on the Pāḷi words māssu and nāyyo should be done. The combination of two words (mā+assu) becomes māssu, not massu. [mā+assu>m+āssu>māssu] If ‘ā’ is not shown as a long vowel, the meaning is no longer mā+assu, but it might be confused with massu (beard). So also the combination of two words na and ayyo should be written as nāyyo (“not the venerable one”) so that it will not be mistaken as ‘nayyo’. 138 [na+ayyo>n+āyyo>nāyyo]

This application of this sutta is a contrast to the following two suttas. The first sutta, sutta no. 22 Kvaci saññogapubbā ekārokārā rassāva vattabbā in Saddanīti Suttamālā 139 explains the vowels ‘e’ and ‘o’ that are followed by conjunct consonants should be recited as short, just like ‘seyyo’, ‘oṭṭho’, and ‘soṭṭhi’ are to be recited as ‘siyyo’, ‘uṭṭha’, and ‘sutthi,’ respectively. The second sutta, sutta no. 38 rassam 140 in the Rūpassidhi clarifies that a vowel sometimes becomes short for a few reasons: 1) to protect the metric of a verse (chandānurakkhaṇa), such as bhovāḍi nāma so hoti141 (ī>i), 2.) insertion (āgama), such as sammgdakkhāto142 (ā>a).

The last reason is conjunct consonants (saṃyoga). To speak fluently, some long vowels become short in front of the conjunct consonants, for instance, parākamo becomes parakkamo (effort) and āsādo becomes assādo (taste).

In conclusion, Venerable Aggavaṃsa, the author of the Suttamālā, purposely writes this special sutta named Na-mā-dā-vā-smā-ira-nhā-tvādiṇaṁ saralope ayya-aṅṅ-aggh-assu-ssānam akāro dīghaṁ. His main purpose is to explain that the reason

---

138 Na is nipāta, assu is a verb, so they are not similar with nayyo (a word). However, when pronouncing these words nāyyo and nayyo, these two have similar sounds.
139 Sstt, 608. (§ no. 22. Kvaci saññogapubbā ekārokārā rassāva vattabbā) 
140 Pdr, 25. (§ 1.38 rassam) 
141 Sarā kho byañjane pare kvaci rassām papponṭṭi chandānurakkhaṇe, āgama, saṃyoge ca rassattam, 
142 Dhp, 71. (verse no. 396). M.II, 41. 
for the preserving of a long vowel in front of conjunct consonants is to avoid any confusion in the meanings.

2.3.2 Sutta no. 42 Sassa kvacantathānaṃ

This *sutta* no. 42 *Sassa kvacantathānaṃ*\(^{143}\) explains when the vowel ‘*a*’ of the word ‘*sa*’ is elided, an initial vowel ‘*a*’ of the words *anta* and *attha* is lengthened, such as sāntevasika\(^{144}\) and sāttha\(^{145}\) “with meaning”. Here, sāntevasika is formed by two words ‘*saha*’ and ‘*antevāsika*’. The word ‘*saha*’ is shortened to ‘*sa*’. The final letter of ‘*sa*’ is elided, and the initial vowel of the word *anta* is lengthened. 

\[
[saha > sa + antevāsika > s + āntevasika > sāntevasika]
\[
[saha + attha > sa + attha > s + āttha > sāttha]
\]

The *Mahāniddesa* explains the word sāntevasika refers to a person in whom evil states dwell because he does not guard his eyes when seeing a visible object.\(^{146}\) In the commentary to *Mahāniddesa*, the word sāntevasika is defined as “sāntevasikoti antevāsikasākhātena kilesena saha vasatītī sāntevasiko.”\(^{147}\) Sāntevasiko means the one who lives together with defilement called antevāsika. According to this *sutta*, even though followed by the conjunct consonants ‘*nt*’ of the word *anta*, the long vowel ‘*ā*’ in the preceding position is not shortened. If sāntevasika is written as sāntevasika (without the long ‘*a*’), its meaning has been wrongly changed to ‘the one who lives in peace’.

\(^{143}\) *Sstt*, 615. (§ 42. *Sassa kvacantathānaṃ*)


\(^{145}\) *Vsm*-t.1, 27. *V.I*, 33

\(^{146}\) *MNd*, 11.


\(^{147}\) *MNd*-a, 57.
This *sutta* goes against *sutta* rule no. 22 *Kvaci saññogapubbā ekārokārā rassāva vattabbā* in *Saddanīti Suttamālā*, which states that the shortening of a long vowel happens when followed by conjunct consonants. Therefore, this *sutta* no. 42 points out the right meaning for *sāntevāsika* and also clarifies that *sutta* no. 22 cannot be applied in all cases.

### 2.3.3 Sutta no. 155 *Saṁsadde paralope pubbo dīghaṃ*

This *sutta* explains when there is the prefix-‘saṁ’, preceding vowel is lengthened because of the lost of the following consonant ‘ṃ’. For instance, *saṁ+ratto*, *saṁ+rāgo*, and *saṁ+rambho* become *sāratto* (impassioned), *sārāgo* (impassioned), and *sārambho* (anger, involving danger to living beings), respectively.

From the philological standpoint, this method is termed compensation (*paṭikaraṇa*). It means the loss of a consonant is often compensated by the lengthening of the preceding vowel. This compensation method can be applied to the ending portion of a word, for example, *candramas*candimā. [as>a] This compensation method might occur in the middle of the word, such as *siṁha>sīha* (im>t) and *vimśati>vīsati* (im>t, ś>s) In addition, because of sandhi, *niggahīta* is dropped and the preceding vowel is lengthened by compensation, for instance, *katham+aham>kathāham*.151

The application of this *sutta* is in accordance with the law of *mora*. A long vowel with a single consonant has the same time-measurement (i.e. *dvimatta*) as a

---

short vowel with conjunct consonants. So, samrambho is similar to sārambho. \((a+mr = ā+r)\)

2.4. Vowel and Consonantal Change (Ādesa)

2.4.1 Sutta No. 55 Ossu

By sutta no. 55 Ossu in the Suttamālā, the vowel ‘o’ becomes ‘u’ when followed by a vowel, for instance, mano and añña are combined to be manuññaṃ (delightful, pleasant).\(^{152}\) Here, the following vowel ‘a’ is elided and the preceding letter ‘o’ becomes ‘u’. \([\text{mano}+\text{añña} > \text{manu}+\text{añña} > \text{manuñña}]\)

The Pāḷi word manuñña has its equivalent manojña in Sanskrit. To transform into manuñña, the conjunct consonants ‘jñ’ are assimilated to ‘ññ’ and ‘o’ becomes ‘u’. \([\text{manojña} > \text{manuñña}]\)

From the philological outlook, the vowels ‘e’ and ‘o’ are normally shortened into ‘i’ and ‘u’ before a double consonance.\(^{153}\) The vowel ‘o’ can be transformed to ‘u’ just like jyotsnā is changed with junhā\(^{154}\). This change is according to the law of mora, and this law is explained in the book of Pāḷi Literature and Language as such:

In Pāḷi, as generally in Middle Indian, a syllable can contain only one or two moras but never more. The syllable is either (1) open with a short vowel (one mora), or (2) open with a long vowel (two moras), or (3) closed with a short vowel (2 moras)\(^{155}\).

Every syllable with a nasal vowel is considered closed. Long nasal vowels do not occur. Due to this law, where Sanskrit has a long vowel before double-consonances

---

\(^{153}\)Chaudhuri, The Philology of the Pāḷi Language, 68.
\(^{154}\)Chaudhuri, The Philology of the Pāḷi Language, 4.

The sound system in Sanskrit has one mora (ekamātrika), two morae (dvimātrika) and three morae (trimātrika) which are termed hrasva (short), dirgha (long) and pluta (extra-long).
(i.e. in closed syllable), Pāḷi have these two types: 1.) A short vowel before a double consonance; and 2.) A long vowel with a single consonant.\textsuperscript{156}

Therefore, the Sanskrit word manojñā can be transformed into manunñā (Pāḷi). That means manojñā is changed into the first type (‘a short vowel before a double consonance, \(u+\tilde{n}\)’), here the vowel ‘\(o\)’ is shortened into ‘\(u\)’.

\textbf{2.4.2 Sutta no. 71 Animittopi vā dīghādi}

Sutta no. 71 Animittopi vā dīghādi in Saddanīti Suttamālā\textsuperscript{157} explains some changes such as the lengthening of a short vowel that can occur even if there is no nimitta (reason, cause). This sutta gives some analogies such as “\(\text{Nadīsatehi va sahā, gaṅgā pañcahi sāgaram}\)”\textsuperscript{158}, “\(\text{abhilāpamattabheda esa}\)”\textsuperscript{159}, “\(\text{na cāpi apunappunam}\)”\textsuperscript{160}. Here, saha, eso and punappunam are transformed to sahā, esa and apunappunam, respectively.

Here, some people might have doubts regarding this sutta because they think sandhi takes place between two metres “\(\text{nadīsattehi va saha}’\) and “\(\text{gaṅgā pañcahi sāgaram}’\)”. It is assumed, because of the first consonant at the second metre-‘\(g\)’, the final vowel ‘\(a\)’ of the ‘\(saha\)’ word in the first metre becomes long. In fact, there is no sandhi (euphony) or samāsa (compound) between the first metre with the second metre, and also the third metre with the fourth metre. Actually, even if the absence of a nimitta, a short vowel can be lengthened (animitta dīgha).\textsuperscript{161}

The \textit{Jātaka} commentary also explains that the first letter ‘\(a\)’ in apunappunam is just a nipāta.

\textsuperscript{156}Geiger, \textit{Pāḷi Literature and Language}, 63.
\textsuperscript{157}Sstt, 621. (§ 71 Animittopi vā dīghādi)
\textsuperscript{158}Ap.II, 20.
\textsuperscript{159}Nibbāna gotamī yāti, satehi saha pañcahi; Nadīsatehiva saha, gaṅgā pañcahi sāgaram.
\textsuperscript{160}J.I, 34.
\textsuperscript{161}J-a.I, 53.
From the philological standpoint, this kind of change occurs owing to two reasons: 1) Protection of metre, and 2) False analogy. False analogy is responsible for certain irregular forms of words, like sugati (su+gati) that sometimes becomes suggati on the analogy of duggati (dur+gati).\textsuperscript{162} On account of a metre,\textsuperscript{163} short vowels are frequently lengthened in the middle of a word, for instance, tāṭīyaṁ (third) and anūdake\textsuperscript{164}(no water), and also frequently in the final syllable like siho’va nadatī vane\textsuperscript{165} (“It roars like a lion in forest”).

2.4.3 Sutta no. 90 Pañcavīsatiyā pañcassa pañṇo

According to sutta no. 90 Pañcavīsatiyā pañcassa pañṇo\textsuperscript{166} in the Suttamālā, pañcavīsati can be transformed into pañṇavīsati. According to sutta Vīsatidasesu pañcassa pañṇapannā in Moggallāna\textsuperscript{167}, when followed by vīsati (20) and dasa (10), the word pañca can become paṇṇa or panna. That means the conjunct consonants ‘ṅc’ can change into two forms ‘ṇṇ’ and ‘nn’. Therefore, the variant readings for pañca are paṇṇa and panna.

According to V. Perniola, the conjunct consonants ‘ṅc’ are sometimes transformed into ‘nn’, ‘ṇṇ’, and ‘ṅṅ’\textsuperscript{168}. Also, the Sanskrit word pañcāśat can be changed into paññāsa and paññāsa (50). As recorded in the Jataka, the other readings for 25 are pañcavīsaṁ and paññuvīsaṁ.\textsuperscript{169} The word vīsam is similar to vīsati.

In conclusion, the possible readings for pañca ‘five’ are 1) paṇṇa, 2) panna, 3) pañña, and 4) pañṇu.

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{162}Chaudhuri, \textit{The Philology of the Pāli Language}, 20.
\item \textsuperscript{163}Geiger, \textit{A Pāli Grammar}, 24.
\item \textsuperscript{164}Vsg, 11. J.II, 32.
\item \textsuperscript{165}M.II, 35.
\item \textsuperscript{166}Sstt, 623. (§ 90.\textit{Pañcavīsatiyā pañcassa pañṇo})
\item \textsuperscript{167}Mgg, 99. (§ 99. \textit{Vīsatidasesu pañcassa pañṇapannā})
\item \textsuperscript{168}V.Perniola, \textit{A Grammar of the Pāli Language} (Colombo: De La Salle, 1958), 107.
\item \textsuperscript{169}J.I, 11.
\end{itemize}
2.4.4 Sutta no. 95 Āyussa yassa vo paññattiyaṃ

This sutta\textsuperscript{170} states that the letter ‘\textit{y}’ of āyu becomes ‘v’ in the area of pañatti ‘name’. Here, dīghāyu+kumāro becomes dīghāvu kumāro\textsuperscript{171} that means “the Prince called Dīghāvu”. In this Pālī string “dīghāyu ko hoti\textsuperscript{172} (ayam kumāro)” means “this prince that has long life”, ‘\textit{y}’ does not change to ‘\textit{v}’ because dīghāyuko is not a name. It is a complement that gives a description to the prince.

Besides the word āyu, there are other identical changes like dāya=dāva (forest), mṛgayā=migavā (hunting), kāṣāya=kāsāva (robe), kiyat=kīva (how much), āyudha=āvudha (weapon),\textsuperscript{173} These examples show that the change from the consonant ‘\textit{y}’ to ‘\textit{v}’ is a common one between Sanskrit and Pālī. Such change is also common between Pālī words, for example migadāya > migadāva, kāsāya > kāsāva.

2.5. Epenthesis (svarabhakti, insertion)

2.5.1 Sutta no. 161 Appakkharānaṃ bahuttamaññathattaṅca

Sutta no. 161 Appakkharānaṃ bahuttamaññathattaṅca\textsuperscript{174} in the Suttamālā shows the expansion of words by insertion of a vowel or consonant. Examples given in this sutta are sarati>susarati\textsuperscript{175}, sakehi>suvakehi, svāmi>suvāmi\textsuperscript{176}. The root of sarati and susarati is Skt. √smṛ (to remember). In old manuscript, there is sumarati. To form susarati, conjunct consonants ‘sm’ are assimilated to ‘ss’, the vowel ‘\textit{r}’ becomes ‘\textit{ar}’, and the vowel ‘\textit{u}’ is inserted between conjunct consonants ‘ss’. [√Smṛ+a+ti>ssar+a+ti>susarati]. To form the Pālī word ‘suvāmi’, the vowel ‘\textit{u}’ is inserted between the conjunct consonants ‘sv’.

\textsuperscript{170} Sstt, 693 (§ 95. Āyussa yassa vo paññattiyaṃ)
\textsuperscript{171} V.III, 48–49.
\textsuperscript{172} M.III, 21, Vsm-ṭ-I, 13.
\textsuperscript{173} Chaudhuri, The Philology of the Pālī Language, 6.
\textsuperscript{174} Sstt, 634. (§ 161. Appakkharānaṃ bahuttamaññathattaṅca)
\textsuperscript{175} Dhp, 60.
\textsuperscript{176} Sn, 38.
In the philological standpoint, only the consonant-groups containing ‘r’, ‘l’,
‘y’, ‘v’ or a nasal are separated by svarabhakti (insertion). The addition of one or
more sounds to a word, especially to the interior (middle) of a word is called
epenthesis in phonology. According to Charles Duroiselle, epenthesis is the insertion
of a letter in the middle of a word. Epenthesis is resorted to mostly to avoid a hiatus of
the collocation of consonants of different organs.

Therefore, ‘svāmi’ is pronounced as ‘suvāmi’. Here, a vowel ‘u’ is inserted
because of the influence of the neighbouring labial ‘v’. Normally for nasal consonants,
if it is labial then ‘u’ is inserted, like sūkṣma>sukhuma (subtle). If it is a dental
consonant, then the vowel ‘i’ is inserted like sneha>sineha (attachment).

### 2.6 Contraction (sampsāraṇa)

Contraction means the reduction of letters or syllables. Sometimes, vowels and
also consonants can be elided. The loss of a syllable is also possible; for instance, the
syllable ‘yā’ is contracted to ‘i’ in the stressed syllable. So the Sanskrit word styāna
can become the Pāli word thīna.

#### 2.6.1 Sutta no. 162 Bahvakkharāṇaṃ appattamaññathattaṅca

This sutta shows the contraction of words, for example, ācariyam (teacher),
kātiyāno, and padumāni (lotus) are changed to āceram, kaccāno, and padmāni
respectively. For the word ācariya to change into ācera, first the consonants ‘y’ and ‘r’
undergo metathesis, then ‘ayi’ is shortened to ‘e’. [ācariya>ācayira>ācera]. The
vowel ‘u’ in padumāni is elided to be ‘padmāni’. To form ‘kaccāno’, the vowel ‘i’ in
the word kātiyāno is elided and then the conjunct letters ‘ty’ are assimilated to ‘ce’

---

177 Geiger, Pāli Literature and Language, 76.
179 Geiger, Pāli Literature and Language, 73.
180 Sstt, 634. (§ 162, Bahvakkharāṇaṃ appattamaññathattaṅca)
181 Vjr-†, 10.
[kātyāno>kātyāno>kaccāno]. Kaccāna also comes from kātyāyana where āya is contracted to ‘ā’. [kātyāyana>kaccāna]

To form the word ācera from ācayira, a single consonant can be omitted between vowels, such as ‘y’ is omitted between ‘a’ and ‘i’, and then ‘ai’ is contracted to ‘e’ [ācariya>ācayira>ācaira>ācera]. This principle of contraction is clearly shown in Prakrit. When the consonants ‘t’, ‘v’ and ‘p’ are dropped from the words kāti (how many), kāvi (poet) and kāpi (monkey), the word ‘kai’ is formed. Herein, the word kai can represent for kati, kavi and kapi.182

2.7 Changes Because Metre

Owing to the quantitative changes in the composition of verses and under the stress of metre, the elision and change of letters can occur. The following suttas explain such changes.183

2.7.1 Sutta no. 157 Vaṇṇaniyamo chando garulahuniyamo vutti

This sutta explains chanda is the system of counting letters. It is similar to the system of garu and lahu that is called the law of mora. This law explains that there are three types of syllables: 1) A short vowel in an open syllable like purisa (one mora); 2) A short vowel in a closed syllable like gan-tuṃ (two morae); 3) A long vowel in an open syllable like pū-jā (two morae).

When Sanskrit has a long vowel in a closed syllable like jīr-na, Pāli has long vowel in an open syllable (no 3) or a short vowel with a closed syllable (no.2): like jin-na. The sound system that is lahu and garu are important in composing verses or

182 Woolner, Introduction to Prakrit, 12.
183 Sstt, 632-633.
poetry like “sabbapāpasa akāranam”\textsuperscript{184}. Because of the sound system, changes happen between Pāli words and Sanskrit words.

\textbf{2.7.2 Sutta no. 159 Vuttānurakkhaṇatthaṃ viparītātā}

This \textit{sutta} points out the occurrence of changes designed to protect \textit{vutti} (way of composing verse) and the law of \textit{garu} and \textit{lahu}. There are also changes in letters to protect the way of reciting, such as the recitation of verse, the recitation of \textit{Suttanta} or the recitation like a wave, such as, ‘high and low’. For instance, the letter ‘i’ in \textit{satimā} is lengthened in “Careyya tenattamano satīmā”\textsuperscript{185} (“he should practise happily with wise ones”), whereas the consonant ‘j’ is doubled in \textit{nappājahe vaṭṭabalam purāṇaṃ}\textsuperscript{186} (“should not abandon old beauty”).

\textbf{2.7.3 Sutta no. 160 Sutte sukhuccaraṇatthamakkharalopo viparītātā ca}

This \textit{sutta} explains the elision and changes of letters for easy recitation in prose or normal sentences. For instance, “dvāṣṭṭhi paṭipadā” (62 practices) becomes “dvāṭṭhipaṭipada”\textsuperscript{187} and “sayaṃ abhiññāya sacchikatvā” becomes “sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā”. (“having understood well and realised oneself”)

From the philological viewpoint, ‘āya’ can be contracted to ‘ā’, for example, \textit{vaihāya} and \textit{upasthāyaka} can become \textit{vehāsa} (sky) and \textit{upatthāka} (attendant) respectively\textsuperscript{188}. Likewise, the ‘āya’ of \textit{abhiññāya} is contracted to the letter ‘ā’ and then the form \textit{abhiññā} is obtained. [\textit{abhiññāya} > \textit{abhiññā}]

\textsuperscript{184} D.II, 42. Dhp, 41.
\textsuperscript{185} V.III, 42. M.III, 19.
\textsuperscript{187} D-ṭṭ.1, 22. S-I.II, 27.
\textsuperscript{188} Perniola, \textit{A Grammar of the Pāli Language}, 103.
From the philological outlook, the change of *abhiññāya* to *abhiññā* is called “dropping of syllable” according to the book of *Practical Grammar of the Pāḷi Language*\(^\text{189}\). This change is for the sake of metre or to facilitate pronunciation.

### 2.7.4 Sutta no. 164 Vuttirakkhaṇe māgame

To protect *vutti* (way to compose verses), after the ‘*m*’ insertion in between two words, an ‘*o*’ that is the ending letter of a first noun becomes ‘*a*’. This *sutta* gives *maggamaththi* (there is a road) and *paccayākārameva* (only mode of causes) as examples. Here, the combination of the two words *maggo* and *atthi* becomes *maggamaththi*\(^\text{190}\), whereas the combination of the two words *paccayākāro* and *eva* becomes *paccayākārameva*.\(^\text{191}\)

\[
[maggo+atthi > magga+(m)+atthi > maggamaththi] \\
[paccayākāro+eva > paccayākāra-m-eva]
\]

The *sutta* ‘E’’o’nama vaṇṇe in *Niruttī-dīpanī*\(^\text{192}\) also explains that when ‘*e*’ and ‘*o*’ are the final vowels of a consonant, they sometimes become ‘*a*’ and generally the consonant ‘*m*’ or ‘*d*’ is inserted. The consonant ‘*m*’ is to protect the *vutti* and for easy recitation.

### 2.7.5 Sutta no. 165 Mādesa akāro dīghaṃ

According to this *sutta*, to protect the *vutti*, when *niggahīta* becomes ‘*m*’, the preceding vowel ‘*a*’ sometimes becomes ‘ā’. For example, *paññavatāmiva*\(^\text{193}\) (“just like a wise one”) is constructed from two words *paññavatām* and *iva*. Because a *niggahīta* can become any *vagganta* letter, *niggahīta* is changed to ‘*m*’.

\[
[paññavatām iva > paññavatāmiva]
\]

---


\(^{190}\) Vsm-a.II, 14.

\(^{191}\) Abh-a.II, 12. (Sammohavinodani)

\(^{192}\) Nrt-d, 25. (§ 41. Eonama vaṇṇe)

\(^{193}\) J.II, 92.
2.8 Conjunct Consonants

According to Pāṇinī, conjunct consonants are consonants between which there is no heterogeneous separating vowel, and which are pronounced jointly.\textsuperscript{194}

2.8.1 Sutta no. 136 Asaṅñogo saññogo ca

Sutta no. 136 Asaṅñogo saññogo ca\textsuperscript{195} in the Suttamālā explains that a single consonant (asaṅñoga) sometimes becomes a conjunct consonant (saññoga) in order to have rhythm in a verse, just like sugati (good destiny) is changed to suggati.

From the philological aspect, the change of sugati to suggati occurs due to the analogy of duggati (dur+gati).

2.8.2 Sutta 180 Puggalavācino āsavassa sassa dvittaṃ

This sutta states that the consonant ‘s’ of āsava becomes double when it means “a person” (puggalavācino). The āsavo becomes assavo, for instance, assavā piyabhānī\textsuperscript{196} (advice to be heard, dear spoken) and Yañce puttā anassavā (sons that did not deserve to be admonished). Why is “puggalavācino” mentioned? Because in the case of “āsavā dhammā” (cankers), āsavā does not relate to people. Therefore, the term “āsava” does not appear in the meaning of person, whereas the term “assava” does not appear in the meaning of Dhamma or in the sense of phenomena.

From the philological standpoint, there are two different roots here. The root √sru means (to flow), whereas the root √śru means (to hear). The Sanskrit word aśrava is equivalent to the Pāli word assava (obedient). Here the conjunct consonants ‘śr’ become ‘ss’. [aśrava>assava] However, the āsava word is formed by the prefix ‘ā’, root √sru and suffix ‘a’. Conjunct consonants ‘sr’ are assimilated to ‘ss’ and the

\textsuperscript{194} Sharma, The Introduction to Aṣṭādhyāyī Vol. I, 9.
\textsuperscript{195} Sstt, 628. (§ 136. Asaṅñogo saññogo ca)
vowel ‘u’ becomes ‘av’. [ā+√sru+a>āsava] Hence, these are the differences in terms of puggala and Dhamma.

2.9. Savibhatti or Avibhatti

2.9.1 Sutta no. 163 Kvaci sare byañjane vā odantānaṃ nāmānaṃ akārantattaṃ pakati

This *sutta* states that the final letter ‘o’ of a noun becomes ‘a’ because of a vowel or a consonant, and then gives an explanation on savibhatti (with case-ending) and avibhattika (without case-ending). In the Pāli strings “Evam Kakusandha koṇāgamano” and “thera vādānamuttomo” 197, kakusandha and therā are avibhattika198. Because of the absence of vibhatti, the final vowel ‘o,’ which is a nominative singular, is not seen in the commentaries.

In an indirect way (pariyāya), the words ‘sa’ and ‘esa’ as in “sa evattho” and “esa ābhogo”199 are avibhattika. However, in an exact way (nippariyāya), in “idha dhammaṃ caritvāna, rāja saggam gamissas”200, just like the word rāja is a vocative case and its case ending is elided, so also ‘sa’ and ‘esa’ can also be savibhattika (with case-ending).

Next, the words Dhanusekha and kakusandha in “tuvañca dhanusekha ca” etc. are sometimes avibhattika or savibhattika. In the Pāli string “Tattha dhanusekhacāti dhanusekho ca, dhanusekhakumāro cāti attho” in the Jātaka commentary201, dhanusekha is the same as dhanusekho (with the nominative case ending); it means Dhanusekha Prince. Therefore, dhanusekha in this commentary is a savibhattika.

---

197 Vsm-a,19. (nidānakathā)
198 Kv-a, 109.
200 J.II, 4.
201 J-a.VI, 328.
The total avibhattika are the word sata and asa. (Sidārīti sata, attīti asa) Sata is defined as “sata asmi”, and it means impermanence (anicca) and is the idea of uccheda-diṭṭhi. Asa is defined as “asa asmi”, and it means permanence (nicca) and is the idea of sassata-diṭṭhi.

In conclusion, the author, Venerable Aggavamsa, explained that not all words are savibhattika. It depends on the situation; they might be either savibhattika or avibhattika.
Chapter III

Study of Irregular Forms in Sandhi Kappa in the Suttamālā

This chapter is an analytical study of the irregular forms that exist in the Saddanīti Suttamālā, and it presents their word formations with the explanations from the related suttas in Saddanīti Suttamālā and other grammar books. It also includes clarifications from related commentaries and the philological standpoint from Prakrit, Sanskrit or Hybrid Sanskrit.

3.1 Eḷamūgo

According to sutta no. 103 Eḷato mukhassa mūgo in the Suttamālā, when the word mukha exists after the word eḷa, it can be changed into mūga or mūka. Therefore, there are several possible readings: eḷamukha, eḷamūga, and eḷamūka.

Eḷamūga generally means deaf and dumb. According to the Pāli-English Dictionary, it is called as such because of the saliva (foam) dripping from the mouth.

The definition for elamukha is “elamukhoti elāya niccapaggharitam mukhametasseti elamukho.”, it means “a person who has a mouth always dripping with saliva, so he is called elamukha”.

Then, the definition for elamūga is “vacane savane ca akusalo elamūgo nāma, elo bādhiro, mūgo avacano” — “Elamūgo means unskilful in speaking and hearing, eḷa means deaf and mūga means dumb”.

---

202 Sstt, 624. (§ 103. Eḷato mukhassa mūgo)
203 PED, 324.
204 Pct-a-y, 27.
The second definition for ēḷāmūga is “sattannaṃ kho, bhikkhu, bojjhaṅgānaṃ abhāvitattā abahulīkatattā ‘duppañño ēḷamūgo’ti vuccati.”205 — “Because of not developing and not frequently practising the seven factors of enlightenment, this person is said to be an unwise one.” Here, ēḷāmūga is a synonymous term for duppañña and it means an unwise one, one who lacks wisdom, a foolish one.

The phonological change is shown as follows: Elā mukhe gaḷati yassāti ēḷamūgo kha-kārassa ga-kāraṃ katvā, elamukho, elamūko vā.206 Here, ‘kh’ is changed to ‘g’ or ‘k’. That means the alternative forms for ēḷamukha are ēḷamūga or elamūka.

From a philological aspect, the change of the consonants ‘kh’ to ‘g’ is possible because letters can be interchanged in the same group that is guttural. With the loss of aspiration, the change of the consonants ‘kh’ to ‘k’ is possible.

3.2 Kammāsadhamma

According to sutta no. 93 Dho dasa in the Suttamālā 207, the consonant ‘d’ can be changed to ‘dh’, just like kammāsadamma>kammāsadhamma. Kammāsa means spotted. Dhamma comes from damma because there is an insertion of the letter ‘h’ and this insertion is called aspiration or dhanita. For instance, sukumāra (tender, delicate), paruṣa (rough), paraśu (hatchet), and kila (peg) become sukhumāla, pharusa (rough), pharasu (hatchet), and khila (peg),208 respectively after an aspiration.

The commentary to Mahāvagga gives some explanation, “Kammāso ettha damitoti kammāsadammo. Kammāsoti kammāsapādo porisādo vuccati”209. It means

205 S.III, 88.
206 Sl-ṭŚ.II, 29.
207 Sstt, 623. (§ 93 Dho dasa)
209 D.II, 74.
Kammāsadamma is the place where Porisāda, who has spotted foot, is tamed. The root damma is √dam (to tame). Kammāsa is equivalent to the Sanskrit word kalmāṣa where conjunct consonants ‘lm’ are assimilated to ‘mm’ and ‘ṣ’ is changed to ‘s’. (kalmāṣa>kammāsa)

From the philological perspective, sithila is translated as aspirated, whereas dhanita is unaspirated. By putting aspiration or an ‘h’ sound on sithila, it develops into dhanita. The first and third consonants in a vagga are termed sithila, whereas the second and fourth consonants are called dhanita. In conclusion, dhamma is the aspirated form of damma. In fact, ‘h’ is always used to aspirate a consonant in Pāḷi.  

Because of different dialect or pronunciation, the aspiration occurs. This aspiration or ‘h’ sound can be added at the initial, middle or ending positions, such as busa>bhusa (chaff) [initial position], sukumāra>sukhumāla (soft, smooth) [middle position] and kakuda>kakudha (hump) [ending position].

### 3.3 Kalunā

According to sutta no. 92 Ņassa ca no, the change of consonant lingual ‘ṇ’ to dental-‘n’ and the change of ‘r’ to ‘l’ are possible. For instance, karunā (compassion) is changed to kalunā because of changing the place of articulation from lingual to dental. [karunā>kalunā] Three possible forms are shown in the Tipiṭaka: karunā, kalunā, and kalūna. The form kalūna is the least common.

The lengthening of the ‘u’ vowel in kalūna may be due to the influence of accents. [kalunā>kalūna] Karuṇā is formed by the root √kar (to make), suffix ‘una’

---

210 Chaudhuri, The Philology of the Pāḷi Language, 23.
211 Sstt, 693. (§ Ņassa ca no)
212 J.II, 319. Kalunām [karunām (sī. pī.), kalūnaṃ (syā. ka.)] paridevesi, rājaputṭi yasassini.
and the feminine suffix ‘ā’. Due to the influence of ‘r’, the consonant ‘n’ is lingualised. [\textit{\text encyclopedia kar+una+ā>karuṇā}]

### 3.4 Kāvañña

By \textit{sutta} no. 101 \textit{Vo passa} in the \textit{Suttamālā}, the consonant ‘p’ is changed to ‘v’, for instance, \textit{kāpañña>kāvañña} (state of poor). Other similar changes are \textit{pūpa>pūva} (cake) and \textit{apara>avara} in \textit{parovara} (high and low).

The sentence definition for \textit{kāpañña} is “\textit{kapa karuṇāyaṃ. Kapati. Kapano, kāpañña. Tattha kapati karuṇāyati, kāpaññanti kapañabhāvo}.”\textsuperscript{213} Here, the root is \textit{\text Encyclopedia kap} (to be compassionate). Kāpañña means the state of poor, state of being pitiful and it is a secondary derivative. Its verbs are \textit{kapati, karuṇāyati} (to have compassionate). The \textit{Pāli} word \textit{kapañña} is equivalent to the Sanskrit word \textit{kṛpaṇa} that means “is inclined to grieve, pitiable, miserable, poor, wretched, feeble.”\textsuperscript{214} The root is \textit{\text Encyclopedia krp} (to wail).

For the Sanskrit word \textit{kṛpanta} to become the \textit{Pāli} word \textit{kapañña}, the vowel ‘r’ is changed to the consonant ‘r’, and the conjunct consonants ‘ny’ are assimilated to ‘ñn’. According to V. Perniola, this change of the consonant ‘p’ to ‘v’ is called softening of an intervocalic consonant.\textsuperscript{215} According to the \textit{Introduction of Prakrit}, such change is common; there exist many examples such as \textit{rūpa>rūva} (form), \textit{dīpa>dīva} (light, lamp), \textit{upari>uvari} (above), \textit{api>avī} and \textit{apara>avara} (next).\textsuperscript{216}

\textsuperscript{213} \textit{Sdnt}, 12.
\textsuperscript{214} \textit{SED}, 305.
\textsuperscript{215} Perniola, \textit{A Grammar of the Pāli Language}, 105.
\textsuperscript{216} Woolner, \textit{Introduction to Prakrit}, 14.
3.5 Jalābu

The form jalābu is derived from jarāyu. According to *sutta* no. 102 *Vuttāvuttānam byañjanānaṃ aññabyañjanattampi* in the *Suttamālā*, the change of a consonant to another consonant is possible. For the word jalābu, this *sutta* gives this definition: “*jaraṃ firaṇaṃ bhedaṃ yāti upeti ti jalābu*”, Jalābu means approaching aging and breakage. It refers to a placenta—the conception place for womb-born beings.

The word formation for jalābu is formed by the prefix jarā, the root √i, and the suffix ‘u’. The root ɶ ‘to go’ is upgraded to ‘aya’, the consonants ‘r’ and ‘y’ are changed to ‘l’ and ‘y’ respectively. [Jara+√i+u>jara+aya+u> jarāyu>jalābu]

According to Ledi Sayādaw, “*Jalaṃ vuccati kalalaṃ. Tam āvunāti paṭicchādeti avatīvā rakhatīti jalābu, gabbhapāḷiveṇṭhanāsayo*”. Here, jala means kalala, and jalābu means the protection of kalala [jala+āvu>jalābu].

These changes in consonants can be seen in many examples, such as ‘r’ changed to ‘l’ as in *Mahāsāra>mahāsāla* (having immense wealth), and also ‘y’ changed to b’ as in *vanīyaka>vanibbaka* (beggar) and *pūya>pubba* (pus). This proves that changes between consonants are a common feature between Sanskrit and Pāḷi.

3.6 Nighaṇḍu

By *sutta* no. 87 Gho khassa, the consonants ‘kh’ become ‘gh’, for instance, nikhanḍu is changed to nighaṇḍu. This word *Nighaṇḍu* means “a vocabulary, a collection of an explained word or explanation” or word study, lexicology especially

---

217 Sstt, 623.
218 Prm-d, 31.
219 Sstt, 622.
220 PED, 657.
as a *Vedāṅga*⁴. The possible roots are 1.) √*khaḍ* (to divide, to cut)⁵ and 2.) √*ghaṭ* (to collect, to accumulate).⁶

The first definition is “*Vacanīyavācakabhāvena attham saddaṅca nikhaḍati bhindati vibhaṭja dassetīti nikhaṇḍu*”⁷ —“To cut, to break, to classify, to show the meaning and word in the form *vacanīya* (explained word) and *vācaka* (explanatory word), so it is called *nikhaṇḍu*.” Here, the word *Nikhaṇḍu* is formed by the prefix ‘*ni*’, root √*khaḍ* (to cut)⁸ with the insertion of niggahīta in the root and a suffix ‘*u*’. The ‘*m*’ is modified to the class nasal that is the same as ‘*d*’, and ‘*kh*’ is changed to ‘*gh*’. [nikhaḍ+(m)+u>nikhaṇḍu>nighaṇḍu]

The second definition is “*Tattha tatthāgatāni nāmāni nissesato ghaṭenti rāsīkaronti etthāti nighaṇṭu.*”⁹ —“Therein, the names as such are completely collected, makes into a heap in here, so this is called *nighaṇṭu*”. *Nighantu* is formed by the prefix *ni*, root √*ghaṭ* and suffix ‘*u*’. The *niggahīta* is inserted in the root √*ghaṭ*, and then it is changed ‘*n*’ that is the class nasal of *ta-vagga*. [ni+√ghaṭ+(m)+u>nighaṇṭu>nighaṇṭu].

This *Pāḷi* word is equivalent to the Sanskrit word *nighaṇṭu*,¹⁰ or *nighaṇṭa* or *nirghaṇṭa* in the *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary*.¹¹ The possible root is √*ghaṭ* (to collect).

---

¹⁴ BHS, 295.
¹⁷ D-t.I, 29.
¹⁹ Abhp-t.l, 95.
²⁰ SED, 546.
²¹ BHS, 295.
3.7 Paccavekkhaṇā

Sutta no. 100 Po visa vassa ca in the Suttamālā\textsuperscript{229} explains the letters ‘vi’ and ‘va’ can be changed to ‘pa’. For example, \textit{vissa vassa} (will realize) is changed to \textit{paccassa vassa}, whereas \textit{paccavekkhaṇā} (reflection) is changed to \textit{paccavekkhaṇā}. To become \textit{paccavekkhaṇa}, ‘ti’ of \textit{pati} is assimilated to ‘ty’ then ‘cc’. [\textit{pati}+\textit{ava}+\textit{ikkha}+\textit{paccav}+\textit{ikkka}+\textit{ha}>\textit{paccavekkhaṇa}]. The Nirutti-dīpanī also mentions the same \textit{sutta} with another similar analogy – the change of \textit{pivā} to \textit{pipā} (to be thirsty).

For the word \textit{paccavekkhaṇa}, its root is \textit{ikkha} ‘to see’ in \textit{Pāli} or \textit{īkṣ} in Sanskrit\textsuperscript{230}. Its Sanskrit equivalence is \textit{pratyavekṣana}. To form the \textit{Pāli} word, the ‘\textit{pr}’ is assimilated to ‘\textit{pp}’ and then the first ‘\textit{p}’ is dropped; ‘\textit{ty}’ is assimilated to ‘\textit{cc}’, and ‘\textit{kṣ}’ is assimilated to ‘\textit{kkh}’. Its definition is “\textit{pati punappunaṃ ogāhetvā ikkhaṇa}”\textsuperscript{231} (“plunge in wisdom again and again”). [\textit{pratyavekṣana}>\textit{ppacc-avekkha} >\textit{paccavekkhaṇa}]

3.8 Paṇidhi

Sutta no 91 \textit{ṇo Nassa} in Saddanīti Suttamālā\textsuperscript{232} mentions the dental ‘\textit{n}’ can be changed into lingual ‘\textit{n}’, for example, \textit{panidhāna} and \textit{panidhi} become \textit{panidhāna} and \textit{panidhi}, respectively. \textit{Paṇidhāna} (aspiration, determination) is constructed from the lexical items: prefixes ‘\textit{pa}’ and ‘\textit{ni}’, root \textit{dhā} ‘to put’ and suffix ‘\textit{ana}’. [\textit{pa}+\textit{ni}+\textit{dhā}+\textit{ana}>\textit{panidhāna}] The \textit{panidhi} ‘aspiration’ is formed by prefixes ‘\textit{pa}’ and ‘\textit{ni}’, root \textit{dhā} and suffix ‘\textit{i}’. [\textit{pa}+\textit{ni}+\textit{dhā}+\textit{i}>\textit{paṇidhi}]

\textsuperscript{229} Sstt, 623.
\textsuperscript{230} Sīlananda, \textit{Pāli Roots in Saddanīti}, 7.
\textsuperscript{231} Ashin Kumāra, \textit{Dhātvattha Pangon} (Yangon: Thathanat WunHsaun, 2012), 37.
\textsuperscript{232} Sstt, 693. (§ 91. \textit{ṇo nassa})
Sutta Tathanarānaṃ ṭ, ṭh ṇ ḍ in the Moggallānāvabodhi\textsuperscript{233} states that the change of consonants (‘t’, ‘th’, ‘n’, ‘r’) to (‘ṭ’, ‘ṭh’, ‘ṇ’, ‘ḷ’) is possible. This proves the dental consonants (t, th, d, dh, n, l) can change into their corresponding lingual consonants (ṭ, ṭh, ḍ, ḍh, ḍ̣, ṇ). There are many instances of such lingual changes, such as dukkatam>$dukkatam (badly done), attakathā>$atthakathā (commentary), and gahana>$gahaṇa (taking).

From the philological perspective, the Pāḷi words panidhāna and panidhi are equivalent to the Sanskrit words pranidhāna and pranidhi. Due to the influence of the consonant ‘r’ in the Sanskrit prefix ‘pra’ that is unseen in the Pāḷi prefix ‘pa’, the dental ‘n’ becomes lingual ‘ṇ’ so that it is the same place of articulation with ‘r’\textsuperscript{234}.

Sutta no nassa pa pariādito in Rūpasiddhi\textsuperscript{235} supports the above change by exhibiting the influence of ‘r’ on letter ‘n’. Due to the consonant ‘r’ of pari prefix, the letter ‘n’ is lingualised, like in the Pāḷi words parinata>$parinata (bend down) and parināma>$parināma (changes). However, when the suffixes ‘nta’, ‘māna’ and ‘ti’ exist after the ending letter ‘r’ of a root, the letter ‘n’ does not change to ‘ṇ’\textsuperscript{236}, for instance, the words karonto, kurumāno and karonti.

3.9 Papā

Papā [pa+pā] in feminine gender generally means a place for supplying water, a shed by the roadside to provide travellers with water, a well,\textsuperscript{237} or it means a great deal of water. There are two possible roots for papā: 1.) √pā (to drink), and 2.) √āp

\textsuperscript{233} Ashin Panḍitābhivaṃsa, Moggallānāvabodhi, Vol. I (Yangon:lechāsayapīṭakat, 1988), 59. (§ 52. tathanarānaṃ ṭ, ṭh ṇ ḍ)
\textsuperscript{234} Pdr-ṭ, 118.
\textsuperscript{235} Pdr, 32. (§ 42. no nassa pa pariādito)
\textsuperscript{236} Mgg, 20. (§ 172. Na ntamānaṭyādīnaṃ). Pyg-s, 29. (§ 5 Na nta+māna+tyādīnaṃ)
\textsuperscript{237} PED, 151.
Sutta no. 32 Passarā sarūpo in the Suttamālā states that a following similar (sarūpa) vowel that is connected to ‘pa’ can be elided. For example, the prefix-\textit{pa} is combined with the word \textit{āpa} (water) to be \textit{papa} as in “\textit{udaṅgane tattha papaṃ avindum}” ("a great deal of water was found at open place"). Here the ending vowel ‘a’ of ‘pa’ and the initial vowel ‘ā’ of ‘āpa’ are sarūpa. [\textit{pa\textasciitilde}{āpa}\textasciitilde{papa}]

Here, \textit{sārupa} means homogeneous or having the same form, whereas \textit{asarūpa} means dissimilar form or heterogeneous. So, this sutta Passarā sarūpo states the sarūpa vowel connected to ‘pa’ can be dropped. Sarūpa means similar form like ‘a’ to ‘ā’, ‘i’ to ‘ī’, and ‘u’ to ‘ū’.

For the word \textit{papā}, the \textit{Jātaka} commentary provides some elucidation. “\textit{Papaṃ avindunti udakaṃ paṭilabhimsu. Udakañhi papīyanaḥ ṭvccaṭi. Pavaddham vā āpaṃ papāṃ, mahodakanti attho.”\textasciitilde{\textit{Papaṃ avindum} means they obtained water. Because of drinkable state, the water (\textit{udaka}) is termed as \textit{papā}. Papā means a great deal of water.”

Here, \textit{papā} is formed with prefix \textit{pa}, word \textit{āpa} (water) and feminine suffix ‘ā’.

The prefix \textit{pa} means pavaddham (big, a great deal). [\textit{Pa\textasciitilde}{āpa}\textasciitilde{papa}]. The Saddanīti

\begin{footnotes}
\item[238] \textit{Kumāra, Dhāvattha Pungon}, 29.
\item[239] Sstt, 613. (§ 32. Passarā sarūpo)
\item[240] Pubbasaramhā sarūpo vā asarūpo vā paro saro kvaci lopo hoti.
\item[241] J.I, 2.
\item[242] PED, 1285.
\item[243] Kcc-En, 3.
\item[244] A heterogeneous group consists of many different types of things or people. Homogeneous is used to describe a group or thing which has members or parts that are all the same. [Collins Dictionary].
\item[244] J-a.1, 12.
\end{footnotes}
Dhātumālā states the root for āpa is √āp (to pervade).\(^{245}\)

The commentator says “pāṇiyāṃ pivanti etthāti papā, taṃ papaṃ. Udakam piyati etthāti vā papā”\(^{247}\)—“They drink the water here, or water is drunk here, so it is called papā.” The word formation is the prefix pa and root √pā (to drink). [pa+√pa>papa].

From the philological standpoint, the Pāli word papā is equivalent to prāpa\(^{248}\) in Sanskrit with prefix ‘pra’ and word āpa. To form the Pāli word papā, ‘pr’ is assimilated into ‘pp’, first ‘p’ is dropped and the long vowel ‘ā’ is shortened. [pra+āpa>prāpa>ppāpa>papa]. The Pāli word āpo (water) that is in manoganādi word) is equivalent to āpas\(^{249}\) in Sanskrit. The final letters ‘as’ become ‘o’ like vayas=vayaḥ=vayo (anuppatto).\(^{250}\)

3.10 Pasenadi

According to sutta no. 88 Do jassa\(^{251}\) in the Suttamālā, Pasenadi is derived from pasenajit. Here, consonant ‘j’ is changed to ‘d’. The definition is “Parasenam jinātīti pasenadi”\(^{252}\) (“He conquers another army, so he is called Pasenadi.”) Pasena is derived from the word parasenā (other army) [para+senā]. The word sena is formed by the root √si (to bind) and suffix ‘ana’. [si+ana>sena]

\(^{245}\) Sdnt, 246. Āpa byāpane. Āpuṇāti. Āpo
\(^{246}\) Sīlananda, Pāli Roots in Saddanīti, 6.
\(^{247}\) S-t.II, 124.
\(^{248}\) SED, 708.
\(^{249}\) SED, 143.
\(^{250}\) Chaudhuri, The Philology of the Pāli Language, 36.
\(^{251}\) Sstt, 622. (§88 Do jassa)
\(^{252}\) Nrt-d, 32. (§45, Tathanarānam tathānalā)
From the philological point, the Sanskrit equivalent is *prasena-jit*.253 ‘Pr’ is assimilated to be ‘*pp*’ and the first ‘*p*’ is dropped, ‘*d*’ is changed to ‘*j*’ just like *jyotsnā* =*dosinā* (moonlight night) and *jājvalya=daddalla* (to blaze, to shine).254 Then the final consonant ‘*t*’ is dropped. [*prasenajit>*p*pasena-jit>*pasena-di>*pasenadi*]

---

253 SED, 698.
Chapter IV

Comparison of Suttamālā suttas with Kaccāyana

on the Nāma Kappa

4.1 The definition and the meaning of liṅga

There are several suttas (no. 192 to 197) that explain the definition and meaning of liṅga in the Suttamālā.\(^\text{255}\) First, sutta no. 192. Visadattādisahitaṃ liṅatthagamakaṃ nipphannavacanaṃ liṅgam in the Suttamālā explains that liṅga is a completed word to make known the hidden meaning connected with visada, avisada etc. The word rukkho is liṅga, whereas the liṅattha (meaning of liṅga) is explained by it. According to sutta no. 193. Visadam pullīṅgam, visada is masculine gender. Next, according to sutta no. 194 Avisadam itthiliṅgam, avisada is feminine gender. Sutta no. 195 N’eva visadam nāvisadam napūṃsakaliṅgam states neither of them is neutral gender. Then, according to sutta no. 196 Dhātu-paccaya-vibhavajjitaṃ athhavam liṅgam, a liṅga is a stem (uncompleted word) that excludes dhātu, paccaya and vibhati, and it has a meaning and contains a hidden part. Here, the hidden part is kattu, kamma, etc. Liṅga should be put with a nominative case to make a completed form. Next, according to sutta no. 197 Upasagga-nipāta ca, upasagga and nipāta can be termed liṅga.

\(^{255}\) Sstt, 641.
In the Sanskrit grammar book *Kātrānta*, *sutta* Dhātu vibhaktivarjamarthavallīṅgam states liṅga is a word that has meaning separated from the root, suffix and case-ending.\(^{256}\)

According to the first explanation of liṅga, as given by *sutta* 192 Visadattādisahitam līnathagamakam nipphannavacanaṁ liṅgāṁ, liṅga means a finished or completed word, for instance, Buddho, Bhagava. *Visada* means masculine gender like āpo (water) etc, whereas *avisada* means itthiliṅga (feminine gender), for instance, pathavī (earth), ratti (night). Neither *visada* nor *avisada* is the neutral gender, for example, cittaṁ (mind) and rūpaṁ (form, material).

According to the second explanation of liṅga as stated by *sutta* no. 196, Dhātu-ppaccaya-vibhattivajjitaṁ aththavam liṅgam, the liṅga is not dhātu, paccaya or vibhatti. Here, according to A.K. Warder, there are four parts of speech (*padajāti*: classes of words) as recognized by the ancient Indian grammarians. They are word (*pada*), root (*dhātu*), suffix (*paccaya*) and inflection (*vibhatti*).\(^{257}\) Therefore, based on the information mentioned above, only the word (*pada*) can be termed liṅga. So, liṅga actually means a word stem or an uncompleted word. It has a meaning and also has a hidden part because the *kattu*, *kamma*, etc. are unknown. The nominative case (first case) should be added to the liṅga to make a complete word.

The examples of liṅga as given in this sutta are purisa, citta and mālā. Thus, the completed forms of these examples should be puriso [masculine], cittaṁ [neutral] and mālā [feminine]. Here, the word ‘puriso’ is known as a completed word (*nipphannapada*). The word ‘purisa’ is termed as an uncompleted word (*anipphannapada*) because it has a hidden meaning because the *kattu* (subject), *kamma* (object), and *karaṇa* (instrument), etc. are not known.

---


\(^{257}\) Warder, *Introduction to Pāḷi*, 7.
Next, *sutta* no. 197 *Upasagga-nipāta ca liṅga* clearly states *upasagga* and *nipāta* such as *pati, atthi, sakkā*, etc can be denoted as *liṅga*. Here, *nipāta* can be translated as particle or indeclinable\(^{258}\) or indeclinable particle.

Furthermore, *Liṅga* can be classified to four types: 1) *ekaliṅga* (one gender), 2) *dviliṅga* (two genders), 3) *tiliṅga* (three genders), and 4) *aliṅga* (no gender). *Purisa* (man) [masculine], *pathavī* (earth) [feminine] and *phala* (fruit) [neutral] are classified as *ekaliṅga* (one gender). *Sāmaṇera* (male novice) and *sāmaṇerī* (female novice) are examples of *dviliṅga*. *Accha* (clear) is an example of *tiliṅga*. Examples of *aliṅga* are numbers such as *pañca, cha, satta, aṭṭha, nava*, and *dasa*, personal pronouns such as *tumha, amha*, and *nipāta* (indeclinable), and *upasagga* (prefix).\(^{259}\)

**Comparison with *Kaccāyana* and *Rūpasiddhi***

*Suttas* no. 192 to 197 in the *Suttamālā* can be compared with *sutta* *Liṅgaṅca nipajjate* in the *Kaccāyana*\(^{260}\) that states “the *liṅga*, crude forms or stems are determined here just as they are found in the discourse of Buddha.”\(^{261}\) According to the suttas *liṅgaṅca nipaccate* and *liṅgatthe paṭhamā*\(^{262}\) in the *Rūpasiddhi*, *liṅga* is a word that excludes *dhātu, paccaya*, and *vibhatti*. That word has a meaning and the nominative case is applied to show the meaning of *liṅga*. According to *Kaccāyana*, *liṅga* means ‘stem’ or ‘uncompleted word’. However, according to *Suttamālā*, *liṅga* can be of two types: 1) completed word, and 2) uncompleted word, or stem.

---


\(^{260}\) Kcc, 60.

\(^{261}\) Kcc-En, 6.

\(^{262}\) Pdr, 45. (*Liṅgaṅca nipaccate. §2.65. Liṅgatthe paṭhamā*)
Explanation in the *Kaccāyana-bhāsāṭīkā*

Sayādaw *Ashin Janakābhivaṃsa* provides some elaborations on *liṅga* in his *Kaccāyana-bhāsāṭīkā*\(^{263}\). In the vuttī “*liṅgathābhidhānamatte paṭhamavibhatti hoti*” of sutta “*liṅgathe paṭhama*”, the word *matta* is just to show the meaning of the *liṅga* without showing the special functions like *kamma* and *karaṇa*. The *paññatti* (concept) such as *purisa* and *rukkha*, as well as the *paramattha* (ultimate truth) such as *pathavī*, can be denoted as *liṅga*. Here, the word *purisa* is a *liṅga*, whereas the form and appearance of a man are called as *liṅgattha* (the meaning of *liṅga*). The word *pathavī* is *liṅga*, whereas its characteristics, such as, hardness, is *liṅgattha*. Consequently, *liṅga* is just a word, whereas the *liṅgattha* is the real meaning of *liṅga*.

Sayādaw *Ashin Janakābhivaṃsa* also explains from the standpoint of the Sanskrit grammar book *Pāṇinī*. *Liṅgattha* is similar to *paṭipadikatthamatte* and the word *matta* means ‘just’. Therefore, *liṅga* has the same meaning with *paṭipadika* (separated word, stem), whereas *liṅgattha* means *paṭipadikattha*. In *Pāṇinī*, *paṭipadikattha*, *liṅga*, *parimāṇa* (measurement) and *vacana* (number) are included in the *liṅgattha* because the words *itthi*, *dona* and *eka* are *liṅga*, whereas the meaning of female, the meaning of a measurement (i.e. 1/8th of a bushel) and the meaning of one are termed as *liṅgattha*. Thus, *liṅga* can refer to various things, but the real meaning of a *dabba* (substance, entity) is termed as *liṅgattha*.

According to the book *Kaccāyana-bhāsāṭīkā*, there are two types of *liṅgattha*. *Suddhaliṅgattha* does not have the meaning of *kamma*, *karaṇa*, etc., and only the first *vibhatti* is added after the stem. *Samsatthaliṅgattha* has the meaning of *kamma*, *karaṇa* etc, and are added with *vibhattis* like the second case. There are many types of

\(^{263}\) *Kcc-ṭ*, 376-378.
The Four Views in Saddatthabhedacintā-bhāsāṭīkā

There are four views regarding liṅga as mentioned in verses 46, 48 and 49 of the Saddatthabhedacintā book written by Saddhammasiri Thera, and they are further explained by Sayādaw Ashin Janakābhivaṃsa in his book entitled Bhedacintā-bhāsāṭīkā. They are 1) Sakavāda; 2) Atthasālini; 3) Aparevāda; and 4) Kecivāda.

[1] According to the sakavāda that is the view of the author of Saddabhedacintā, liṅga means a characteristic of clearness (visadākāra), etc. Pullīṅga means the characteristic of clearness (visada), itthiliṅga means the characteristic of non-clearness (avisadākāra), and napuṁsakaliṅga means the characteristic of neither clearness nor non-clearness (nevavisadanāvisada). The activities of going, eating, speaking, etc. of a man are clear and prominent. By looking at the characteristic of clearness, one can know, “this is a man”.

[2] According to Atthasālinī, liṅga means saṅṭhāna (form, appearance, shape). Pullīṅga means big form and shape such as big body shape and big body parts, such as, hands and legs. Itthiliṅga means small saṅṭhāna, whereas napuṁsakaliṅga means middle saṅṭhāna. [3] According to aparevāda, that is the view of other teachers, liṅga means clearness (visada), uncleanness (avisada), etc., in activities like going, etc. Pullīṅga means clearness in the activities like going and sitting. Itthiliṅga means uncleanness in the activities. Napuṁsakaliṅga means neither clearness nor

---

265 Abh-a.1, 10.

Liṅganānattato yathāgahitasaṅṭhānavaṇaṃ ‘ ayāṃ itthī ayāṃ puriso ’ ti uppajjamāṇāya saṅnāya saṅnānānattam.
unclearness in the activities. [4] According to kecivāda, that is the view of some people who are considered lower than the author, the word liṅga means having body structures like a beard, mustache, long hair and so on. The pulliṅga means one who has a beard, moustache and so on. The itthiliṅga means one who has long hair, etc. The napuṃsakaliṅga means one who has neither of these.

According to the definition, “liṅgīyate gamyate purisādidabbaṃ anenāti liṅga”, “Because the substance (dabba) of man, etc, is known by this, thus it is called liṅga.” In the first view, visadākara (characteristic of clearness) can be known when it is seen by other people. This visadākara refers to pulliṅga because one can know clearly, “this is man” by his going, speaking and so forth. Therefore, when comparing these four views in accordance with this definition of liṅga, it is appropriate to suggest liṅga actually means the characteristic of clearness (visadākāra).

**Definition and meaning of liṅga from Sanskrit Dictionary and books**

According to the Sanskrit-English Dictionary, liṅga has various meanings as follows: A mark, spot, sign, characteristic, disguise, evidence, a sign of guilt, a sign of gender, or a symptom of a disease. In a religious sense, it is the image of a god, an idol, a stylized phallus (male organ) especially that of Siva worshiped in the form of a stone or marble column and is set up in temples dedicated to Siva. In logic, it is the invariable mark that proves the existence of anything in an object, as in the proposition “there is fire because there is smoke”. Here the smoke is the liṅga. It is also the inference, conclusion, and reason. In grammar, it is gender, like puṃ-liṅga (masculine gender). Liṅga is similar to prātipadika, the crude base or uninflected stem of a noun. 266

---

266 SED, 901.902.
The Sanskrit word \textit{prātipadika} is equivalent to the word \textit{pāṭipadika} in \textit{Pāli}. According to \textit{Pāṇinī}, a significant form of a word, not being a verbal root (\textit{dhātu}), or an affix (\textit{pratyaya}) is called a \textit{prātipadika} or crude form. Here, the \textit{prātipadika} is the intermediate stage in the development of a full word (\textit{pada}), from the undifferentiated one called dhātu or root. It is the part of a word that is capable of receiving the case-terminations.\footnote{Sharma, \textit{The Introduction to \textit{Aśṭādhyāyī}.} Vol. I, 94. (§45)} In addition, it is written, “Pāṇinian word derivation starts with a nominal stem (\textit{prātipadika}) or a verbal root (\textit{dhātu}) as its base-input and terminates with the derivation of a word (\textit{pada})”.\footnote{Sharma, \textit{The Introduction to \textit{Aśṭādhyāyī}.} Vol. I, 166.}

In other Sanskrit books, an uncompleted word is called a nominal stem that can be further classified as 1.) Nouns (adjectives), 2.)Numerals, and 3.) Pronouns;\footnote{Arthur A. Macdonell, \textit{A Sanskrit Grammar for Students} (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1974), 32.} For stems of nouns and adjectives, they are also called substantive and adjective stems.\footnote{Whitney, William Dwight, \textit{Sanskrit Grammar} (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 2008), 323.} The stem can be divided into various types, like monosyllabic stems or polysyllabic stems, etc.\footnote{Ibid., 317.} Next, according to a Sanskrit grammarian Harivenu Dasa, “An undeclinable form of a \textit{nāma} is called \textit{prakṛti} and is found only in \textit{samāsa} (compound words) or in dictionary entries. To get a word that has grammatical meaning (a \textit{Viṣṇupada}) for using in a sentence, a suffix (called \textit{Viṣṇubhakti}) has to be applied”.\footnote{Ibid., 317.}

Thus, by analyzing the Sanskrit references in several Sanskrit grammar books as recorded in the earlier paragraph, the \textit{liṅga} that is the undeclinable stem of a noun, can be either called 1) \textit{Prātipadika} (\textit{Pāli: Pāṭipadika}) or 2) \textit{Prakṛti} [\textit{Pāli: Pakāti}]. It is translated as a nominal stem in English and its subtypes are the substantive stems and adjective stems.

\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{267} Sharma, \textit{The Introduction to \textit{Aśṭādhyāyī}.} Vol. I, 94. (§45)
\item \textsuperscript{268} Sharma, \textit{The Introduction to \textit{Aśṭādhyāyī}.} Vol. I, 166.
\item \textsuperscript{269} Arthur A. Macdonell, \textit{A Sanskrit Grammar for Students} (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1974), 32.
\item \textsuperscript{270} Whitney, William Dwight, \textit{Sanskrit Grammar} (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 2008), 323.
\item \textsuperscript{271} Ibid., 317.
\item \textsuperscript{272} Harivenu Dasa, \textit{An Introduction Course Based on \textit{Srila Jiva Gosvami’s Grammar}}, (India: Shri Krishna Balarama Mandir, 2000), 20.
\end{itemize}
Explanation from Nirutti-dīpanī

In the Nirutti-dīpanī, Ledi Sayādaw explains, “liṅga, nāma, pātipadikanti atthato ekam”. This sentence means “liṅga, nāma and pātipadika are similar in meaning”. First, he explains that liṅga can be translated as gender and it has three types that are visadarūpa, avisadarūpa, and majjhimarūpa. Next he states, “Tadeva kiñci saddaliṅgūnūrūpaṃ, kiñci atthaliṅgūnūrūpañca pariṇamantaṃ pavattati, tasmā nāmanti ca vuccati”, “because sometimes inclining to saddaliṅga, sometimes inclining to atthaliṅga, thus it is called as nāma.”

The terms saddaliṅga and atthaliṅga should be elaborated here. The word nāma comes from nāmeti (cause to incline) or namati (inclines). When one hears the word purisa, one thinks about the appearance of a man that means the mind inclines to the word purisa, so this is called as saddaliṅga. The meaning of a man, that means the appearance and shape of the man, will cause the mind to incline to it, so this is called as atthaliṅga. Liṅga is assumed to have the meaning of a sign or reason (cause). Next, Ledi Sayādaw writes, “Tadeva dhātu, paccaya, vibhattipadehi cevasaddapadatthakapadehi ca ‘visuṃ bhūtaṃ pada’ nti katvā pātipadikanti ca vuccati”, “Because it is been separated from the dhātu, paccaya, vibhatti as well as saddapadatthaka, it is called pātipadika.” Therefore, pātipadika is not dhātu (root), paccaya (suffix), vibhatti (case ending, inflection) and saddapadatthakapada.

Here, this word saddapadatthaka should be further investigated. It could mean saddapadam eva atthakapadam, (“the word itself is the meaning”). Examples of it are rājassa, sakha, and pumassa. Dhātu, paccaya and vibhatti are also called as saddapadatthakānipada.

---

273Nrt-d. 55.
274Ibid.
Next, Ledi Sayādaws writes: “Anukaraṇapadāni nāma tāni atthissa, karotissa iccādīni viya, tasma tāni ca rājassa iccādīni ca anukaraṇaliṅgabhāvena ettha saṅgayhanti, na ekantaliṅgabhāvenāti”. Just as with anukaraṇapada like atthissa and karotissa, so also the word ‘rāja’ should be taken as anukaraṇaliṅg, not ekantaliṅg (pure stem). For instance, for the word rājassa in the Kaccāyana grammar rule “Rājassa rañño rājino se”, there is no need to translate the word “rājassa”. The word rājassa is actually anukaraṇapada, whereas the word rāja is the anukaraṇalinga, not ekantaliṅg.

In conclusion, pāṭipadika (nominal stem) is not the dhātu, paccaya, vibhatti and saddapadathakapada. Liṅga is similar to pāṭipadika. Liṅga usually means gender, nominal stem, or a word. Nāma is translated as name (for something). That is why Ledi Sayādaw, the author of Nirutti-dīpanī, says the liṅga, nāma and pāṭipadika are similar in meaning.

**Liṅga and Liṅgattha**

The terms liṅga and liṅgattha should be compared. Liṅgattha means liṅgassa attha (the meaning of liṅga). Here, liṅga means a word, whereas liṅgattha is the meaning of the word. Sutta Liṅgattha paṭhama in the Kāraka chapter mentions the paṭhama vibhatti (first inflection) is applied to point out the liṅgattha (the meaning of a word). More elaboration should be given here. It can be assumed that ‘purisa’ is not a real word but ‘puriso’ is a real word. Here, paṭhama-vibhatti is not concerned with kattu (subject) or kamma (object). One needs to put vibhatti ‘si’ or ‘o’ after this stem ‘purisa’ to point out ‘puriso’ is a word (liṅga) [purisa+ si (o)>puriso], or to point out

---

275 Kcc, 92. (§ 2.135)
276 PED, 350. PMR, 581.
277 Sstt, 714. (§ 577)
the meaning of the word *purisa* (*liṅgattha*) is actually an entity (substance) with certain attributes like two legs and two hands.

The sentence “*Puriso odanam khādatī*” can be studied here. Here, the word *puriso* is in the nominative case, *paṭhamavibhatti*. The *paṭhamavibhatti* ‘o’ of *puriso* does not show *kāraka* (subject) or *saṅkhya* (number) because the verbal termination ‘*ti*’ has shown the subject (e.g., third person) and number (e.g., singular) already. Here, *puriso* is called *vutta-kattu*, ‘the subject said by verbal termination ‘*ti*’’. In fact, the word *pacati* has a complete meaning by itself because it indicates: “a person cooks”. It has the *kattu* (subject) and *saṅkhya* (number) and it is also in an active sense. It can be assumed that the addition of *paṭhamavibhatti* after the stem *purisa* is for showing that *purisa* is a word (*liṅga*). Furthermore, Ledi Sayādaw in *Nirutti-dīpanī* also mentions the first inflection is *puṭ* after the noun for (putting out) *liṅgattha*, without considering other meanings like *kattu* (subject), *kamma* (object), etc.\(^{278}\)

In conclusion, the word *purisa* is a nominal stem and *puriso* is a completed word. *Liṅga* is a word, like *purisa*, whereas its *liṅgattha* (the meaning of the *liṅga*) like a substance with certain features like two legs, two hands, etc.

**Conclusion**

According to Venerable Aggavaṃsa, *nipphannapada* (completed word), *anipphannapada* (uncompleted word, stem), *upasagga* and *nipāta* can be termed as *liṅga*. But *dhātu*, *paccaya* and *vibhatti* are not termed as *liṅga*. Next, *liṅga* can also have the meaning of gender that is masculine, feminine and neutral. *Puliṅga* means *visadākāra* (the characteristic of clearness), whereas *itthilinga* means *avisadākāra* (the characteristic of unclearness). Here, the word *ākāra* can have various meanings like state, appearance, manner and characteristic.

\(^{278}\) Nrt-d, 57. Ākkhaṃ *kattu*, kammādikaṃ bāhiraṃ paṭhamavibhatti pavattā nāmasnā paṭhamavibhatti hoti.
The definition of liṅga is “liṅgiyate gamyate purisādidabbaṃ anenāti” (“The dabba (substance) of purisa, etc is to be known.”) Here, liṅgiyate is explained by gamyate (is known). In actual fact, by hearing a word, one can associate it with an entity. Thus, liṅgattha means the meaning of the actual substance (dabba) of that entity, like a living being with two legs and two hands. Next, liṅga is similar to nāma that is the name of many things. That is why Ledi Sayādaw, the author of Nirutti-dīpanī, says the liṅga, nāma and pātipadika are similar in meaning.

Therefore, liṅga is a word that can have many meanings, such as nominal stem, characteristic of clearnesss (visadākāra) and saṇṭhāna (form, appearance). Its meaning changes according to the situation. Liṅgattha is the meaning of liṅga and it indicates the real substance of the word.

4.2 Information on Vibhatti

There are several suttas on vibhatti (case ending, inflection). Sutta no. 198 Syādayo tyādayo ca vibhattiyo states the sadda (word, sound) ‘si’ and so on, and ‘ti’ etc. are called vibhatti. Sutta no. 199 Syādayo nāme, tyādayo ākhyāta states the vibhatti ‘si’ and so on are called nāmavibhatti (noun inflection), whereas the vibhatti ‘ti’ and so on are called ākhyātavibhatti (verbal termination). Sutta no. 200 Si yo aṁ yo nā hi sa namā hi sa namā samiṇ su states there are 14 vibhattis and classifies them into first to seventh types. According to sutta no. 201 Dvīsu dvīsu paṭhamam paṭhamam ekavacanaṃ pacchimam pacchimam bahuvacanaṃ, among the two in one type, the first one is singular and second one is plural.

According to sutta no. 202 Līṅgato tā in the Suttamālā, a vibhatti is added after a liṅga that has a hidden part; vibhatti is not added after a liṅga that has finished form as there is no further task to be accomplished. According to sutta no. 203 Rūḥhanukaranopaggādito ca, vibhatis are put after rūḷhi, anukaraṇa, upasagga
(prefix) and nipāta (indeclinable). 279

Here, the meanings of rūḷhi and anukaraṇa should be elaborated. Rūḷhi is a figure of speech, for instance, Viṭatubho, rukkh. Anukaraṇa is like karotissa (“of the word karoti”), abhissa (“of the word abhi”). In Sanskrit dictionary, anukaraṇa means the act of imitation or following an example, 280 so anukaraṇapada means the word that follows an example. These anukaraṇa words happen mostly in grammar books, for instance, the word karotissa in sutta “Purasamupaparīhi karotissa khakharā vā tappaccayesu ca” in Rūpasiddhi. 281 In examples “caṇḍoraṇaṃ pati” and “nāmo karohi”, pati is upasagga, whereas nāmo is nipāta.

These Suttamālā sutta can be compared with two sutta in Kaccāyana. Sutta named Tato ca vibhattiyo in the Kaccāyana 282 states vibhattis are put after liṅga. Sutta Si yo, aṃ yo, nā hi, sa nam, smā hi, sa nām, smīṃ su states the vibhattis (case-ending) are si yo, aṃ yo, nā hi, sa nam, smā hi, sa nām, smīṃ su. In total, there are 14 vibhattis. By the word ‘ca’ in sutta “Tato ca vibhattiyo” in Rūpasiddhi 283, a vibhatti can also be put after nipāta words that end with tave, tuna. These nipāta words are kātave, kātuna, and katvāna284. In addition, there are 7 vibhattis for dual form in Sanskrit i.e. ‘au’ [nom, voc], ‘bhyam’ [acc, inst, dat] and ‘os’ [gen, loc]. 285 So Sanskrit has 21 vibhattis.

Venerable Aggavaṃsa gives three meanings of a vibhatti in Saddanīti Suttamālā.

---

279 Sstt, 642.
280 SED, 31.
281 Pdr, 360. (§ 7.582)

Pura saṃ upa pariiccetehi karotissa dhātussa kha kharādesā honti vā tappaccaye pare, ṇamhi ca.”

— When followed by ia suffix and ‘qa’, with prefixes pura, saṃ, upa, the root kar becomes kha, khar. Example given is parakkhata, saṅkhata, upakkhata, parikkhāra.

282 Kcc, 60. (§ 2.54)
283 Pdr, 43.
284 Pdr-Ṭ, 150.
285 Whitney, Sanskrit Grammar, 239.
[1.] According to *sutta* “Syādayo tyādayo ca vibhattiyo” in the nāmakappa of the *Suttamālā* states, “Kammādivasena ekattādivasena ca vividhā bhājīya[n]ī ti vibhatti”—They are divided in manifold by the means of *kamma* (object), etc., and singular etc, so, it is called *vibhatti*.

[2.] Next, in the chapter kāraka of *Suttamālā*, the word *vibhatti* can be explained in the following way: “Vibhajitabbā ūṇenāti vibhatti”; It can even be distributed/divided/analysed, [that is to say,] with intellect; hence *vibhatti*.

[3.] “Visesena vividhena vā ākārena bhajanti sevanti naṃ paṇḍitā ti vibhatti.”—Particularly (*visesena*) or in many ways (*vividhena ākārena*) the learned devote themselves to (*bhajanti*), that is, occupy themselves with (*sevanti*) it; hence *vibhatti*.”

Even though a *vibhatti* can be added to *nāma, rūḷhi, upasagga* and *nipāta*, later it can be elided according to *sutta* named “Sabbāsam ākhīyatavajjitopasagganipātādihi ca yathāraham.” In conclusion, Venerable Aggavamśa mentions *vibhattis* are put after *liṅga, rūḷhi, anukarana, upasagga* (prefix) and *nipāta* (indeclinable). Venerable Kaccāyana mentions the *vibhatti* is added after *liṅga*. Venerable Buddhappiya, the author of the *Rūpasiddhi*, states that a *vibhatti* is added after *liṅga* and *nipāta*.

According to the *Kaccāyana-bhāṣāṭīka*287, if *vibhatti* is not added to a word, then the word cannot be a part of a sentence and the word cannot show the natural meaning. People normally do not read or write a word without a *vibhatti*. If the word is combined with a *vibhatti*, the meaning of the word will be obvious.


287 Kacc-ṭ. 378.
The loss of dual form in *Pāḷi*

A comparison on *nāmavibhatti* between *Pāḷi* and Sanskrit should be carried out at this point. Sanskrit has singular, dual and plural numbers, but *Pāḷi* has only singular and dual numbers. According to the book titled *Sanskrit Grammar*, the dual in Sanskrit is used strictly in cases where two objects are logically indicated, whether directly or by a combination of two individuals, like *dāivaṃ ca mānuṣaṃ ca hotārāu vṛtvā*, (“having chosen both the divine and the human sacrificers”). The dual is used alone (without *dva* two) when there is the duality of the objects like *indrasya ḍařī* (“Indra’s two boys”). Thus, the dual form is common in the Sanskrit language. However, the dual form is almost lost in *Pāḷi* and its place is taken by the plural in all declensions.

In the book of *Linguistics in Pāḷi*, the absence of dual form is clearly elucidated as follows.

“The absence of dual form is natural, but not the result of a process of simplification as some suggest. It cannot also be said that in *Pāḷi* there was the dual number that was subsequently dropped since we do not have any proof of such a situation. By rejecting the Brahmin youths’ request to put the Buddha’s words into Chandas (Vedic Sanskrit), and by adopting the local dialects, be it Buddha’s own or Prākṛtic dialects of those times, the master paved the way for simplification which was natural and certainly not arbitrary.”

When compared with the local dialect, such as Prakrit, there is also no dual form in Prakrit. The dative disappears, nominative and accusative plural tend to

---

coincide. The dual number was found unnecessary. Therefore, it is believed that the loss of dual form in Pāli is natural. However, there are some rare dual forms in Pāli, like “Sunantu me āyasmantā” (“May two venerables listen to me”) in Vinaya book. The singular form is āyasmā and the plural form is āyasmanto. It can be said that dve and Ubho are the only regular dual forms existing in Pāli. The examples given are dve cakkhūni (the two eyes) and ubho ante (the two extremes).

4.2 Sutta no. 301. Matantare ge

Sutta no. 301 Matantare ge in the Suttamālā states that when followed by ga (vocative singular), the whole suffix ‘antu’ becomes ‘am’ according to the idea of other teachers, for instance, Bho guṇavam. [guṇavantu+ga>guṇavam] Venerable Aggavaṃsa explains that this change is according to other teachers’ ideas but actually there is no vocative with niggahīta in the Buddha’s teaching. He gives an analogy of this Pāli string “yasassi nam paññavantaṃ visayha” (“O wise one Yasassi, having oppressed.”) Here, the insertion of niggahīta after the word paññavanta is to protect the way to compose metres. The word nam is a nipāta (inclinable) to fulfil the number of words in the sentence. The correct Pāli phrase should be reconstructed as ‘Bho Yasassi paññavanta visayha’.

The view of Venerable Aggavaṃsa is also in accordance with the text in the Jātaka commentary: “Yasassinam paññavantaṃ visayhāti parivārasampattiyā yasassi, paññāsampadāya paññavanta, asayhasāhitāya visayha. Evaṃ tīṇipetāni ālapanāneva. Nanti panettha nipāto. Byaṅjanasiliṭṭhatāvasenantakārassa sānunāsikatā katāti
paccetabbā.” — Yasassi means one who is blessed with retinue and followers, paññavanta means endowed with wisdom and visayha means connected with unbearable. These three are vocative cases, whereas nam is nipāta (indeclinable). The insertion of niggahīta at the end of paññavanta word is for the fluent pronunciation of these letters.

The Pāḷi string “Yasassi nam paññavantam visayha” is extracted from a verse in the Jātaka:

Sabbā kirevaṃ pariniṭṭhitāni, [↑upavajīrā ?]
Yasassinam paññavantamaṃ visayha; [↑upavajīrā ?]
Yaso ca laddhā purimaṃ uḷāram, [upavajīrā]
Nappajjahe vanṇabalam purāṇaṃ. 296 [indravajīrā]

Each pada (line) in this verse is formed by 11 syllables. The pada that is formed by 11 syllables is termed tuṭṭhubham and can be divided into 11 varieties. 297. The preceding three lines can be categorized as upavajīrā (“U—U|——U[U—U|——”), whereas the fourth line is categorized as indravajīrā (“——U|——U[U—U|——”). The line “yasassinam paññavantam visayha” can also be categorised as upavajīrā if the syllable ‘van’ becomes lahu ‘va’ and the final two syllables are of two garus. Then, according to the rhythm of upavajīrā, the insertion of niggahīta after paññavanta to be one garu and also the insertion of nam to add one garu syllable will be logical. Next, the first line “Sabbā kirevaṃ pariniṭṭhitāni” can be categorized as upavajīrā if the final two syllables are of two garus.

The insertion of niggahīta to protect metre seems to be common. A case study of the word “vaṅkambhayā” from the verse “vaṅkambhayā natṭhamanā manussā in

296 J, I, 94.
297 Duroiselle, A Practical Grammar of Pāḷi Language, 124.
the Vimānavatthu (Story of Mansion)\textsuperscript{298} should be performed here. Its commentary elaborates, “Vaṅkāṃbhayāti vaṅkehi bhīṭā. Vaṅkehi bhayaṃ etesanti ‘vaṅkabhayā’\textsuperscript{299} ti vattabbe gāthāsukhatthāṃ sānumāsikaṃ katvā ‘vaṅkāṃbhayā’\textsuperscript{299} ti vuttaṃ”. Here, vaṅkāṃbhāya (“one who has a fear of dangerous places”) is actually formed by “vaṅkehi bhayaṃ etesam”. There is the insertion of niggahīta in between the words vaṅka and bhaya for the easy recitation of this verse. [vaṅka+(m)+bhaya>vaṅkāṃbhāya]

This Suttamālā sutta can be compared with sutta Avaṇṇā ca ge in the Kaccāyana that states that the whole suffix ‘ntu’ with vibhatti becomes ‘aṃ’ or avaṇṇa after ga.\textsuperscript{299} In conclusion, according to Venerable Aggavaṃsa, a niggahīta should not be inserted in the vocative case of a word with suffix ‘ntu’. However, the insertion of niggahīta at the end of a vocative word paññavanta is possible for the fluent pronunciation of the verse.

4.3 Sutta no. 319. Ahamahakaṃ simhi

According to sutta no. 319 Ahamahakaṃ simhi in the Suttamālā\textsuperscript{300}, when followed by a vibhatti ‘si’, the whole word-‘amha’ together with its vibhatti becomes ahaṃ and ahakaṃ. [amha+si>aḥaṃ/ahakaṃ]. This rule can be compared with sutta Tvam-aḥaṃ simhi ca in the Kaccāyana,\textsuperscript{301} that states that the whole words tumha and amha, together with the vibhatti, become tvam and ahaṃ accordingly when followed by vibhatti ‘si’. By the word ca, tumha can also be changed to tuvaṃ. Thus, Suttamālā explains amha can be transformed into two forms: ahaṃ and ahakaṃ, when followed by vibhatti ‘si’, whereas Kaccāyana mentions only one form that is ahaṃ.

\textsuperscript{298}Vv, 11. Vv-a, 315. (Verse no. 1230)
\textsuperscript{299}Vv, 11. Vv-a, 315. (Verse no. 1230)
\textsuperscript{300}Vv, 11. Vv-a, 315. (Verse no. 1230)
\textsuperscript{301}Vv, 11. Vv-a, 315. (Verse no. 1230)

\textsuperscript{299}Kcc, 89. (§ 2.126)
\textsuperscript{300}Sst, 656.
\textsuperscript{301}Kcc, 93. (§2.140)
According to the Padamālā, such form ahakam can be seen in the Pāli phrase, “ahakaṇca cittavasānugā bhāsissam” (I spoke because following the wish of the mind). But this form cannot be found in Nikāyas anymore. However, the word ahakam can be found in the Sanskrit dictionary, and its short form is aham. According to the book Introduction to Prakrit, the first personal singular nominative is derived from the form ahakam or ahakāḥ. Therefore, it can be deduced that the Pāli word ahakam is equivalent to the Prakrit word ahakam or ahakāḥ and also to the Sanskrit word aham.

4.4 Information on the words Santa and Sabbhi

There are a few suttas in the Suttamālā that provide information on the word santa. Sutta no. 380 Syādīsu sabbhi states that the whole santa becomes sabbhi when followed by vibhatti ‘si’, and so on. (santa+si>sabbhi) (santa+yo > sabbhi+yo > sabbhayo, sabbhi) Next, sutta no. 381 Sadabhiditothavā sabbhīti siddhi states the sadā and bhidi root become sab and bhi respectively in order to form the word sabbhi. According to sutta no. 382 Paññattiṃ santassa nto simhi, ‘nta’ of santa, that is used in paññatti (name), is changed to ‘aṃ’ because of vibhatti ‘si’. (santa+si > sam)

The Pāli word santa is a past participle of the verb sammati (√sam+ya+ti) that has two types of meaning: 1) Tired, wearied, exhausted; and 2.) Calmed, tranquil, peaceful, pure. Its root in Sanskrit is √śam (to pacify). The word sabbhi is normally presumed to be an instrumental plural or ablative plural of the word santa. (santa+bhi > sa+bhi > sabbhi) but it also operates as a noun or adjective. For instance,

---

303 This is as in the Chaṭṭhasaṅgīyana CD-ROM, Version 4, by Vipassanā Research Institute
304 SED, 124.
305 Woolner, Introduction to Prakrit, 40.
306 Sstt, 664.
307 PED, 1236.
it is a noun in these Pāḷi texts sabhīhi saddhiṃ (together with wise ones), bho sabhī tiṭṭha (Wise one! You stop.), sabhī tiṭṭhati (The wise one stands) and sabhī saha gacchati (he goes together with a wise one). It is an adjective in asabhīrūpo puriso (The one who looks like evil one). In addition, the Pāḷi word sabhī is equivalent to sadbhī in Sanskrit. Its word formation is santa+bhiḥ>sat+bhiḥ> sad+bhiḥ> sabbhīḥ. In Sanskrit, the root is ṣam [sant>sat>sad+bhiḥ>sadbhiḥ>sabbhi]

According to sutta no. 381 Sadabhiditothavā sabhīti siddhi in the Suttamālā, there is a special word formation sabhī that indicates Nibbāna. The root ṣada (to sink down) is changed to sab, whereas the root ṣhidi (to split, to break) is changed to bhi. [√sad+√hidi>sab+bhi>sabbhi]

In the commentary of Sagāṭhāvagga, this sabhī is also explained as having the meaning of Nibbāna. “Yasmā vā nibbānāṃ āgamma sīdanaḥbhāvā kilesā bhijjanti, tasmā taṃ sabhī ti vuccati.” (“After attaining Nibbāna, the defilement that has the nature of sinking is destroyed, thus Nibbāna is called sabhī.”)

Next, sutta no. 382 Paññattiyaṃ santassa nto simhi states that ‘nta’ of santa in paññatti (name) is changed to ‘am’ because of vibhatti ‘si’. [santa+si>saṃ] The word paññatti is emphasized here because santa does not always change to saṃ, like in the case “santo danto niyato brahmacārī”. Here, santo is not paññatti but it is adjective-quality of peacefulness. Therefore, the previous two suttas in the Suttamālā show that the word santa can be changed to sabhī or saṃ according to the situation.

There is only one sutta in the Kaccāyana regarding santa. This sutta Santasaddassa so bhe bo c’ante in Kaccāyana states the whole word santa becomes ‘sa’ when followed by ‘bha’, and then the letter ‘b’ is inserted in between. [santa>sa+(b)+bha>sabbha] According to sutta santasaddassa so bhe bo cante in

---

308 J.II, 205.
310 Kcc, 110. (§2.185)
Rūpasiddhi\textsuperscript{311}, by the word \textit{ca}, the word \textit{santa} is changed to ‘\textit{sa}’ in a \textit{samāsa} word even if it is not followed by \textit{bha}, for example, \textit{sappurisa}. \[\text{santa}+\text{purisa}\rightarrow \text{sa}+(p)+\text{purisa}\rightarrow \text{sappurisa}\]

Therefore, when compared to \textit{Kaccāyana}, \textit{Suttamālā} provides more facts on the Pāḷi word \textit{santa} because it expresses various possible word formations from \textit{santa}, such as \textit{sabbhi} and \textit{saṃ}, and also \textit{sabbhi} means Nibbāna.

\textbf{4.5 Suffix ‘To’ (Suttas no. 493, 496)}

Sutta no. 493 \textit{Tatiyāpañcamīchaṭṭhīsattamīyatthesu to kvaci} in the \textit{Suttamālā} \textsuperscript{312} states that the suffix ‘\textit{to}’ is sometimes used in the sense of instrumental, ablative, genitive and locative. According to \textit{sutta} no. 496 \textit{Itinā niddisitabbe to} in the \textit{Suttamālā}, the suffix ‘\textit{to}’ indicates that a word that is connected to \textit{iti} is always in the sense of the nominative word. According to \textit{Suttamālā}, the suffix ‘\textit{to}’ can be used in the sense of (1) nominative, (2) instrumental, (3) ablative, (4) genitive and (5) locative.

These \textit{suttas} can be compared to \textit{sutta} \textit{Kvaci to pañcamyatthe} in the \textit{Kaccāyana}\textsuperscript{313} that states suffix ‘\textit{to}’ is sometimes used in the sense of ablative only, for instance, \textit{sabbato}, \textit{yato}, \textit{tato} and so on.

The \textit{Rūpasiddhi}, commentary to \textit{Kaccāyana} explains with more \textit{suttas}. According to \textit{sutta} \textit{Tratothesu ca}, the whole word ‘\textit{kīm}’ becomes ‘\textit{ku}’ when followed by suffixes ‘\textit{tra}’, ‘\textit{to}’ and ‘\textit{tha}’, e.g. is \textit{kuto} ‘from where?’ According to \textit{sutta} \textit{Sabbassetassākāro vā}, the word \textit{eta} becomes ‘\textit{a}’ when followed by suffixes ‘\textit{to}’ and ‘\textit{tha}’, for instance, \textit{ato} ‘from here’. Here, the suffix ‘\textit{to}’ in \textit{kuto} and \textit{ato} is used in the sense of ablative.

Next, in \textit{Rūpasiddhi}, according to \textit{sutta} \textit{E tothesu ca}, the whole word \textit{eta}
becomes ‘e’ when followed by the suffixes ‘to’ and ‘tha’, and the consonant ‘t’ is doubled, for instance, *etto* ‘from this, from it’. The suffix ‘to’ is used in the sense of ablative. According to *sutta* no. 265 *Imassi thaṃdānihatodhesu ca*, the whole word ‘ima’ becomes ‘i’ when followed by the suffixes ‘thaṃ’, ‘dāni’, ‘ha’, ‘to’, or ‘dha’, for instance, *itthaṃ* ‘in this way’, *idāni* (now), *iha* (here), *ito* (from here), and *idha* (here). Here the suffix ‘to’ in *ito* is used in the sense of locative. Next, the suffix ‘to’ in the word *aniccato* is used in the sense of instrumental.314 *Sutta kvaci to pañcamyatthe* in *Rūpasiddhi* 315 further elucidates the suffix ‘to’ is added after all *suddhanāmas* (pure nouns) and *sabbanāmas* (pronouns).

In the *Suttamālā*, Venerable Aggavaṃsa gives many illustrations on the usage of suffix ‘to’.

(1) “*Diṭṭhicaritā rūpaṃ attato upagacchanti*”316 (one with wrong view takes material form as *atta*) and *aniccato vipassanti* (they contemplate as impermanence). The suffix ‘to’ is similar to ‘iti’ and it is used in the sense of nominative.

(2) *Aniccato vipassati* (He contemplates as impermanence), *dukkhato* (He contemplates as suffering). Here, suffix ‘to’ is used in the sense of instrumental.

(3) “*Nāssudha koci bhogānaṃ upaghāto āgacchati rājato vā corato vā aggito vā*” 317 (No wealth is destroyed by the king, thief or fire.) The suffix ‘to’ is used in the sense of ablative.

(4) “Na cāhametaṃ icchāmi, yaṃ pareto dānapaccayā” (I do not wish this being given by others.) The suffix ‘to’ is used in the sense of genitive. Here, pareto means “parassa”.

(5) The suffix ‘to’ in the words ekato, purato, pacchato, passato and piṭṭhito are used in the sense of locative.

Sometimes, these suffixes have many cases, for instance, sabbato, katarato, yato, and tato, are in the sense of instrument, ablative and locative.

According to Kaccāyana-bhāsāṭīkā, the suffix ‘to’ can be used in two senses, that is to say, as ablative (fifth inflection) and in the meaning of liṅga (liṅgattha). It means the suffix points out the actual meaning of liṅga, e.g. aniccato (as impermanent).

According to the book Pāḷi Made Easy, the suffix ‘to’ is added to a noun to express the senses ‘form’, ‘on account of’, ‘in the manner of’ or ‘as’. According to the book Syntax of the cases in the Pāḷi Nikayas, normally the suffix ‘to’ is known as an ablative case. The author clarifies further: “However, the suffix ‘to’ which even in Sanskrit (taḥ) is not considered as a proper ablative ending. It is frequently used in all Nikāyas with all types of nominal stems mostly in an adverbial sense. Here, the suffix ‘to’ expresses a point of view, have the sense of ‘in terms of’ or ‘as’ and can be expressed by the periphrasis vasena as well.” The author also notices the similarity of the suffix ‘to’ with the suffix ‘so’ and vasena. He gives this example of dhātuso: 1) “imameva kāyaṃ dhātuso paccavekkhati” (He considers this very body in terms of the elements.)

318 J.II, 20. (Nimijātaka]
319 Kcc-t, 274.
320 Maitreya, Pāḷi Made Easy, 134.
321 Wijesekera, Syntax of the Cases in the Pāḷi Nikayas, 147, 166-168.
There is also the Pāḷi string ‘catudhāturo ayaṁ, bhikkhu, puriso’ ti vuttāsu dhātūsu atṭhaviṣatisatam dhātuyo honti, yāsaṁ vasena yogāvacaro dvattimśākāram dhātuto parigganḩāti’\(^{322}\). This is translated as “this man, bhikkhu, consists of four elements. 128 elements by means of which the meditator lays hold of the 32 aspects as (to) the elements.”\(^{323}\)

There is another sentence: “Dhātuvāsena tam sajjhāyaṁ karohī’ti vuttepi sace tassa tathā karontassa dhātuto na upaṭṭhāti, vannavasena vā patikālavasena vā upaṭṭhāti”. \(^{324}\) It can be translated as “even though it is said that, ‘recite it (kammaṭṭhāna ‘meditation subject’) by means of element’, if he does it in this way, it does not become manifest to him as an element, but becomes manifest as colour or the repulsiveness.” Therefore, the suffix ‘to’ can be paraphrased with the suffix ‘so’ or vasena and these suffixes have the meaning of ‘as’, ‘by means of’, ‘in terms of’ and ‘by way of’.

In the Kaccāyana and the Rūpasiddhi, the suffix ‘to’ is said to be used in the sense of instrumental, ablative and locative. In the Suttamālā, Venerable Aggavaṃsa says the suffix ‘to’ can be used in the sense of nominative, instrumental, ablative, genitive and locative. When it is used in the sense of nominative, it is used after all types of nominal stems in an adverbial sense as an expression of a philological viewpoint, e.g. aniccato (as impermanent) and dhātuto (as element).

4.6 Sutta no. 448. Sabbāsam ākhyaṭavajjitaṁpasagganipāṭadīhi ca yathārahaṁ

There is a general sutta that states all vibhattis (nominal inflection, case-ending) can be elided. Sutta no. 448 Sabbāsam ākhyaṭavajjitaṁpasagganipāṭadīhi ca

\(^{322}\) Abh-a.II, 25.
\(^{324}\) Abh-a.II, 23.
yathārahaṃ in the Suttamālā states after the four words that exclude ākhyāta (verb), all vibhattis of first to seventh case-ending, and of singular and plural are elided according to the situation. Here, the four words are nāma (noun), ākhyāta (verb), upasagga (prefix) and nipāta (indeclinable particle), whereas ādi indicates ruñhi and nāmapada. Therefore, this sutta states after nāma, upasagga, nipāta and ruñhi, all vibhattis can be elided accordingly. This Suttamālā sutta can be compared with the Sabbāsamāvusopasagga-nipātādihi ca sutta in the Kaccāyana that states all vibhattis that are used after āvuso, upasagga, nipāta and so on are elided.

Regarding upasagga and nipāta, Venerable Aggavaṃsa gives various examples in the Suttamālā. The upasaggas are like pati and anu in the “Sūriyassuggamanam pati” (Depending on the arising of the sun) and “Ayam bhikkhu anu Sāriputta paññavā” (This monk is lower than Venerable Sāriputta in terms of knowledge). These anu and pati are termed as kammappavacanīya because they are not linked to a verb but to a noun. Here, anu is a subtype called hīnattha (meaning of inferiority) because it points out this monk is inferior to venerable Sāriputta in terms of knowledge. After the anu and pati, the vibhatti is elided.

Next, Venerable Aggavaṃsa puts forward his opinion of the existence and usage of a vibhatti after upasagga and nipāta.

His opinion is not the same as that of venerable Mahā Kaccāyana, the author of Niruttipīṭaka, who says all 20 upasaggas do not have vibhatti, and some nipātas have vibhattis. In the viewpoint of Venerable Aggavaṃsa, some upasaggas can be associated with vibhattis. It is said all upasaggas are without vibhattis in all verbs like pabhavati and parābhavati, and the upasagga have a vibhatti in all samāsas

325 Sstt, 672-674.
326 Kcc, 122. (§ 2. 221)
327 Kcc-En, 25.
328 J.II, 31. (Hemavanta)
(compound words). The use of nipāta should be understood in the same way as upasagga. Examples of nipātas given in this sutta are atthi and sakkā in “atthi dhanām” (“there is wealth”), “sattavo jetum sakkā” (“able to conquer the beings”) and also in samāsa “atthi khīraṃ etissāti attikhīra” (“one who has milk, so he is called attikhīra”). After the words sakka and atthi, vibhatti ‘si’ is elided.

In the Suttamālā, the examples of nāmapada given by Venerable Aggavaṃsa are such as “atthīti asa, sīdatīti satā”. Vibhatti-‘si’ is elided after the noun asa and sata.

This sutta in the Suttamālā can be compared with sutta sabbāsamaṇṇapagāpanipātādīhi ca in Rūpasiddhi329. According to this sutta, the word ādi includes sutta, pada and so on. According to Rūpasiddhi-bhāṣāṭīkā,330 in the grammar rule Vibhāgedhā ca sutta331, the words sutta and pada actually mean suttaso and padaso and the instrumental vibhatti ‘na’ is elided after them. These are called abyaya-taddhita because they are not normal taddhita and their forms are not be changed due to case-ending, genders and numbers. As most nipātas (indeclinable) are only singular, the word āvuso indicates the inclusion of both singular and plural number of nipāta332 in this sutta, for instance, tvaṃ āvuso [singular], tumhe āvuso [plural].

Ākhyāta

Next, Venerable Aggavaṃsa provides the reason for his exception on akhyāta (verb) in this sutta. It might be misunderstood that the case-ending can be put after

---

329 Pdr, 132. (§2.282)
330 Pdr-ṭ, 312.
331 Kcc, 208. (§2.397)
332 Pdr-ṭ, 312.
verbs according to the examples “karotissa\textsuperscript{333}, hotissa and so on. Such verbs are taken
by the grammarians as a \textit{rūlhi} word, not a verb. This \textit{karoti} is actually \textit{karotidhātu},
and it can be defined as “\textit{karoti ca sā dhātu ca}”. The vibhattis can also be elided after
the \textit{rūlhi} words \textit{karoti}, \textit{hoti} and so on. [\textit{karoti+si+dhātu+si>karotidhātu}] However,
it is said in \textit{Nirutti-dīpanī}, anukaraṇapadāni nāma tāni atthissa, karotissa iccādīni
viya,\textsuperscript{334} this karotissa word is termed as anukaraṇapada.

\textbf{Upasagga and kammappavacaniya}

\textit{Rūpasiddhi-bhāṣātika}, \textsuperscript{335} offers this definition of \textit{upasagga}: “\textit{Upecca
namañca ākhātaṃva sajjanti laganti iti upasagga}.” “It approaches and attaches to
noun and verb, thus it is called \textit{upasagga}.” Normally, an \textit{upasagga} exists before a
root.

Among the 20 \textit{upasaggas}, the four types \textit{pati}, \textit{pari}, \textit{anu}, \textit{abhi} can exist before
or after the noun. Examples of \textit{upasaggas} that exist after a noun are
“\textit{sūriyuggamanam pati}” (together with sun arising), “\textit{rukkham pati vijjotate cando}”
(the moon shines at the tree), “\textit{sādhu devadatto mātaram anu}” and “\textit{sādhu devadatto
mātaram abhi}”\textsuperscript{336} (Devadatta is good to the mother)

Actually, an \textit{upasagga} does not exist after a verb. The remaining 16
\textit{upasaggas} can exist before a noun. These four \textit{pati}, \textit{pari}, \textit{anu} and \textit{abhi} are not called
as \textit{upasagga} but are termed as \textit{kammappavacaniya}.

Particles such as \textit{pa}, \textit{para} and \textit{pati} can be linked to verbs and nouns and can
be called either \textit{upasagga} (prefix) or \textit{kammappavacaniya}. When a particle links to a
verb, it is called \textit{upasagga}. It will change the meaning of the verb accordingly, for

\textsuperscript{333} \textit{Kcc}, 279. (§ 2.595)
\textit{Tave tunādīsu kā, Tave tunaicevamādīsu paccesu karotissa dhātussa kāādeso hoti vā. Kātave,
kātum, kattum vā, kātuna, kattuna vā.}
\textsuperscript{334} \textit{Nrt-d}, 56.
\textsuperscript{335} \textit{Pdr-ṭ}, 312-315.
\textsuperscript{336} \textit{Srd-ṭ}, 21.
example, *nisīdati* and *pasīdati* include same verb ‘*sīdati*’, but their meanings are different. *Nisīdati* means to sit, whereas *pasīdati* means to become bright. When a particle links to a noun, it is called *kammappavacanīya*.

In the book *Pāṇiniś as Grammarian, karmapravacanīya* is said to be “the designation of such a particle as is not connected with a verb, but acts as adnominal governing a noun to that it introduces a particular case-suffix”. The *Mahābhāṣya* further defines it as that “which expresses the action of a word not actually stated”. For example, in the sentence Śākalyasya samhitām any prāvarṣat, “it rained after (the recitation of the Vedic text of Śākalya), *anu* expresses the unstated action ni-śam ‘to hear’ and establishes the cause and effect relationship between the recitation (samhitām) and raining (prāvarṣat)”.

*Nipāta*

It is said in *Niruttī dīpanī, Niccaṃ ekarūpena vākyapathe patantīti nipātā.* *Padānaṃ ādi, majjhā’ vasānesu nitantīti nipātātipi vadanti*. Nipātas means they always fall in the same form in the range of a sentence. It falls in the beginning, middle and ending of words.

According to the *Rūpasiddhi-bhāṣāṭīka*, nipātas can exist in three places: beginning, middle and end of a noun. The occurrence of nipātas ‘*a*’ and ‘*mā*’ are only at the initial position, like aṇṇātaṃ (is not known) and mā hevam Ānanda, (Not so, Ānanda!). The ‘*ca*’ and ‘*vā*’ nipātas only occur in the middle or ending position, e.g. ‘samaṇo ca, samaṇo vā, eso ca samaṇo, eso vā samaṇo’. Vā at the initial position can only be found in the grammar rule ‘Vā paro asarūpā’ of Pāli grammar book.

---

338 Nrt-d, 16.
339 Ibid.
340 D.II, 47.
Kaccāyana, etc. but not in the Buddha’s teachings. For this reason, the definition of nipāta is ‘padānaṃ ādimajjhaantesu nipatanti’ which means “because falling at beginning, middle or end of words, they are called nipāta.”

In fact, nipāta means “evaṃ nāmākhyātopasaggavinimuttam yadabyayalakkhaṇam, taṃ sabbaṃ nipātapadanti veditabbā.”

“Nipāta is a word that is not nāma (noun), ākhyāta (verb) and upasagga (prefix, preposition) and has the characteristic of undestroyable”). It is undestroyable because it is not changed by 3 genders (liṅga), 7 vibhattis and 2 numbers (singular and plural). There are many words that can be termed as nipātas, e.g. suttaso, padaso, aniccato, dukkhto, ekadhā, dvidhā.

Rūḍhi

According to the Pāli-English Dictionary published by Pāli Text Society, rūḍhi (Sanskrit rūḍhi) means figuratively what has grown by custom, tradition or the popular meaning of a word. Rūḍhi-saddena means in popular language, ordinary speech, customarily, or commonly speaking. According to the Monier’s Sanskrit-English dictionary, rūḍhi means tradition, custom, general prevalence or current usage (esp. of speech); (in rhetoric), the more amplified, popular or conventional meaning of words; or the employment of a word in such a meaning. According to Professor Pe Maung Tin, rūḍhi means growth or metaphor.

According to the Pāli-Myanmar dictionary, the definition for rūḍhi is “Dabbam ruhati anugacchattī rūḍhi” (It puts on and follows a substance, thus it is called rūḍhi.) The next definition is “dabbassa vā upari ruhitabbā ārotitabbāti rūḍhi”, (It should be put above a substance, and thus it is called rūḍhi.) The next definition is

---

341 Pdr, 13.
342 PED, 1048.
343 SED, 885.
“nimitte sati vā asati vā dabbe ruhati gacchati pavattaṭī vā, ruḷhi”. 345 (When there is a sign or no sign, it climbs, goes and occurs on a substance.) These show that ruḷhi is something one puts on an object and it can be a name or a usage.

The examples given in sutta no. 203 Rūḷhanukaranopassaggādito ca in the Suttamālā are Viṭatubho, yevāpanaka (what else), disā (direction), ruca (rukkha, tree). Here Viṭatubho is a personal name or proper name, whereas the rest of examples are a usage of a normal noun.

According to the book Sāratthajālinīnissaya, there are two types of ruḷhi:

There are two types of nāma (noun): 1) Anvatthanāma that follows the meaning, and 2) Ruḷhināma that is called according to view or thinking. For the words go and mahiṃsa, their definitions are: gachatīti go ‘cow’ (It goes, so it is called go) and māhiyāṃ setīti mahiṃsa346 (It sleeps on the earth, thus called mahiṃsa ‘buffalo’). Even though these words go and māhiṃsa follow the meaning and are termed as anvatthanāma, the actions of sleeping and going can also happen with other beings, so these words can be called as ruḷhināma.347

Therefore, ruḷhi is a usage or name people put on some entity that they see and it is given as according to culture and tradition. It can be a word to label an entity such as go [Pāli], cow [English], lembu [Malay], or a personal name such as Vessantara and Gotamī.

Conclusion

By studying the various references provided above, it can be deduced that all vibhattis with seven case-endings, and also both singular and plural, can sometimes be elided after the words nāma (noun), upasagga (prefix), nipāta (indeclinable), ruḷhi

345 PMD, 680.
346 Srdṭ-II, 31.
347 Ashin Paṇḍitābhivaṃsa, Sāratthajālinīnissaya (Yangon: Mahābodhi, 2010), 35.
and anukaraṇapada.

4.8 Suffixes that indicate time, and Yasmā, tasmā, kasmā that indicate reason

There are a few general suttas discussing on suffixes that indicate the time. According to sutta no. 505 Kiṃ sabbaññekeṣu kāle dādāṇaṁ in the Suttamālā, after the words kiṃ, sabba, aṅña, eka, ya, ku, the suffixes ‘dā’ and ‘dācanaṁ’ are added in the sense of locative and to indicate the time. According to sutta no. 506 Tamhā dādāni, the suffixes ‘dā’ and ‘dāni’ are added after the word ‘ta’. According to sutta no. 507 Idato rahidhungādāni in the Suttamālā, the suffixes ‘rahi’, ‘dhunā’ and ‘dāni’ are added after the word ida, e.g. etarahi, adhunā, idāni.

These suttas can be compared with a few suttas in the Kaccāyana. Sutta Kiṃ-sabb-aṅṅa-eka-ya-kuhi dā-dācanaṁ states that after the words ‘kiṃ, sabba, aṅña, eka, ya, ku’, the suffix ‘da’ is added in a locative sense and to indicate the time. For instance, kadā, sabbadā, aṅṅadā, ekadā, yadā, kudācanaṁ. According to sutta Tamhā dāni ca, the suffixes ‘dā’ and ‘dāni’ added after ‘ta’ are in the locative case and indicate the time, for instance, tadāni, tadā. According to sutta Imasmā rahidhunā-dāni ca in the Kaccāyana, the suffixes rahī, dhunā and dāni added after ima are in the sense of locative case and signify time, for instance, etarahi, adhunā, idāni. According to sutta Kiṃsabb-aṅṅekayakṣi dā dācanaṁ in the Rūpasiddhi, the suffix ‘dā’ that is added after all pronouns ‘kiṃ, sabba, aṅña, eka, ya, ku’. The suffix ‘dācana’ that is placed after ‘ku’ indicates the time and in the sense of locative. Therefore, the suffixes ‘dā’, ‘dācana’, ‘dāni’, ‘rahi’ and ‘dhunā’ are used to indicate the time.

---

348 Sstt, 682-683.
349 Kcc, 132. (§ 2.257, 2.258. 2.259)
350 Pdr, 12. (§ 2.276)
351 Pdr, 12. (§ 2.276)
In addition, according to sutta Ajjasajjuparajjetarahikarahā in Nirutti-
dīpanī,\textsuperscript{352} the suffixes ‘jja’, ‘jju’, ‘rahi’ and ‘raha’ can be used to indicate time, for instance, ajja (today), sajju (the same day, instantly), aparajju (the next day), etarahi (now) or karahaci (ka+rahi+ci) (seldom).

\textit{Yadā kāle}

In the \textit{Suttamālā}, Venerable Aggavaṃsa provides more discussion on the words \textit{yadā}, \textit{tadā} and \textit{sadā} as well on \textit{yasmā}, \textit{tasmā} and \textit{kasmā}. He is of the opinion that \textit{yadā}, \textit{tadā} and \textit{sadā} should not be linked with the word \textit{kāle} for the following two reasons. 1) The suffixes ‘dā’ and ‘dāni’ indicate the meaning of time. 2) This linking \textit{e.g.} \textit{yadā kāle} is not seen in the \textit{Tipiṭaka} or the commentaries. According to the commentary of \textit{Cariyāpiṭaka} (‘yadāti yasmiṃ kāle’)\textsuperscript{353}, the interpretation of \textit{yadā} is \textit{yasmiṃ kāle}, therefore, \textit{yadā} should not be linked with \textit{kāle}.

\textit{Yasmā kāraṇā, tasmā kāraṇā, kasmā}

Then Venerable Aggavaṃsa compares the linking of the two words \textit{yadā+kāle} with the linking of two words \textit{yasmā+kāraṇā}. He says \textit{yasmā} and \textit{tasmā} should not be joined with the word \textit{kāraṇā} ‘cause, reason’ for two reasons. Firstly, \textit{yasmā}, \textit{tasmā} and \textit{kasmā} are \textit{nipāta} words that show the meaning of cause, therefore, they do not need to be linked with \textit{kāraṇā}. The second reason is that these two joined words “\textit{yasmā+kāraṇā}” can only be found in some \textit{yojana} books, not in \textit{Tipiṭaka} and commentaries. In there, some teachers use “\textit{yasmā kāraṇā}”, etc., as a translation or interpretation and this linking-“\textit{yasmā+kāraṇā}” is not handed down in the common language.

In addition, it is recorded “\textit{Yasmāti yasmā kāraṇā, yena kāraṇena vā}” in the

\textsuperscript{352}Nrt-d, 15. (§ 2. 287)
\textsuperscript{353}Cp-a, 21.
Pācityādiyojanā. Here, yasmā is explained as ‘yasmā kāraṇā’. In the Mahāniddesa, there is the line “Tasmā hi sikkhetha idheva jantūti. Tasmāti taṃkāraṇā tamhetu tappaccayā tannidānā”. Here, tasmā means “because of that cause” (taṃ kāraṇā). In the Rūpasiddhi, yasmā, tasmā, tathāhi and tena are said to show the delimitation of reason, whereas kasmā is a question asking for a reason. That is why yasmā and tasmā should not be linked with kāraṇā.

However in the Suttamālā, Venerable Aggavaṃsa explains that when a cause such as ignorance is mentioned in the field of ultimate truth (paramatthavohāra), at that time “tasā kāraṇā” should be mentioned. This has the meaning of “tato hetuto” (because of this). As such, yasmā kāraṇā, tasmā kāraṇā, etc. should not be said in the lokavohāra (worldly language). In fact, tasmā has two meanings. 1.) A pronoun in the ablative case; and 2.) Conjunction (“therefore”, “so”, “thus”). Here, if tāsmā has the first meaning, then it can be linked with kāraṇā. If tasmā has the second meaning as a conjunction, then it cannot be linked to kāraṇā.

4.7 Peyyāla method (sutta no. 508)

According to sutta no. 508. Sabbassa dāmhi so vā in the Suttamālā, sabba becomes sa when followed by the suffix ‘dā’. (sabba+dā=sadā) This sutta in the Suttamālā can be compared with sutta Sabbassa so dāmhi vā in the Kaccāyana that states the whole sabba becomes ‘sa’ when followed by suffix ‘da’.

In the Suttamālā, Venerable Aggavaṃsa provides more discussion on the word “sabbadā” in the text “sabbabuddhānubhāvena.... sabbadā sadā sotthi bhavantu te” as recorded in some book of protective discourses. In his opinion, this is unsuitable because there should only be “sadā sotthi bhavantu te” without the word

354 Pet-a-y, 43.
356 Sstt, 682.
357 Kcc, 232. (§ 2. 260)
sabbadā. Sabbadā and sadā are not synonymous in this place and should not be compared with the synonyms idāna and etarahi in “appam vassasatam āyu, idānetarahi vijjati”. The another version as recorded in Pubbañhasutta that is a part of Mahāparitta “Great protective verses” is “sadā sukhī bhavantu te”.

Peyyāla method

According to a Pālī English Dictionary, peyyāla means repetition, succession, formula; way of saying, phrase (=pariyāya) and it is very frequently used in abridged form, such as where “etc.” is used to indicate that a passage has be to repeated (either from preceding context, or to be supplied from memory, if well known). The other version is piyāla and peyāla.358

It is the sign of abridgment, known as ‘pe’. It is written as ‘pe’ or ‘la’ in Myanmar manuscripts, and now written as “pa”. Its Sanskrit equivalent is Paryāya. Its literal meaning is “here (follows) the formula (pariyāya).”359 The word formation is pari+ √ i>pari+aya>pari+(y)aya>pariyāya] According to Pālī Text Society, peyyāla is a popular corruption of the synonymous pariyāya, passing through payyāya, with --eyy- for --ayy-, like seyyā [Skt. Śayyā]. [pariyāya>payyāya>peyyāya> peyyāla]. 360

In the Suttamālā, Venerable Aggavaṃsa mentions that there are three types of peyyāla. One of them is sabbapeyyālaka method. He explains the appropriateness of the recitation of the Pālī line “Sabbadā sadā sotthi bhavantu te” for two reasons: 1) Because this method is not according to teachers’ edited books; and 2) Because of extra letters in the verses (gāthā). Here, the phrase “sadā sotthi bhavantu te” has 8 syllables. Then, this line would have 11 syllables with the addition of 3 syllables of

358 PED,605, 876.
359 Ibid.

According to the book The Philology of the Pālī Language, the interchange of consonant ‘y’ with ‘l’ is possible, like yaṣṭi>latthi and parāyāya>peyyāla.
‘sabbadā’. Venerable Aggavaṃsa wants to clarify that this sabbadā word is actually a peyyāla method. In some ancient books, this line “sabbasamghānubhāvena sabba sadā sotthi bhavantu te” is recorded. Here, this word sabba without ‘dā’ is actually is the sabbadā method.

This line ‘sadā sotthi bhavantu te’ should be linked as the fourth line after the individual lines sabbabuddhānubhāvena, sabbadhammānubhāvena and sabbasamghānubhāvena. That means that this word sabba indicates this Pāli line should be added everywhere (sabbadā) as the fourth line of a verse. The protective verses should be expanded in this way:

1.)Bhavantu sabbam maṅgaḷaṃ  2.)Bhavantu sabbam maṅgaḷaṃ  3.)Bhavantu sabbam maṅgaḷaṃ
Rakkhantu sabbadevatā,  Rakkhantu sabbadevatā,  Rakkhantu sabbadevatā,
Sabbabuddhānubhāvena  Sabbathammānubhāvena  Sabbasaṅghānubhāvena
Sadā sotthi bhavantu te.  Sadā sotthi bhavantu te.  Sadā sotthi bhavantu te.

Then, Venerable Aggavaṃsa gives an illustration of two other types of peyyāla. Actually, there are three methods of peyyāla: 1) Majjepeyyāla – is the peyyāla that is pointed out with the word iti. It means that the beginning and ending words of a sentence are taken up but the middle part is elided; 2.) Ādipeyyāla is the peyyāla that is pointed out with the word ‘ādi’; the beginning part of the sentence is shown only, whereas the ending part is indicated with the word ‘ādi’; 3.) Sabbapeyyālaka – This peyyāla method is pointed out with the word sabba. This refers to the sabbapeyyālaka method as mentioned above.

One case study given in this Suttamālā sutta is the very first Pāli sentence in the Visuddhimagga ‘The Path of Purification’. “Sīle patiṭṭhāya naro sapañño, cittam
paññaña ca bhāvayaṃ; Ātāpī nipako bhikkhu, so imaṃ vijaṭaye jaṭanti.361 “When a wise man, established well in virtue, develops concentration and insight, then as a bhikkhu ardent and sagacious, he succeeds in disentangling this tangle.” Here, the Aggavaṃsa made the reference to the above Pāḷi sentence by this sentence: “Yo Paṭisandhipaññāya paññavā ātāpī nipako hutvā sīle patiṭṭhāya samādhiñceva vipassanañca bhāveti, so taṅhājaṭaṃ chinditvā nibbānappatho hoti, Tenāha Bhagavā.”

This majjhepyyāla is shown by “Tenāha bhagavā ‘sīle patiṭṭhāya. Pa. so imaṃ vijaṭayejaṭa’nti”. The ādipeyyāla is shown by “Tenāha Bhagavā: sīle patiṭṭhāyati ādi”. Here, ‘pa’ indicates that the words should be added and expanded accordingly.

Therefore, Venerable Aggavaṃsa explains three types of peyyāla in this sutta Sabbassa dāmhi so vā. This explanation is not found in Kaccāyana and Rūpasiddhi.

Chapter V

Suttas that exist only in the Nāmakappa of Suttamālā

5.1 Sutta no. 223. Pituss’ulopo nāmhi, nāssa cayā vā

According to this sutta, when the vowel ‘u’ of pitu is elided, the vibhattis ‘nā’ and ‘nā’ become ‘yā’, for instance, “matyā ca pityā ca katam satādu” (“having done well by mother and father.”) [pitu+nam>pit+yā>pityā] Although pitu is a masculine form, here pityā is similar to feminine forms like hetuyo, jantuyo, adhipatīyā.

There are two possible word stems that are pitu and piti from the Sanskrit root √pitr. When added with the instrumental case, the final vowel ‘i’ becomes consonant ‘y’. [√pitr>piti+ā>pity+ā>pityā] The word form petyā is found in the Tipiṭaka, as in “matyā ca petyā ca katam satādu.” Its commentary further explains as “tattha matyā ca petyā cātī mātarā ca pitarā ca”362, thus petyā means pitarā in the instrumental case.

5.2 Sutta no. 254. Aggimhi agginīti ginīti ca

The word aggi becomes agginī or gini, and these two can be found in Pāli texts. This gini word can be seen in Jātaka, “tameva kaṭṭhaṁ dhati, yasmā so jāyate gini”364 (“The fire borns from the wood burns that wood only.”) Its commentary explains as such “Yasmāti yato kaṭṭha jāyati, tameva dhati. Giniṭi aggi.”,365 thus gini is similar with aggi.

362 J.II, 40.
363 J-a-V, 225.
364 J.II, 108.
365 J-a.VI, 27.
From the philological viewpoint, the loss of an initial vowel is common. Examples given in Niruttidīpanī are lābu=alābu, pidhānaṃ=apidhānaṃ and dvāram pidahitvā=apidahitvā. Such elision is common in Sanskrit, for instance, snuṣā=husā (daughter-in-law), uposatha=posatha (Observance day).

5.3 Sutta no.255. Sattva sattavāti

The word Satta can be changed to sattava, viz. tvaṃca uttamasaṭṭavo (“you are the noblest being”). Its Sanskrit word is sattva. Since triple consonants ‘ṭtva’ do not exist in Pāḷi, the weakest is dropped and assimilation takes place whenever possible. By dropping the ‘v’ that is the weakest consonant, the Pāḷi word satta can be obtained. [sattva>satta] The other possible word formation is insertion of the vowel ‘a’ in between the triple consonants, so sattva is changed to sattava. ([sattva>sattava]

5.4 Udaka, daka, ka [Sutta no. 256 and 257]

According to sutta no.256. Udake dakanti kanti ca, the Pāḷi word udaka can be changed either daka or ka, for example, dakajā pupphā (the flower born in the water) or kantāraṃ nīthiṇṇo (cross over the desert). Here, kantāra is formed by kaṃ+ṭāra.

According to the next sutta, no. 257. Udakassa kvaci kalopo ca, ka of udaka is sometimes elided, like udaka+dhi>udadhī (ocean). Next, the Vinaya commentary says “Kaṃ udakaṃ tārenti etthāti kantāro, nirudako araṇṇappadeso”. Kaṃ means udaka (water), whereas tāra comes from tāreti. So, kaṃ+tāra means crossing over water, or nirudaka (no water).

---

366 Nrt-d., 16.
370 D.II, 70.
371 Srd-t.I, 293.
In conclusion, these two suttas show that the alternative forms of udaka are uda, daka and ka.

5.5 Sutta no. 368. Ā ca tiliṅge

When followed by vibhatti ‘nam’ (genitive plural or dative plural), the pronoun ‘ta’ becomes ‘ā’ after all genders, for instance  nāsam kujhanti paṇḍitā (“the wise one is not angry with them.”) and sabbāsam soka vinassanti (“all their sorrows disappear”). [ta+nam>ā+sam>āsam] [sabbe+āsam] The purpose of this sutta is to show that āsam does not only apply to the feminine gender.

5.5 Sutta no. 377. Aṃvacanasso

The “aṃ” (accusative case) after mano group becomes ‘o’, e.g. kassapassa vaco sutvā (“after hearing the word of venerable Kassapa”), tapo idha Krubbasi. (“one did asceticism here.”) According to sutta Manādīhi smiṃsamnāmmanam sisoosāsā in the Niruttī-dīpanī372, after the mana group, the vibhattis-‘smi, sa, aṃ, nā, smā’ become ‘si, so, o, sā and sā’ respectively.

From the philological standpoint, the Pāli word mana is similar in Sanskrit and it is analysed as √man+as>manas. According to The Philology of Pāli, the ending letter ‘s’ becomes ‘ḥ’ and then ‘ah’ becomes ‘o’. This change takes place in Pāli when either the letters ‘s’ or ‘ḥ’ are at the end of a word, or the word is followed by a vowel or consonant. [manas>manāḥ>mano]373

5.6 Sutta no. 389. Āyasmantuto niccaṃ yvā dvīsu

When referring to two bhikkhus (monks) in Vinaya, nominative-‘yo’ after the word “āyasmantu” becomes ‘ā’, e.g. “sunantu me āyasmantā.” (“May two venerable

372 Nrt-d, 80. (No. 115)
373 Chaudhuri, The Philology of the Pāli Language, 36.
listen to me.”) However, āyasmanto refers to more than two monks. In addition, according to the rule Himavato vā o in the Payogasiddhipāṭhā374, the vibhatti ‘si’ after himavantu becomes ‘o’ or ‘vā’, and the word āyasmantu in the kammavāca becomes āyasmantā (dual) or āyasmanto (plural).

According to Venerable Aggavaṃsa, there are many words ending with the suffix ‘ntu’ such as guṇavantu and satimantu. The forms guṇavantā and satimantā (in dual) can be understood as the dual form āyasmantā but they do not exist in original Pāli. He says the forms āyasmanto and arahanto do not exist in the texts as plural forms but only as a singular form, whereas santo and ayyo are seen in both singular and plural forms.

5.7 Sutta no. 453. Vajjadasyādīnamino anayosmiṇsūsu

The ending letter of vajjadassī, etc. becomes ‘ina’ when followed by vibhattis-‘āṃ, yo, smim, su’; for instance, yasassinaṃ passati [acc] (“he sees one who has retinue”), yassassine paṭṭihitaṃ (“established in one who has retinue”, [loc]). [yasassī+āṃ>yassassināṃ] This method can be applied to various masculine words like sikhī, karī by the pajjunnagati (the method of rain). Just as everywhere will become wet when there is falling rain, so also even though this sutta gives only a few examples, it can cover many word forms.

There exist many words ending with a consonant in Sanskrit but not in Pāli. Thus, it is easy through Sanskrit to explain how the ‘ī’ becomes ina, or ‘ā’ becomes ana. The accusative case-‘āṃ’ is added to a word ending with ‘in’ or ‘an’, e.g. Vijjadassīnaṃ >vijjadassināṃ (knowledge and vision) [acc] and ātmanāṃ+āṃ > attanāṃ (self) [acc]. That is why the Pāli word vijjadassī becomes vijjadassināṃ and attā becomes attanāṃ in the accusative case.

374 Pyg-s, 60. (§153)
5.8 Sutta no. 454. Puṇṇamāto smiṇṇo āye gāthāyam

According to this sutta no. 454, in the verses, the vibhatti ‘smiṇṇ’ after the word puṇṇamā becomes ‘āye’. For instance, puṇṇamāye yathā cando375 (“just as the moon in the full moon day”). [puṇṇamā+smiṇṇ>punṇamā+āye>punṇamāye] According to the Saddanīti Padamālā, puṇṇamāye actually derived from puṇṇamāya [loc]. Just like viratta (dispassioned) is changed to viratte in Rādhajātaka (“abyayatam vilapasi viratte kosiyāyane”), so also, puṇṇamāya becomes puṇṇamāye376.

5.9 Sutta no. 455. Lajjito tabbassa savibhattikassa tāye

In these verses, the suffix ‘tabba’ after the word lajjī becomes ‘tāye’ together with vibhatti ‘smiṇṇ’, and this also applies to the alajjī word, e.g. alajjītāye lajjīnti. (“They are ashamed of what should not be ashamed”). [lajjī+tabba+smiṇṇ>lajjitāye]

There are many future kicca kita passive participle suffixes, such as tabba (Skt: tavya), anīya or aneyya, tāya, tayya, teyya. A few examples are nāteyya, daṭṭhāyya, pattayya (“that which is to be known, seen, attained.”) and lajjītāya (“that which one has to be ashamed of”). Other examples are hañña (=hanitabba, “he who should be killed”), labba (attained, possible) and vajja (“that which should be avoided”, sin)377. Thus, the suffix ‘tabba’ can be interchanged with ‘tāya’ in this sutta.

5.10 Sutta 459. Ko iti samāse nāme

In the samāsa (compound word), the word kiṃ becomes ko when followed by ‘nāma’ word, e.g. konāmo puriso[masc] (“what is the man’s name?”), konāmā itthi [fem] (“what is the woman’s name?”), konāmaṇī kulam. [neut] (“what is the name of family/clan?”). [kiṃ+nāma>konāma] According to the viggaha (sentence definition)

375 Bv.II, 32.
Puṇṇamāye yathā cando, parisuddho virocati; Tattheva tvam puṇṇamano, viroca dasasahassiyam.
376 Spd, 32.
“kīdisaṃ nāmaṃ yassāti kinnāmo, ‘konāmo’” in Niruttī-dīpanī, konāma means kinnāmo (one who has of what name) and it is a chaṭṭhībahubbīhi. On the other hand, konāmo is the variant reading of kinnāmo.

5.11 Sutta no. 491. Amha-tumhānaṃ tomhi mama tava

When followed by the suffix ‘to’, the whole words amha and tumha become mama and tava, like in mamato apeti (“goes away from me”), tavato apeti (“go away from you”). In fact, there are already genitive or dative suffixes in mama and tava. According to the Padamālā (“tavato mamato tuyham-mayhaṃsaddāva sāsane”), mama means mayhaṃ (to me, mine), whereas tava means tuyham (to you, yours) in the Buddha’s teaching.

However, the suffix ‘to’ is added as an ablative case after these words mama and tava, for instance, the Pāḷi sentence “iddhiyā itthi māpeti, mamatopi surūpini” (“He (Lord Buddha) created a woman by psychic power (and she) more beautiful than me”). By pāḷigati (the way of Pāḷi syntax method), there can be “tavatopi surūpini” (“more beautiful than you”).

5.12. Sutta no. 495. Yamhā paṭhamatthe

After the word ‘ya’, the suffixes ‘tra’ and ‘tha’ in the sense of nominative are sometimes added, for instance, yatra hi nāma sāvakopi (the disciple), yattha etādiso satthā (such a teacher) where yatra and yattha are the same as ‘yo’. Here are some examples found in Tipiṭaka.

1) Ettha dāni Mālukyaputta, kiṃ dahare bhikkhū vakkhāma, yattra hiṃ nāma tvam bhikkhu jinno vuddho (“now, how can we say to young monks, (if) the person

---

378 Nrt-d, 24.
379 Spd., 39.
380 Ap.II, 25. (Nandātherī verse 197)
Sakena ānubhāvena, itthiṃ māpesi sobhiniṃ; Dassanīyaṃ surucirām, mamatopi surūpinīṃ.
381 S.II, 295.
like you who are old and decay requested admonition in brief”). Here, *yattra* is linked to “*tvam bhikkhu*”, and it means ‘yo’ in the nominative case.

2) *Sabbeva nikkhipissanti* *(te) bhūtā loke samussayaṃ yattha etādiso satthā, loke appaṭipuggalo, tathāgato balappato, sambuddho parinibbutoti.* (“All beings in the world surely throw away five aggregates even such a teacher who was incomparable, reached the highest power, self-enlightened entered into parinibbāna.”). In this *sutta*, *yattha* means *yo*, it gives emphasis to the word *satthā*, and it is actually not a relative sentence. In Burmese translation, *yattha* is linked with the word *loke*, so *yattha loke* means “in the world”.

In relative sentences such as “*yo puriso... tam purisam’*, “*yena purisena... tam purisam’*”, even if the *aniyāma* clauses have different cases, they are referring to the same object or person. In the example no. 2, “*yattha (yo) satthā ...te bhūtā*” is not a relative sentence because *yattha* and *te* do not refer to the same thing. Here, ‘*yo*’ refers to a teacher, whereas ‘*te*’ refers to beings, therefore *yo (yattha)* is not a relative clause but it is just an “emphasis” word.

5.13 *Sutta no. 496. Itinā niddisitabbe to*

According to this sutta, the suffix ‘*to*’ indicates a word which is connected to *iti* is always in the sense of a nominative, for instance, *attato, subhato, aniccato, dukkhato* and *anattato*. [attā+iti>attato] This *iti* can be translated as ‘as’, ‘by means of’. Many cases are shown in texts such as “*diṭṭhicaritā rūpaṃ attato upagacchanti*”\(^382\) (“one with wrong view takes material form as self”), and *aniccato vipassanti* (“they contemplate by means of impermanence”). Even though the suffix ‘*to*’ is generally known as ablative, here it acts as a philological viewpoint.\(^383\)

\(^{382}\) Ntt, 92.

\(^{383}\) *More explanations have been shown in [4.7 The Suffix ‘To’]*
5.14 Sutta no. 497. Yatehi paccattavacanassa to nidānādisu

When followed by the word *nidāna* (cause, origin), nominative case after *ya* and *ta* sometimes becomes ‘to’, for instance, *yatonidānam* (Because of this, so, therefore, on account of which), *tatonidānam*, *yatvādhikaṇaṇa*. Here, the suffix ‘to’ is not the ablative case, whereas *nidānam* is in a neutral case.

\[
[yam+nidānam] > [yatonidānam] \quad [tam+nidānam] > [tatonidānam] \quad [yam+nidānam] > yato+adhikaṇaṇa yakādhikaṇaṇa
\]

In Sanskrit, the suffix ‘as’ after the word ‘yat’ is changed to ‘o’ when added to *adhikaṇaṇa*. \[yam>yah>yā>yat+as+adhikaṇaṇa>yatoadhikaṇaṇa>yatvādhikaṇaṇa\]

According to *Nirutti-dīpanī*, these words *yatvādhikaṇaṇa*, *yatonidānam*, *tatonidānam*, *kena kāraṇena* and *tam kissahetu* are said as *hetvatham* (“in the sense of cause”). According to the book *Syntax of the Cases in the Pāḷi Nikāyas*:

The logical function of the ablative denotes that from which something results as a consequence. In general, ablative may express many different shades of the notion of causality. Sanskrit uses ablative not only in the sense of “from what side (usually the cause)” but also “on what side”. The ending –*tah* (*Pāḷi* –to) is employed as preference.

Thus, the suffix ‘to’ is used in this *sutta*.

5.15 Sutta no. 510. Pastassa sattho niccaṃ

According to this *sutta*, the whole word ‘pasta’ always becomes *sattha*. The root √*sams* ‘to praise’ together with suffix ‘ta’ is changed to *sattha*. These ‘*sattho*, *pasattho*’ are like *takko*, *vitakka* ‘initial application’ and *cāro*, *vicaro* ‘sustained application’. The difference in the pairs is with or without a prefix (*upasāra*) even though the meaning is same. Here, *sattha* is kind of *ruḷhi*. To form *pasta*, the

---

384 Nrt-d, 19.
niggahīta and ending letter ‘s’ of the root are dropped when joined with suffix ‘ta’.

\[pa+√sa+ta>pa+√sa+ta>pasta\]

Therefore in Pāli, these four words sattha, sattha, pasattha and pasattha have the sense of ‘praise’. Pasattha is equivalent to the Sanskrit word prāṣasta.\[386\] [prāṣasta>ppa-saṭṭha>pasattha]

5.16 Sutta no. 521. Itthaṅca nāme

After the word nāma, the word idaṃ in the samāsa (compound) becomes itthamaṇi; for instance, itthannāmo means evaṃnāmo (“it has such a name”). [idaṃ+nāma>itthama+nāma>itthannāma] In this sentence “itthamaṇi sudaṃ āyasmā pulinathupiyo therō imā gāthāyo abhāsittha”\[387\] (“Puṭinathupiya therō said these verses in this way”). Here, itthamaṇi is explained by iminā pakārena. In this sutta, it is said “iminā pakārena itthanti pakāratthe thaṃ paccayo”. Here, the suffix ‘thaṃ’ has the meaning of pakāra (various). It is always said as in Kaccāyana “ayaṃ pakāro itthamaṇi”\[388\]

Therefore, itthamaṇi has two meanings: 1.) “Such a name” when joined together with nāma as a samāsa; and 2.) “In this way.”

5.17 Sutta no. 522. Kvaci kvassa ko iti

The interrogative pronoun kva sometimes becomes ko, for instance, “ko te balaṃ mahārāja” (“what is your army, Great King?”). Ko nu te rathamaṇḍalaṃ (“what is chariot to be ridden?”)\[389\].

5.18 Sutta no. 523. Sossa su

The personal pronoun ‘so’ sometimes becomes ‘su’ [o>u], for instance, “mīgova jātarūpena, na tenatthamaṇi abandhi su”\[390\] (“Just like deer was not connected

\[386\] SED, 695.
\[388\] Kcc, 20.
\[390\] Ko te balanti kuhiṃ tava balakāyo. Rathamaṇḍalanti yenāsi rathena āgato, so kuhiṃti pucchanti
with gold, so also he (the foolish boatman) was not connected with the welfare (to escape from *samsāra*”). The other reading for “Na tenatthāṃ abandhi su” is “na tenatthāṃ avaḍḍhitunti” [sth. syā. 391] Its commentary explains further: “tena jātarūpena attano atthaṃ vaḍḍhetum nibbattetum na sakkoti.” (“It is not able to bring about one’s benefit with this gold.”).

5.19 Sutta no. 524. *Nossa nu amhatthe*

The personal pronoun ‘no’ in the meaning of *amhākaṃ* sometimes becomes ‘nu’(*o*>u), e.g. *api nu hanukā santā* (“our beaks indeed are tired”). Its commentary explains “*Tattha api nu hanukā santāti api no hanukā santā, api amhākaṃ hanukā kilantā*.” 392 Thus ‘no’ can be changed to ‘nu’. Here, *santa* is the past participle for *sammati*. The root is √*sam* [Skt: Śram]. This root √*sam* has the meaning of “khede ca nirodha ca” (“fatigue and cessation”). 393

5.20 Sutta no. 532. *Candassa candaro ābhāya gāthāyaṃ*

In this *sutta* in the *Suttamālā*, in the verses, the whole word ‘canda’ becomes *candara* when followed by “ābha”, e.g. “atibhonti na tassābhā, candarābhā satārakā” (“the moon with stars cannot cover the light”). *Canda* is equivalent to the Sanskrit word *candra* where the letters ‘d’ and ‘r’ exist in conjunct form. In *Pāli* language, these letters are separated to form the word *candara*. Some think the letter ‘r’ is inserted to the word *canda*. Actually *candra* and *candara* are synonyms words just like *padma* and *paduma*.

From the philological outlook, the words *candara* and *sattava* are derived from Sanskrit words *candra* and *sattva*. To avoid conjunct consonants, the vowel ‘a’ is inserted in between them. These three *Pāli* words, “*canda, candra, candara*” are

391 Sṭ. = Sri Lankan, Syā. = Thai
synonymous and mainly have the meaning of moon, shining, etc.

5.21 Sutta no. 533. Ratanassa ratenā

The whole word ratana becomes ratna in verses, e.g. nānāratne ca māṇiye (“various jewels and gems”). The Pāḷi sentence “arindamaṃ nāma narādhipassā, teneva tāṃ vuccati cakkaraṭṭanam” is seen in the commentary. Here, the letters ‘t’ and ‘n’ stand separately. There exist many conjunct consonants ‘dm’, ‘st’ and ‘sn’ in Pāḷi texts such as opupphāni ca padmāni (“flowers and lotuses”), uddhaṃte aruṇe (“when the day breaks”), viddhastā vinaḷiktā (“broken and destroyed”), asanātha khādatha (“you eat and chew”).

The Sanskrit words ratna, padma and aśnāti are equivalent to the Pāḷi words ratana (jewel), paduma (lotus) and asanāti (to eat). To avoid conjunct consonants, the vowels ‘a’, ‘i’ or ‘u’ can be inserted. The vowel ‘u’ appears by preference in the neighbor of labials, whereas ‘i’ is for palatals. 394 The svarabhakti-vowel ‘a’ is found particularly in cases like garhāti>garahati (abuse). 395

5.22 Sutta no. 545. Tumhamhākaṃ tamāyoge yassa dvittaṃ

According to this sutta, when followed by the word ‘yoga’, the words tumha and amha in samāsa (compound word) become ‘ta’ and ‘ma’ respectively and ‘y’ is doubled. [amha>ma+yoga>mayyoga] [tumha>ta+yoga>tayyoga]

In the Moggallāna vuttivivaranapaṇcikā, another possible word formation is mentioned: “Rīrīkkhakantato’ nāsminī dattarupade tumhāṃhānam te kasmī tāṃmaṃ honti yathākkamam; tandaṇā; mandanda; tāmaṃ saranā, maṃsaranā; tayyogo mayyogo-bindulopo”. 396—When followed by word except rī and rikkha, the tumha and amha become tāmaṃ and maṃ accordingly. To form tayyogo and mayyogo, the niggahīta is

394 Geiger, Pāḷi Literature and Language, 70.
395 Ibid, 78.
396 Mvv-p, 142.
elided and then ‘y’ is doubled. \([\text{amha} > \text{man} + \text{yogo} > \text{mayyogo}]\)
\([\text{tumha} > \text{tam} + \text{yogo} > \text{tayyogo}]\)

5.23 Sutta no. 546. Vantussa tulopo no nigghīṭaṃ mūlādīsu

When followed by words like “mūla” and so on, the suffix ‘tu’ of vantu in samāsa is elided and also an initial letter ‘n’ of conjunct consonants ‘nm’ become ‘m’, for instance, “bhagavaṃmūlaṃkā dhammā” (‘the Dhamma has the Blessed One as origin’), bhagavampatisaranā (‘we have the Blessed one as the refuge.’). Other possible examples are “bhagavampamukho bhikkhusaṃgho” (‘the community of monks has the Blessed one as its leadership’) and “maghavampadhāno devagāno” (‘the group of deva has Sakka as leadership.’)

\([\text{Bhagavantu} + \text{mūla} > \text{bhagavamūla} > \text{bhagavamūla} (kā)]\)

According to the Nirutti-dīpanī, Bhagavammūlakā is explained as “Bhagavā mūlāṃ yesam te” (‘those (dhammas) who has the Blessed one as origin’), and nigghīṭa is inserted between the two words Bhagavā and mūla.\(^{397}\)

\(^{397}\) Nrt-d, 27. (§390. Ta ntantānam)
Chapter VI

Study of Irregular Forms in the Nāma Kappa of Suttamālā

6.1. Vyaggha

Vyaggha has the main meaning of a tiger, whereas other possible meanings include a strong or noble person (a tiger among men), a type of castor-oil plant and a king. According to sutta no. 541. Byagghassavaggha in the Suttamālā, its viggaha is “Vividhā satte āghatetīti vaggho, evam byaggho” (“Because it kills various beings, it is called vaggha, byaggha”). Thus, the word vaggha can be changed to byaggha or vyaggha.

According to this sutta, the word aggha is formed by the prefix ‘ā’ that has the sense of extreme. To form byaggha, the long vowel ‘ā’ changed to short vowel ‘a’ because it is followed by conjunct consonants ‘ggh’, whereas the prefix-‘vi’ becomes ‘vy’ or ‘by’. [vi+ā+√gha>vy+aggha>byaggha]

According to Dhātumālā (“hanassa vadhādeso ghātādeso ca bhavati”), the root √han can become vadh (to slay, to torture) or √ghāt (to kill). The viggaha mentioned here is “vividhe satte āhanati bhuso ghātetīti byaggho. So eva ‘‘viyaggho, vaggho’’ ti ca vuccati.”—“It excessively kills various beings, thus it is called byaggha, viyaggha and vaggha”. Here, ‘y’ is inserted between the prefix ‘vi’ and the word ‘aggha’ to form viyaggha. [vi+aggha>viyaggha]. The end vowel of the prefix ‘vi’ is elided when combined with the word aggha to be vaggha. [vi+aggha>vaggha]

398 SED, 1036.
399 Sstt, 541, 689.
400 Sdnt, 11.
Therefore, the Pāḷi word for tiger could be vaggha, byaggha or viyaggha. The possible roots for vyaggha are the following:

1) √han (to kill); 2) vadh (to slay, to torture); and 3) √ghāt (to kill).

Three possible word formations are:

1) Vi+aggha>vaggha;
2) Vi+aggha>vy+aggha>vyaggha>byaggha; and
3) vi+(y)+ aggha>viyaggha.401

The Pāḷi word vyaggha is equivalent to the Sanskrit word vyāghra. To become a Pāḷi word, the conjunct consonants ‘ghr’ are assimilated to be ‘ggha’ and the long vowel ‘ā’ is shortened. This vyāghrā is formed by vy-y-√ghr.402

6.2. Daḷhadhammā/Daḷhadhammo

Daḷhadhammā means strong in anything, skilled in some art (of an archer).

[Skt: drḍha-dhanva]403 Here, dalha means (strong, heavy). The word dhammā [Skt: dhanvan] means having a bow.404 The word dhanu with the suffix ‘ā’ is changed to dhammā. Here, the vowel ‘u’ is changed to its semi-vowel ‘v’ and the conjunct consonants ‘nv’ are assimilated to ‘mm’. [dhanu+ā>dhanv+ā>dhanvā>dhammā (nv>mm)] It has a few sentence definitions (viggaha).

According to the dictionary, dalha comes from drhyati (to fasten, hold fast).405 So, its possible root is √dah (to hold). Dalha is equivalent to the Sanskrit drḍha (drīha)406. To become Pāḷi, the vowel ‘r’ becomes ‘a’ and dh becomes lh.

401 The word formations of Byaggha and viyaggha are similar to byañjana and viyañjana. 
[vi+añjana>byañjana] [vi+(y)+añjana>viyañjana]

403 PED, 315.
404 PED, 339.
405 PED, 313
406 SED, 490.
As for the word *dhanu*, its possible word formations are either 1) *dhana+u*dhanu, or 2) √*han* (to kill)+*u*dhanu (*h>*dh). Its viggaha is “*dhanati saddam karoti dhanu=cāpo.”407 (“because it makes a sound, so it is called *dhanu*”).

1) *Dalhadhammoti dalhadhanu, uttamappamāṇena dhanunā samannāgato.*
*Dhanuggahoti dhanuācariyo*408 — Dalhadhammo means dalhadhanu, one who is endowed with a best-measured bow. Dhanuggaho means the teacher of the archer.

2) *Dalham thiram dhanu etassāti dalhadhanvā, so eva ‘dalhadhammā’ti vutto*409 —“One who has strong bow is called *dalhadhanvā*, he is said as *dalhadhammā.*”

3) *Dalhadhammā dhanuggahoti dalham dhanuṃ gahetvā ṭhito issāso.*410 —“*Dalhadhammā* means dhanuggaho, the archer who stands taking a strong bow.”

4.) “*Tattha dalhadhammāti dalhadhanu. Dalhadhanu nāma dvisahassathāmam vuccati.*”411 —“Therein, *dalhadhammā* means *dalhadhānu*. Dalhadhanu is said as *dvisahassathāma.*” According to *Nidānavaggatiṅkā*, dvisahassathāmaṇi means *palānam dvisahassathāmaṇi*412, dalhadhanu refers to someone who has the strength of 2000 *palas* (about 4 ounces).

4. *Dalho dhammo dhanu assa dalhadhammā.*413 —“One who has a strong bow is called *dalhadhammā.*” Here *dhammo* is explained by *dhanu*.

According to sutta no. 396 *Nāmhi raha-dalhadhammāni* in the *Suttamālā*, because of *vibhatti ‘na’*, the ending vowel ‘a’ of *raha, dalhadhamma* etc becomes ‘i’.

407 Mgg, 23.
408 S-a.I, 10.
410 M-a.II, 40.
411 Vv-a, 24.
412 S-ṭ II, 18.
413 Mgp-ṭ, 13.
[dalhadhamma+nā>dalhadhammi+nā>dalhadhamminā] Here, dhamma comes from dhanvā [dhanu+ā], therefore its stem dhanu [Skt:dhanus] should be declined the same as rahas declension.

There are two readings, dalhadhammā and dalhadhammo. According to the Padamālā, the word dalhadhamma can have the endings ‘ā’ and ‘o’ because is not obvious (aparibyattarūpattā). Because it is very obvious (atīva paribyatto) at other places, it has the ending ‘-o’ and has two types that are guṇasadda (adjective) and paṇṇattivācakasadda (conventional name). 414

In the example “Bārāṇasiyāṃ dalhadhammo nāma rājā rajjaṃ kāresī’ti’415, (“King Daḷhadhamma governed in Bārāṇasi”), dalhadhammo is a conventional name. In the example “issatthe casmi kusalo, dalhadhammoti vissuto”416 (“I was clever at the arrow, famous as archer”), dalhadhammo word is adjective.

6.3 Krubbati/Krubanti

Sutta no. 377 Aṃvacanasso in the Nāma Kappa offers this example “tapo idha krubbasi” (“One did asceticism here”). Krubbasi is the past tense of krubbati or kubbati that is formed by the root √kar, conjugation sign-‘o’, and verbal termination-‘ti’. The root kar belongs to the tanādi group. In Dhātumālā, these four word forms that have the root kar are shown: Karoti, kayirati, kubbati, krubbati. 417 This krubbati or krubbanti form can be seen in many texts. 418

The Dhātumāla says “Kubbati, krubbati, idam tanādirūpaṃ”, 419 kubbati or krubbati belongs to the tanādi group that has the conjugation sign-‘o’. According to

414 Spd, 21.
416 J.II, 17.
417 Sdnt, 26.
419 Sdnt, 37.
Nirutti-dīpanī (“Kussa kruttaṃ”),420 ‘ku’ can be modified to kru to be krubbati. (kubbati>krubbati) According to sutta no. 177. karassa sossa kubbakurukayirā in the Moggallāna, the root √kar together with ‘o’ becomes kubba, kuru, kayira. According to the Pāḷi Literature and Language, the vowel ‘r’ can be changed to the vowels ‘a’, ‘i’ and ‘u’, and also ‘ra’ and ‘ru’, such as brhant>brahant (to be great) and bṛṇhayati>brūheti (to increase)421. Thus, √kr can be changed into kru.

In Sanskrit, ekavacana (singular) is a strong verbal termination, whereas dvivacana and bahuvacana are weak verbal terminations. The conjugation sign-‘u’ becomes ‘o’ in the strong verbal termination. The root √kr becomes kar for the strong verbal termination and kur for the weaker one. Thus, karoti is formed by √kr+u>o+ti>√kar+o+ti, whereas kubbanti is formed by √kr+u+anti>kur+u+anti>kuruanti> kurvanti>kubbanti. Here the conjunct consonants ‘rv’ are assimilated to be ‘vv’ then ‘bb’. Actually, the word kubbati is a false analogy based on kubbanti.

420 Nrt-d, 34-35.
421 Geiger, Pāḷi Literature and Language, 66-67. PED, 495.
Conclusion

This paper presents research on comparisons between the Saddanīti with the Kaccāyana and the latter’s commentary-Rūpasiddhi. The first to third chapters are on Sandhi Kappa, whereas the fourth to sixth chapters are on Nāma Kappa. Chapters one to three compare the suttas in Sandhi kappa between Saddanīti Suttamālā and Kaccāyana. Venerable Aggavaṃsa showed some special suttas that are not found in Kaccāyana, such as sutta no. 71 Animittopi vā dīghādi.

Chapters three to six compare the differences and similarities of nāma kappa between the Saddanīti Suttamālā and the Kaccāyana. There are different declensions that are only found in Suttamāla such as vattaha, raha, addha. The definitions on vibhatti, liṅga, nipāta and so on that are shown in Suttamālā, Rūpasiddhi, Niruttidīpanī, etc. are shown in these chapters. In Suttamālā, the author Aggavaṃsa discussed intensively the terms liṅga and vibhatti.

There are many phonological changes such as aspiration, metathesis and contraction in the Pāli language owing to the influence of the various dialects, etc. That is why Pāli words such as elamūgo, jalābu, vyaggha are compared with other languages such as Sanskrit and Prakrit in this paper.

By comparing the Saddanīti Suttamālā with the Kaccāyana through these six chapters in this paper, it is shown that the Saddanīti presents a more comprehensive coverage on Pāli grammar, phonological changes and word formations than the Kaccāyana and Rūpasiddhi.
For future research, more analytical study can be accomplished in terms of suttas, phonological changes and irregular word forms. For instance, Sanskrit has three moras\(^{422}\) while Pālī has only one mora and two morae only. Therefore, this difference in sound systems can also be studied.

In conclusion, this paper presents a comparative study between the Saddanīti Suttamālā and the Kaccāyana with its commentary Rūpasiddhi has been carried out to some extent. This research paper shows that the Saddanīti Suttamālā provides more detailed explanation than Kaccāyana and is more insightful as its author, Venerable Aggavaṃsa, provide his own perspectives regarding some grammatical points and word formations. He also focuses on the application of Pālī. One can conclude that Saddanīti Suttamālā is definitely an outstanding Pālī grammar book with its own merits.

Bibliography

The Pāli Texts referred here are from the Chaṭṭhasaṅgāyana CD-ROM, Version 4, by Vipassanā Research Institute – Dhammagiri, Igatpuri, India. The page number mentioned in footnote is in Myanmar version.

Primary Source

Pāli Grammar Texts


Other Pāḷi Texts


**Secondary Source**

**Books**


Pāṇinī. Aṣṭādhyāyī of Pāṇinī, Translated by Śrīśa Chandra Vasu. India, Indian Press, 1891.


**Dictionary**


**Dictionary software**

